JOURNAL OF SOCIAL AND DEVELOPMENT SCIENCES (JSDS)

Vol. 10 No. 1 ISSN 2221-1152

Published by

AMH International

Editorial

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS) is a scholarly journal deals with the disciplines of social and development sciences. JSDS publishes research work that meaningfully contributes towards theoretical bases of contemporary developments in society, business and related disciplines. The work submitted for publication consideration in JSDS should address empirical and theoretical contributions in the subjects related to scope of the journal in particular and allied theories and practices in general. Scope of JSDS includes: sociology, psychology, anthropology, economics, political science, international relations, linguistics, history, public relations, hospitality & tourism and project management. Author(s) should declare that work submitted to the journal is original, not under consideration for publication by another journal, and that all listed authors approve its submission to JSDS. It is JSDS policy to welcome submissions for consideration, which are original, and not under consideration for publication by another journal at the same time. Author (s) can submit: Research Paper, Conceptual Paper, Case Studies and Book Review. The current issue of JSDS consists of papers of scholars from Indonesia, South Africa, USA and Ghana. Political space competition between online and conventional transportation, deliberative politics on African political processes, dynamic engagement of community in local governance, analysis of the emergence and the political outcomes of two global health networks & drivers of savings account ownership status are some of the major practices and concepts examined in these studies. Journal received research submission related to all aspects of major themes and tracks. All the submitted papers were first assessed, by the editorial team for relevance and originality of the work and blindly peer-reviewed by the external reviewers depending on the subject matter of the paper. After the rigorous peer-review process, the submitted papers were selected based on originality, significance, and clarity of the purpose. Current issue will therefore be a unique offer, where scholars will be able to appreciate the latest results in their field of expertise, and to acquire additional knowledge in other relevant fields.

Prof. Nek Kamal Yeop Yunus, Ph. D.
Editor In Chief

Editorial Board

Nek Kamal Yeop Yunus, Ph. D, University Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia
N. Panchanatham, Ph. D, Annamalai University, India
Somnath Sen, Ph. D, Birmingham University, UK
Anton Miglo, Ph. D, School of business, University of Bridgeport, USA
Mamta B Chowdhury, Ph. D, University of Western Sydney, Australia
R. K. Uppal, International University of Contemporary Studies, USA
Ketna Mehta, Ph. D, Welingkar Education, India
Khorshed Chowdhury, Ph. D, University of Wollongong, Australia
Inderjeet Singh, Ph. D, Punjabi University, Patiala, India
Ananda Wickramasinghe Ph. D, CQ University, Australia
Hai-Chin YU, Ph. D, Chung Yuan University ,Chungli, Taiwan
Mohan Bhai Patel, Ph. D, N S Arts College, India
Yapa M W Y Bandara, Ph. D, Charles Sturt University, Australia
Pacha Malyadri, Ph. D, Osmania University, Andhra Pradesh, India
Chux Gervase Iwu, Ph. D, Cape Peninsula University of Technology, South Africa
Pratibha Samson Gaikwad, Ph. D, Shivaji University of Pune, India
Mohammad Reza Noruzi, Ph. D, Tarbiat Modarres University, Tehran, Iran
M Azhar Khan, Ph. D, Hokkaido University, Japan
Apostu Iulian, Ph. D, University of Bucharest, Romania
Rajendra Parsad GUNPUTH, Ph. D., University of Mauritius, Mauritius

Table of Contents

Description	Pages
Title	I
Editorial	II
Editorial Board	III
Table of Contents	IV
Papers	V
Political Space Competition between Online and Conventional Transportation in Jakarta, Indonesia Yusa Djuyandi, Arief Hidayat, Jumroh	1
Deliberative Politics on African Political Processes through Citizens' Participatory Democracy Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe	11
Understanding Dynamic Engagement of Community in Local Governance, Enhancing Grassroots Development in South Africa Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe, Cotties Toyin Adetiba	22
The Global Adolescent Girl Agenda: An Analysis of the Emergence and the Political Outcomes of Two Global Health Networks Noha Shawki	33
Drivers of Savings Account Ownership Status: A Cross-Sectional Analysis from Ghana Augustine Kwadwo Yeboah	52

PAPERS

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS)
Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2019 (ISSN 2221-1152)

Political Space Competition between Online and Conventional Transportation in Jakarta, Indonesia

Yusa Djuyandi[1], Arief Hidayat[2], Jumroh[3]
[1]Department of Political Science, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia
[2]Departement of Politics and Government, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
[3]Faculty of Administration, University of Sjakhyakirti, Palembang, Indonesia
yusa.djuyandi@unpad.ac.id

Abstract: The Presence of online transportation brings a new problem in Indonesia transportation market competition, many conventional transportation drivers, such as taxis, buses, motorcycle taxis, city transportation (Angkot) that reject the presence of online-based transportation. For conventional transportation drivers, the existence of online transportation has reduced their income because people prefer to use online transportation rather than conventional transportation. As the power holder, the government certainly has the right and authority to regulate and create policy harmonization for public transportation. This study uses qualitative method where primary data is obtained from 8 months observations, from November 2017 to June 2018. Secondary data are obtained from transportation ministerial regulations, regional regulations issued by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government, and various discourses that developed in the media mass. Various data obtained are then sorted or filtered and crosschecked against other data. Based on our findings, the government has not been arranged adequate political space, especially for conventional transportation and online transportation in Jakarta. The slow pace of the central government to revise regulations regarding online transportation has triggered serious conflicts in the community. Digital revolution in the dimensions of online transportation in the public interest is what should be an integral part of previous government policies, and that never happened.

Keywords: *Transportation, Online, Government, Policy, and Political Space.*

1. Introduction

Globalization era is an era where the world was getting close between individuals, groups or countries and make connections easily and quickly. Globalization makes freedom in opening a business so that anyone can open it in any form, anywhere. Usually, with globalization , people have owned businesses in several countries, namely by making investment and expansion markets. Freedom in opening a business began to be opened with the approval of the government and also the people welcome it with pleasure. Seeing the commitment of each country about economic growth, the government itself usually come to improve all aspects to get investment from businesses and from other governments. Today's world economy moves very dynamically, with globalization as its driving force. Slowly but surely, globalization has become a key driver for the emergence of world economic integration. Through globalization can be done an increase in investment, either directly and indirectl, encourage economic growth and employment. Paying attention to competition between increasing imperfect and competition business people, the values of fair business competition need to receive greater attention in the Indonesian economic system. Implementation of competition law is an economic instrument that is often used to make sure that competition between business people takes place in a healthy way and the results can be measured in the form of increasing public safety (Safitri, 2015).

Presence of transportation-based online application brings its own problems in the struggle for market space in the history of transportation in Indonesia. Problems that arise regarding the habits and preferences of the people who use transportation services are forced to move towards modern systems. In addition to conventional transportation, there is a problem of reduced income and less space due to changes in consumer patterns in choosing the type of transportation that will be used. Some big cities are indeed affected by changes in consumer patterns such as Jakarta, Surabaya, Medan, Yogyakarta, Semarang, Makassar, Bandung, etc. The next problem that arises is how does the concept of political space fight along with the growth of types of online transportation in big cities, especially in Jakarta. Jakarta as the National Capital of the Republic of Indonesia certainly has its own characteristics, especially in concerning the issue of public transportation and traffic jam. As a metropolitan city, the level of problem risk in Jakarta is related to traffic jam and transportation needs being a very interesting issue. For example, candidates for regional heads who are

contesting in Jakarta, in addition to other crucial issues such as floods, fires, poverty, urbanization, garbage, etc.

The results of INRIX's research or analysis of traffic jam data from Washington, United States, released in 2017, explained that in 2016 car drivers in Jakarta spent 55 hours a year due to traffic jams. The data puts Jakarta at number 22 in the world's busiest city. The survey results also show that Jakarta traffic jam is "only" better than Bangkok, Thailand, which ranks first as the busiest city in Southeast Asia with a total time of 64.1 hours a year. DKI Jakarta is a business centre and government centre with a population in 2014 reaching 10.08 million people and a population density of 15,234 people per km2, surrounded by growing residential areas of Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi (Bodetabek). From the results of the surreal Jabodetabek commuter in 2014 showed that the number of Jabodetabek commuters was 3,566,178 people, consisting of 2,429,751 people doing work activities, schools and courses in DKI Jakarta, 1,067,762 people in Bodetabek and 68,665 people outside Bodetabek. While the commuter Bodetabek which carried out activities in DKI Jakarta was 1,382,296 people. This condition shows that massive transportation is an urgent need because the development of a good transportation sector will contribute significantly to developments in other sectors such as trade, industry, finance and services.Specific issues regarding transportation issues are also important, considering that transport service users have increased from year to year.

Management fair and decent concept of space is certainly a top priority compared to the others. That is why it seems the political space provided by the Provincial Government of Jakarta has become a very important aspect, in order to give an idea not only for practical spatial planning but also to be held in a policy. A good pattern of political space management will provide certainty about the designation and also clearer benefits for the community in general, business people and the government itself. The failure of the government in responding to the emergence of the issue of space politics can be seen with the horizontal conflicts in the fight of Gojek and Blue Bird's online market transport in Jakarta. As one of the business entities in the transportation sector, certainly strict and easy controls are needed. All of that was present because of the decisions in the country. But in this case, the state seemed to stutter and let the problems exploded and triggered wider conflicts. The government's failure to provide clear definitions and giddy government positions made the conflict more open. Indeed, it is not easy to manage the types of transportation in big cities like Jakarta. Although what needs to be looked at is how the government organizes political space through its policy instruments, and how does the instrument effectively work at the birth of the digital revolution era which causes disruption of technology?

Disruption of information technology has brought extraordinary changes. Things have emerged as the antithesis of conventional products and procedures of life. Indeed, there are many conveniences as well as benefits from the disruption of this technology. The impact of disruption is one of them is the emergence of online-based transportation or using applications. This type of transportation seems to deconstruct the concept of space (the term of public transportation is a route). Online transportation does not know the route and walks just like that according to consumer needs. Related to regarding regulation and also socio-political issues then encouraged the government to reaffirm the division of space through its authority. As the holder of power over space and policy, the government certainly has the right and authority to regulate and even force, so that it can create order and harmonization specifically related to public transport in Jakarta. The question that was tried to answer from this condition was:

- How does the government organize political space especially for conventional transportation and online transportation in Jakarta?
- To what extent is political space policy initiated and enforced by the government for online and conventional transport?

2. Literature Review

A. Public Space and Political Space: Space is a place where everyone conducts activities, individual and social activities. Space is very important for people's lives because of social, economic and political interactions. Space becomes one of the expensive commodities because the amount of space is limited and people want to get it more and more. The struggle for space is increasingly evident especially that space is a place where many people depend on their lives. Public space is often a struggle by many parties, by being able

to get power over public space a person will get a large and dominant influence. In the context of political space, there are many things that must be fulfilled, especially related to the implementation and position of the government in providing certainty in the form of policy. The concept of political space itself is actually in contact with public space, which makes the public a top of priority in building relationships and networking within community entities (Huning, 2008).

The concept of political space is transformed into a more specific definition, namely space that is "public" and space that is "private"(Low & Smith, 2006). In this concept of space since the days of ancient Greece (8-9 BC), where it was mentioned about the origin of a democratic state, there is the term "Oikos" which means house. The definition of reduction means a group of people who own a house. Form a unit and fulfil daily needs. People who join the Oikos will accept the consequences tied to the social rules that are formed. While the second, community groups that do not have property (Theses). Theses have an existence as a free person (Wibowo, 2010). The distinction has provided an illustration of the existence of "public" space and "private" space, and of course, in providing such definitions, it is still necessary to intervene with authority from the state. This concept will open an affirmation of the authority of the government in managing public spaces in defining the public interest. The existence of human which requires ease and hedonism (seeking pleasure and ease) also causes rational selection of various problems. Similar opinion was also conveyed by Thomas Hobbes who stated that humans are war creatures, which means that human beings always compete both healthily and not to get something they want, whether in the form of material or power.

From a clear separation of the private and the public, at least there are different approaches in the management of space as political entities rather than sociologically, because sociological entities lead to the dynamic aspects of human interaction in society as social beings, whereas political aspects are based more on the desire to master and conquer. In the concept of political space,all (practices) of modern countries divide their territory into complex and overlapping political and economic zones, reorganize the population and resources in units, and make the rules of how and by whom the area can be utilized space (Vandergeest & Peluso, 1995). Therefore, the state pursues a territorial strategy as an effort to control the lives of the population through surveys and land registration, map making, establishment and supervision of forest areas and other natural resources. The strategy itself places a modern cartography technique as the main instrument of how the regulation and restrictions are carried out. If we connect between the concept of spatial planning and transportation problems in Jakarta, it will be very clear that government policy is still based on geographic political data which generally overlaps, as is the case with regulations regarding private forest management rights that clash with tradition/customary forests.

In addition, there are also opinions from Lefebvre where his views place space as a social product (Lefebvre, 1991). An understanding of this kind of space is indeed quite different, or totally different, compared to the old understanding of space. If in conventional understanding, space is always considered and imagined as an independent or self-contained material reality (space in itself). On the contrary, according to Lefebvre, space production is always tied to the social reality that surrounds it. Space has never been able to hold "itself" or manifest naturally. This understanding of the production of space does not have consequences; in other words, that space is "political," often as a means of thinking and acting. Space is able to direct people to think and act in their daily lives because it is meant to control and dominate. Space is not a sterile and neutral "box", but on the contrary, always something that is not simple and is always closely related to the issue of "power." Then, political space is a sign that will tell about a person's status hierarchy. Where, someone who can master space will get a lot of resources, such as economic and social resources Lefebvre, (1991) emphasized that various differences in the phenomenon of upper-class struggle in space are related to an area, region, site, land, etc.

This must be understood as part of the same spatial process. Basically, the spatial process is a combination of three elements. First, spatial practices related to individual routines for the systematic creation of zones and regions. Spatial planning practices over time are manifested in structured environments and landscapes. The most significant spatial practices in urban areas are related to the development of the property sector and other forms of operational capital. Second, having a representation of space, forms of knowledge, and practices that regulate and represent space, especially through planning techniques and the involvement of the state (government) third having collective space experience. This is related to the space of representation

experienced by everyone. In this context, the market builds a system for the creation and accumulation of profits. Starting from Lefebvre's perspective, the real space has many types, but in this case the space is more focused on space that has many resources and economic potential.

B. Market: According to Stanton (2000: 92), markets are people who have the desire to be satisfied, money to shop and the willingness to spend it. From the definition above there are 3 important elements in the market, namely people with all their desires, their purchasing power and willingness to spend it. Market or consumers can be divided into two groups; the final consumer (consumer markets) and business markets (industrial market). Where a consumer market is a group of buyers, who buy goods for consumption rather than for further processing while the business market is a market consisting of individuals or organizations that buy goods to be processed again into other goods and then sold. Market is a place where there an interaction between sellers and buyers are both aimed at meeting their interests. In this case, the seller will get money and the buyer will adapt the desired goods or services. In the context of market policy, it is interpreted as an inseparable part besides the government and the public.

The market dimension becomes an entity that grows as separate from the government that is engagement between consumers and producers or providers of goods and services. Market concept is often known as the theory of demand theory describes the nature of the buyer in demand for an item, while the supply theory explains the nature of the seller in the supply of an item. Demand theory that explains the nature of the relationship between the amount of demand for goods and the price known as the law of demand. Where the higher the price of an item, the less the amount of goods to be requested and vice versa the lower the price of an item, the more quantity of goods requested. Bidding theory explains the nature of the relationship between the amount of goods offered and the price known as the law of supply, where the higher the price of an item, the better offered by the seller, and conversely the lower the price of an item, the fewer items offered. By connecting the buyer's request and the seller's offer, the market price and the amount of goods sold can be determined. Therefore, what happens in the market is an interaction that is not bound by policy values, because it is formed from the existence and supply or laws of demand and supply in the economy. The availability of online cases and conventional transportation is inseparable from the dynamics of the market formed between consumers who need transportation facilities that are easy, comfortable, and affordable.

On the one hand, Gojek application providers who are supposed to be able to fulfil the requested market in the competition between online and conventional transportation is a place where people need transportation services such as stations, terminals, airports, markets, and crowded places. In the market concept between conventional online transportation and transportation compete with each other to get consumers. In the economic world, it is also known as marketing concepts. According to Stanton (2000: 92), marketing is the whole system of business activities aimed at planning, pricing, promoting and distributing goods and services that can satisfy the needs of buyers and potential buyers. The core marketing concepts include needs, desires, demand, production, utility, value and satisfaction; exchange, market, marketing and market transactions and relationships. We can distinguish between needs, wants and requests. The need is felt the absence of a state certain basic satisfaction. Desire is a strong factor for the satisfaction that is specific to the needs of more profound needs. Meanwhile, demand is the desire for a specific product that is supported by the ability to buy it. Online public transportation and conventional public transportation compete to get as many consumers as possible by using marketing concepts, especially those related to price, service, and convenience. Consumer satisfaction is the most important. So, in every business activity, there is a principle that is “the customer is a king”.

C. Policy: According to Carl Friedrich (in Indiahono, 2009: 18) policy is a direction that is followed by someone, group or government in a particular environment that provides some obstacles and opportunities for policies proposed to use and overcome in order to achieve a goal or realize a goal or a certain purpose. On the other hand, Anderson cited from (Winarno 2012: 201) policies have implications including: First, the focus of attention in public policy is oriented to purpose, not to haphazard behavior. Extensively public policy in the modern political system is not something that just happens but is planned by someone involved in the political system. Second, public policy is a direction for patterns or actions by government official is not a separate decision. A policy does not only include a decision to define laws regarding a matter but also the decisions and implementation. Third, the policy is about the government actually does in regulating trade,

controlling inflation or promoting public housing, it does not for what the government wants. Fourth, public policy may be in the form of positive and negative.

Positively, policies may include clear forms of government action to influence a particular problem. Carl J. Federick as quoted by Agustino (2008: 7) defines policy as a series of actions or activities that suggested by a person, group, or government in a particular environment; there are obstacles (difficulties) and opportunities for implementing policy proposals in order to achieve the certain goals. This opinion shows that policy ideas involve behaviors that have an intention and purpose; this intention and purpose are an important part of the policy definition. However, policies must show what is actually done rather than what is proposed in some activities on a problem. The term policy itself was still a difference of opinion and was debated by experts (Wahab 2008: 40). Therefore, to understand the term policy (Wahab, 2008: 40-50) provides several guidelines as follows:

a. Policies must be distinguished from decisions;
b. Policies actually cannot be distinguished from administration;
c. Policies include behavior and expectations;
d. Policies include the presence or absence of action;
e. Policies usually have the final results to be achieved;
f. Each policy has a specific goal, either explicitly or implicitly;
g. Policy arises from a process that takes place over time;
h. Policies include inter-organizational relationships and intra-organizational ones;
i. Public policy, although not exclusive, concerns the key role of government institutions; and
j. The policy is formulated or defined subjectively.

3. Method

This study uses the qualitative method, because of using this method the research is able to see deeper the phenomena of space political competition between online and conventional transportation in DKI Jakarta. During the research process, the data obtained into to categorizes primary and secondary data. Primary data obtained for eight months observations, from November 2017 to June 2018. In addition, this study also obtained some secondary data, such as transportation ministerial regulations, regional regulations issued by the DKI Jakarta provincial government, and various discourses that developed in the media mass. Various data obtained are then sorted or filtered and crosschecked against other data. The purpose of conducting screening and crosschecking data is to create objectivity. Crosscheck data is a part of the data triangulation process, where appropriate or conflicting data is then carefully viewed and analyzed.

4. Discussion

Gojek is a start-up company it has just appeared in Indonesia. Gojek's company development is very significant, where the drivers have reached tens of thousands of drivers, and they made their own community. The emergence of Gojek is the answer to the badness of transportation services in Indonesia. It is the service transportation preferred by a citizen, because the cost is cheaper, the service and comfort are more satisfying. Especially this company has an online application; it makes the drivers can pick up the customer directly. Gojek also has many features and services such as sending goods (GO-SEND), Motorbike Transportation (GO-RIDE), Ordering food (GO-FOOD), Shopping (GO-MART), Large goods (GO-BOX), cleaning houses (GO-CLEAN), Beauty (GO-GLAM), Massage or reflection (GO MASSAGE), Transjakarta Schedule, delivery from the nearest stop or to the nearest stop (GO-BUSWAY), Book a ticket (GO-TIX), Car Transport (GO -CAR), Mechanics (GO-AUTO), Health Medicines (GO-MED), Credit (GO-PULSA), Goods Shopping (GO-SHOP), and Blue Bird Taxi (GO-BLUEBIRD).

A. The Arrangement of Online and Conventional Public Transportation in Jakarta: In December 2015, Ignasius Jonan as the Minister of Transportation released an operational ban on motorized vehicles not for public transportation based on online applications, because these companies were not eligible the regulations on public transport. The prohibition is in the notification letter Number UM.3012 / 1/21 / Phb / 2015 signed by the Minister of Transportation on November 9, 2015. It did not last until 24 hours the ban was revoked

after an intervention from President Joko Widodo. Only a few months later, exactly on March 22, 2016, a number of conventional taxi drivers marched on the streets in Jakarta to demand the prohibition of operating public-based online transportation. Even worse, there is a dispute between conventional taxi drivers and online-based transportation drivers. Based on the existing rules, online transportation was not eligible for the provisions as transportation, as stipulated in Law Number 22 of 2009 concerning Road Traffic and Transportation. The other rules exist in Government Regulation Number 74 of 2014 concerning Road Transportation. Although it was not in accordance with regulations, the phenomenon of online transportation continues to flourish in urban areas.

The dynamics and inexperience of the government in understanding the changing patterns of using public transportation in Jakarta, based on the government's interference about the regulations, do not provide a solution but instead, the government includes being a part of the problem. The Ministry of transportation considers that online transportation in regulation was not eligible with the requirements, but in the policy of the President as the highest executive power in the government acts otherwise. The socio-political impact that arises in this confusing area, at least the community understands that: First, the government is not ready for the changes that occur. Second, society wants comfortable, cheap and safe transportation. Third, technology disruption through online applications can bring new patterns in the habit of using public transportation. Fourth, the potential for conflicts that occur in the community due to government uncertainty the online application that has just emerged, is becoming a new competitor in the field of transportation, of course, it has a surprising effect on businessmen and conventional drivers. The government has actually seen this shift, but it is still uncertain given that public transportation still refers to old regulations and has not been modified or adapted to more modern needs.

Figure 1: Successful Startup infoGraphics in Indonesia 2016, Communication and Information Version

Source: Communication and Information, 2016.

By looking, at this current development, especially with the contextualization of Jakarta as the capital city of the country capable of having a wide impact on other regions the emergence of online transportation initiated by Gojek as the first online transportation is the most creative breakthrough in the 2016 communication and communication version in the field of startup (Figure 1). In addition, there are changes that occur because consumers who prefer practicality, besides that, this is also the effect of information technology disruptions that are increasingly massive and unavoidable. In addition to the benefits in the hands of consumers, as a first step, Gojek is able to provide new jobs with more than 12 thousand partnership vacancies in just 4 years.

Figure 2: Info Graphics of Online Motorcycle Taxis vs. Conventional Motorcycle Taxis

Source: www.Poligrabs.co

Talking about modern life at this time, transportation services are a tool that is needed by society in generals. Community needs for transportation services, encourage many companies to open transportation businesses. Transportation services are increasingly innovating, especially since the development of technology, where online-based transportation has begun to be in great demand by the public. The development of online-based transportation makes them always have to serve consumers wherever they are, so online transportation often operates in places where many people need it. The development of online transportation that is increasingly rapid and much in demand by the public makes transportation that is not based online or conventional to feel marginalized, resulting in problems between online and conventional transportation. Space struggles in the analysis of problems regarding online and conventional transportation between Gocar taxis and Bluebird taxis, for example, where they are trying to get the most strategic space, especially space where people need transportation services such as terminals, stations airports and so on. The politics of space that occur in Jakarta is very clear the motive is to get the potential of economic resources. The existence of online transportation is increasingly being regarded as a serious threat by conventional transportation service providers.

This caused a prolonged conflict between the two parties, both initially only a mouth-to-mouth argument, so as to use violence. This is what makes the government have to intervene by giving regulations regarding the existence of online transportation. Given the government's failure to respond to online transportation during Ignasius Jonan's time, the government learned to understand and try to adjust needs regarding the rules of online transportation. Then technical regulations are adjusted to answer this challenge. At least there are several important points outlined by the government as a middle way so that the existence of online transportation is able to continue to exist because it has become part of the public interest. To overcome this online transportation chaos, the government has adopted a policy to issue Ministerial Regulation (MR) No. 108 of 2017 concerning the Implementation of Public Transportation with Public Motor Vehicles Not on Route. This Minister of Transportation Regulation is a substitute for MR Number 26 of 2017. The Minister of Transportation Regulation Number 108 will be active on November 1, 2017, as an answer to anxiety between online transportation and conventional transportation. Here are nine new rules in the Minister of Transportation Regulation No. 108/2017:

- Taxi taximeter: the amount of tariff according to what is stated on the meter.
- Tariff: tariff determination is based on the agreement of service users and transportation service providers. The guideline is the upper and lower tariffs set by the Director General of Land Transportation at the proposal of the Head of BPTJ or the Governor in accordance with his authority.

- Area of operation: operates in the area of operation that has been determined by the Director General of Land Transportation or the Head of BPTJ or Governor.
- Quota: the quota for vehicle needs is determined by the Director General of Land Transportation or the Head of BPTJ or Governor.
- Number of vehicles: a minimum of five vehicles. For individuals who have less than five vehicles, they can gather in legal entities in the form of cooperatives that already have permission to operate online taxis.
- Proof of motor vehicle ownership: BPKB (Motor Vehicle Ownership Proof) or STNK (Vehicle Number Certificate) on behalf of legal entities / on behalf of individual legal entities in the form of cooperatives.
- Domicile of motorized vehicle number (TNKB): online taxi using TNKB according to the designated operating area.
- Type Test Registration Certificate (TTRC): requirements for permit applications for new motorized vehicles must attach a copy of the TTRC of a motorized vehicle.
- Role of applicator: application companies in the field of transportation are prohibited from acting as organizers of public transport.

The issuance of this regulation is expected to provide certainty about the government's position regarding online transportation. Indeed, this regulation has long been issued as a solution, but the government's delay in issuing it has caused a prolonged conflict. Besides that, seeing from the authority they have, it turns out that the arrangement regarding public vehicles is not owned by the provincial government. The DKI Jakarta Provincial Government is only authorized to issue policies on routes, the number of tariffs, the number of transportations, the type of transportation, and does not have the issuance of authorization permits relating to the type of transportation and other permits. So, if indeed there is chaos regarding online transportation that occurs in various regions, fully it is indeed the responsibility of the central government. This policy is actually awaited as a quick response. In addition, the government is also needed to be able to provide mediation regarding conflicts that occur.

For example, the government must dare to take a clear line so that the conflicting parties reach a level of compromise because if the conflict extends not only entrepreneurs will be in trouble, but also the wider community. The government has not been able to resist the presence of information technology disruptions because it has become a daily necessity of the community. What needs to be done by the government is to provide facilitation and clarity of standing position on this issue. That means, in the use of online applications in public transport vehicles it cannot be avoided as a consequence of the presence of a digital revolution in public space. In addition, the government must also realize that although existing regulations are inadequate, the market as a separate entity will form its own ecosystem through the legal chain of supply and demand. This is inevitable given the market mechanism as separated from the state. The state is only present to provide protection for protected areas of public interest, related to risks if in the future there are parties who violate their rights and feel disadvantaged. The presence of a market mechanism proved effective even though previously the government had not issued a revised regulation of the Minister of Transportation Regulation No. 108 of 2017 concerning the Implementation of People Transportation with General Motor Vehicles Not on the Route.

B. Political Policy of Online and Conventional Space in Jakarta: In the context of space politics, the DKI Jakarta government has actually rolled out technical rules regarding routes and specifications of the types of transportation that pass certain routes. If we return to the concept of space presented by Vandergeest & Peluso (1995) the context is segmentation and mapping of space and region based on geographical elements. In fact, the government cannot reach this spatial planning source for transportation. Spatial planning is not intended for the dimensions of public transport, but only for land use areas. According to this condition, the concept of space has diminished considerably, even though in a fight over spatial, each area or space within the government is then filled with community activities. The government's duty is to ensure that aspects of the public space do not overlap interests and also provide certainty for the government's standing position.

If the government reduces the role of political space, of course, this concept is very far away from fact. It seems that the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government is also experiencing the same thing. The complexity of the problems associated with this space does not reach the place and how spatial planning for transportation in particular. The DKI Jakarta government only focuses on transportation modes and tariffs but does not mention at all the fair distribution of space. Although the concept of spatial planning is unavoidable if the economic activities of citizens run even though the qibla is an invisible hand through the law of demand and supply in the economic field, the political impact of weak spatial planning makes transport war between providers as difficult to prevent. The market cannot be separated from government interference.

5. Conclusion

From the description described earlier, several conclusions can be drawn including:

A. in the event that the government regulates the politics of space, especially for conventional transportation and transportation online in Jakarta, has not yet been completed. The existing spatial aspects are reduced in the context of land use mapping and do not touch on the transportation aspect. Although the real dimensions of the relationships contained in public transport activities are important elements in the spatial aspect. In addition, the DKI Jakarta government authorities do not have the authority to regulate transportation problems because the authority is in the central government through the Ministry of Transportation.

B. The political policy of space initiated and implemented by the government for online and conventional transportation does not fully accommodate the interests of the community. The slow pace of the central government to revise regulations regarding online transportation has triggered serious conflicts in the community. In addition, the government has not fully realized that the public enjoys information technology disruption which has led to the ease of use of online transportation facilities. In addition, it is inevitable that people will switch to online transportation because they enjoy the benefits that are also different from conventional transportation and also the modes of transportation provided by the government. Digital revolution in the dimension of online transfortasi for the public interest is what should be an integral part of previous government policies, and that never happened.

Suggestions: From the conclusions, there are at least a number of suggestions that can be proposed for increasing online transportation arrangements in Jakarta in particular, with the following details:

A. The dynamics of online transportation is a must so that the government must be more open in this matter. DKI Jakarta as a Provincial Government or other regional government needs to be given more authority in regulating transportation and contributing to the political aspects of space to be clearer and more transparent.

B. The era of information technology disruption makes everything easy, inexpensive, comfortable and transparent. Economically, consumers get maximum satisfaction. However, from a political point of view, the market struggle carried out by giant transportation businessmen will become unhealthy, because it involves management so far or the concession rights they receive from the government are disrupted by those who have just entered the ecosystem with different concepts. The main step is that the government mediates and seeks a compromise so that all parties feel accommodated.

References

Agustino, L. (2008). Dasar- dasar Kebijakan Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Huning, S. (2008). Political Activity in Public Spaces: Awakening, Stagnation, or Fall? In M. Nowak, & M. Nowosielski, Declining Cities/Developing Cities: Polish and German Perspectives (pp. 190-201). Poznan: Instytut Zachodni.

Hutapea, E. (2017, September 6). Kompas.com.

Indiahono, D. (2009). Kebijakan Publik Berbasis Dinamic Analysis. Yogyakarta: Davamedia.

Lefebvre, H. (1991). The Production of Space. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, Ltd.

Low, S. M. & Smith, N. (2006). The Politics of Public Space. New York: Routledge.

Safitri, M. (2015). Tinjauan Hukum Persaingan Usaha Terhadap Konflik Antara Taksi Konvensional dan Taksi Online. *Jurnal Keadilan Progresif*, 6(2), 138-148.

Stanton, W. J. (2000). Prinsip Pemasaran. (Y. Lamarto, Trans.) Jakarta: Erlangga.

Vandergeest, P. & Peluso, N. L. (1995). Territorialization and state power in Thailand. *Theory and Society*, 24(3), 385-426.

Wahab, S. A. (2008). Analisis Kebijaksanaan; Dari Formulasi ke Implemen tasi Kebijaksanaan Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.

Wibowo, A. S. (2010). Kepublikan dan Keprivatan dalam Polis Yunani Kuno. In F. B. Hardiman, Ruang Publik: Melacak Partisipasi Demokratis dari Polis Sampai Cyberspace (p. 27). Yogyakarta: Kanisius.

Winarno, B. (2012). Kebijakan Publik (Teori, Proses dan Studi Kasus). Yogyakarta: Buku Seru.

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS)
Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2019 (ISSN 2221-1152)

Deliberative Politics on African Political Processes through Citizens' Participatory Democracy

Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe
Department of Public Administration, University of Zululand KwaDlangezwa, South Africa
andyransey@gmail.com

Abstract: This article explores the present crisis of democratic governance or administration in Africa and examines the elective capability of deliberative majority rules system of democracy, in which the desire of the general public is educated by mindful, engaged citizen's commitment and conversation. There are various questions needing answers; are the various and spellbound citizenry even equipped for consultation? How likely is amass thought of deliberation to achieve a very much contemplated choice? Wouldn't it gather consultation reproduce a similar power lopsided characteristics blocking different sorts of talk? Deliberative models are displayed in principle and practical discourse, with contextual investigations including the furious populism of the Brexit vote, the ascent of deliberative components. What the contributing creators do share is the acknowledgement that the authenticity of appointive portrayal or representatives endures when individuals in the majority rule system of governments end up frustrated, disillusioned, and repelled. This study gives challenging and convincing thoughts regarding how to re-establish confidence in popular democratic governments by making them stronger and responsive. This study adopted a qualitative method of analysis.

Keywords: *Deliberative; consultation; direct participation; commitment; societal imbalances, politics*

1. Introduction

Democracy in Africa can be said to be under siege and politics has become a dirty game, for this conceived thoughts, therefore, a lot of people tend to have virtual deliberation on politics and burning political issues, rather than participating in actual politics that is why many people believe that democracy is one of the worst things that had happened in the continent of Africa. Since those who deliberate on politic fail to participate actively. The famous Stalin once said 'those who vote decide nothing,' but those who conduct elections are the ones who decide everything because they are players. The beautiful game of politics is however shamefully played with dirty hands. Quite frankly one may be curious to conclude that democracy is a misfit for Africa. Maybe Africa is yet to be mature for democracy to strive well. Looking back to history and as a common knowledge Africa old ways of life during culture practice with values a communal system of living with a monarchical system. It was mostly practiced and still being practiced in Africa particularly in the western part of Africa which include Nigeria and Ghana, with the existence of the Oba (king)–apparently there were the Oba (more like an emperor), the village kings, chiefs, the warrant chiefs, village heads, community leaders, heads of household, youth leaders and group leaders within each community. This was regarded as an indirect rule system long before Lord Lugard allegedly introduced it in Nigeria (who became the father of indirect rule system). The chain of political leadership had existed long before the European contact with Africa, particularly in the ancient city of Benin (Nigeria) the cradle of black civilization, history records that the then Oba had developed and practice indirect rule system through the kings and chiefs.

However, critics of deliberative politics argue that in light of the fact that societal imbalances can't be sectioned in deliberative settings the deliberative procedure unavoidably propagates these disparities (Rowe and Frewer 2005). Therefore, they contend, consideration does not fill its conjectured needs, yet rather delivers misshaped discourse dictated by disparities, not merits. Promoters of deliberation must face these reactions, like do less-special, less-taught, or maybe unskilled members stand a possibility in exchanges with the more favored, better instructed, and articulate. Could their contentions ever be seen or weighed similarly? Deliberative democracy system is primarily about subjects or citizens being given satisfactory time, information and support to ponder the issues, and direct impact over organization arrangements and projects. The commitment is tied in with putting citizens closer to the issues of government. Deliberative vote based system of democracy is not the same as representative government since it puts discussions, different viewpoints and comprehension at the focal point of the choice instead of depending on surveying and casting of the vote through elections. It underlines information handling as much as sharing information and urges individuals to fundamentally test weigh up and think about the scope of viewpoints, information sources and

proof. It is an elective way to deal with 'asking individuals what they think when they're not considering', which inspires clueless reactions. Rather, deliberative methodologies look to evoke educated, quality, important results.

However, the new shape that has been by a long shot the best is deliberative majority rule system of government. According to Dryzek (2007), deliberative majority rule system of government presently comprises the most dynamic area of political hypothesis completely -not simply a democratic theory. Amazingly, vast developing writing, both hypothetical and experimental, on deliberative system of participatory democracy, has its impact spread far outside colleges. In the 1960s protectors of a participatory origination of vote based system of democracy, had a politically dynamic citizenry at its disposal, who criticized defenders of a realistic democracy hypothesis. In light of discoveries from the exact reviews demonstrating that most people were politically latent and needed enthusiasm for information regarding governmental issues, deliberations of thoughts regarding subjects' support ought to be modified as needs be. Subject lack of care was viewed as practical for the equitable framework (Goodhart et al., 2011). Around 1980s the consideration and attention of most political scholars turned in different ways, the enthusiasm for the majority rule system of democracy hypothesis wound down and, specifically, participatory, equitable hypothesis ended up unfashionable.

Since theories of democracy appreciate such an incredible restoration, an undeniable inquiry is to whether there is still a place for the participatory hypothesis, or is it now antiquated and outmoded? On its essence, we appear to be in a great time for participatory majority rule system of government - democracy. Deliberative vote based system of democracy is a type of subject support, and over the previous decade enthusiasm for participatory administration has grown tremendously (Goodhart et al., 2011). Sometime in the 1980s participation in political issues started to end up some portion as standard advancement practice. In the year 1996, the World Bank distributed a Participation Sourcebook (World Bank, 1996). Perhaps most strikingly, models of participatory planning have been spreading the world over from its cause in Brazil. Or on the other hand, at any rate, measures called participatory planning have been multiplying. Give me a chance to state now just that the expression "investment" is utilized to cover an extensive variety of different activities (Rowe and Frewer 2005). In 2007, the World Bank issued a Report on Participatory Budgeting (Shah 2007). The contemporary help for participation by governments, official bodies, and NGOs is in striking difference to support during the 1960s, which was advocated by prevalent developments in rich nations.

In various Western nations, an assortment of grassroots political developments were effectively requesting more participation and more noteworthy majority rules system of democracy; this was the season of Rudi Dutschke's well-known necessitate 'the long walk through the organizations.' The current design for deliberative majority rules system of democracy started as a political hypothesis-driven activity, as in it was deliberative vote based proposition that rose first during the 1990s and was trailed by observational investigations. It further became the structure of exceptional deliberative gatherings, generally where a deliberative democrat indicated little enthusiasm for the most recent thirty years of participating advancement. Much of the experimental examination centred on the procedure of consideration among members in the new deliberative bodies. In addition, in so far as deliberative democrats appreciate models of participatory majority rule system of government, they normally regard them as precedents of deliberative vote based system of democracy. Despite Dennis Thompson's conviction that the move in the direction of deliberative hypothesis has not dislodged participatory theory, (Thompson, 2008, 512), the pervasive view, though not constantly made express, is by all accounts that deliberative vote based system of democracy has now surpassed and subsumed its forerunner.

Deliberative majority rules system of democracy has, for instance, been viewed as 'participatory democracy regeneration (Fung and Wright 2003, 40), and the case made that 'deliberative democrats have a tendency to be participatory democrats, too (Goodin, 2008, 266). Participatory majority rules system of democracy is rather unique in relation to deliberative vote based system of democracy. Pondering, exchange, and discussion is vital to any type of majority rules system of government, including participatory system of democracy. Yet on the off chance that consultation is fundamental for vote based system of government is not adequate. To some degree of the more eager champions of deliberative majority rules system tend to exhibit pondering as though it were synonymous with vote based system democracy itself. The speed and excitement

with which deliberative vote based system democracy has been taken up so generally is, in itself, rather exceptional. Mutz (2008), remarked that the "measure of time and cash put resources into it by governments, establishments, and national gatherings are stunning with respect to for all intents and purposes some other current sociology theory (Mutz, 2008, 535). The question now is what are such a significant number of individuals so eager about?

2. Review: Conceptualization of Deliberative Democracy

Vote based system of democracy is a subject that crosses the limits in political theory, and in my own field of political hypothesis, there has been a noteworthy restoration of democratic hypothesis or theories. In a political hypothesis, there are arguments that 'vote based system of democracy' is typically presently qualified by one of a variety of descriptive words, which incorporate cosmopolitan, agonistic, republican, and monitory. The literature in deliberative politics with various arguments and precedents makes the significance of deliberative vote based system of democracy difficult to bind. In this study, the motivations are sufficient to feature the focal case of deliberative equitable scholars; that people ought to dependably be set up to defend their moral and political arguments with substantial reasons, and be set up to think and deliberate with others on the reasons they give. There is currently a broad hypothetical discussion about what appropriately considers as 'deliberative,' quite a bit of which has been carried out at a genuinely unique level. Significantly, this discourse is the empirical side of deliberative vote based system of democracy. Democracy system of government is under attack, according to James and Mansbridge (2017), the measure of perceived democratic nations on the planet is never again extending after the purported Third Wave of law based transitions (Samuel, 1991).

Indeed, there is something of a "vote based recession (Larry, 2015). Some obviously democratic nations with focused elections are undermining components of liberal majority rules system of democracy: the rights and freedoms that guarantee opportunity of thought and articulation, security of the standard of law, and the assurances for the substructure of common society that might be as imperative for making vote based system democracy fill in as the constituent procedure itself (Steven and Lucan, 2010). The model of gathering rivalry based vote based system of democracy–the vital model of vote based system in the cutting edge era, which appears to be under risk. However, what may be designated as 'meritocratic tyranny,' that is a model in which administrations with defective just procedures, that give good governance, is drawing in consideration and some support. Singapore is the main effective surviving precedent, although some recommend China as another country moving toward this path. Open discontent makes assist challenges for the focused model. A vote based systems of democracy around the globe battle with the clear bay between political elites who are broadly questioned and prepared subjects who fuel populism with the vivacity of furious voices. Baffled residents betraying elites have delivered unforeseen results of elections, including the Brexit choice and the 2016 U.S. presidential elections.

James and Mansbridge (2017) stated that contending groups' intention is to win, are keen on advising voters just when it is further bolstering their advantage. The method of reasoning for aggressive majority rule system of government, the most compelling model created by the late financial analyst Joseph Schumpeter, held that similar procedures of promoting utilized in the business circle to inspire individuals to purchase items can be normal in the political circle. On this view, we ought not to expect an "honest to goodness" open will, but instead "a made will" that is only a side-effect of political competition (Joseph, 1942). However, the perfect idea of vote based system of democracy as the standard of "the general population" is profoundly undermined when the desire of the general population is in extensive part fabricated. The authenticity of the majority rule system of government relies upon some genuine connection between general society will and people in general strategies and elected office-holders. Nevertheless, some have reprimanded this "society hypothesis of popular government" as observationally gullible it's extremely status as a people hypothesis reflects how across the board this regulating desire is in actual fact (Christopher and Larry, 2015). To the degree that elected leaders produce the will of the people, the regularizing causal bolt goes off course. On the off chance that present majority rules systems of democracy can't deliver significant procedures of people's will arrangement.

The authenticity cases of meritocratic dictatorships or considerably more completely imperious frameworks turn out to be similarly stronger (Princeton, 2015). Most recently, according to Pateman (2012), another way to deal with majority rules system government has turned out to be progressively conspicuous. In view of more prominent consultation among general society and its representatives, deliberative politics and democratic system has the potential, from a certain perspective, to react to the presence of the current difficulties. On the off chance that the numerous renditions of a more deliberative democratic government satisfy their goals, they could help restore majority rule system authenticity, accommodate more legitimate will of the people policy, then give a centre ground between broadly questioned elites and the furious voices of populism, and therefore help satisfy a portion of the basic regularizing assumptions regarding vote based system of democracy. The question is, what means can deliberative majority rule system of government if it somehow managed to fill in as visualized by its supporters, react to the difficulties outlined above?

To respond to it, Pateman (2012) suggested that if the more deliberative organizations that many advocates, can be connected to genuine choices in real continuous vote based systems, seemingly they could positively affect authenticity and prompt better administration. In this way, they could improve the relationship between the general society's genuine concerns and how they are represented. Secondly, these organizations could help fill the gap between doubted elites and furious populists. Elites are questioned to a limited extent since they appear and frequently are lethargic to general society's worries, expectations, and qualities. Furthermore, deliberative vote based strategies open up the possibility of prescriptions that are representative of the whole people and dependent on the calm, proof-based investigation of the benefits of contending arguments. Prominent deliberative foundations are grounded in general society's qualities and concerns, so the voice they amplify isn't the voice of the elites. In any case, that voice is generally likewise, after consideration, more proof based and intelligent of the benefits of the significant arrangement contentions. Subsequently, these organizations fill a vital hole. The issue which incorporates changing definitions, methodologies, and settings, the root idea is that consultation requires "gauging" contending arguments for approaches or hopefuls in a setting of commonly affable.

Various discourses in which individuals can choose the benefits of arguments with substantial information the most punctual work on deliberative majority rule government started by examining legislatures (Joseph, 1994), in this issue, Cass Sunstein, interestingly, takes a gander at consideration among policy-makers in the official office. Bernard Manin looks outside government discussions and open public gatherings that can enhance the deliberative nature of battles and discourse among the general public, and therefore develop what is called the mini-public method. The fundamental reason for a mini-public methodology is that if the arbitrary example that is assembled to ponder and or deliberate is illustrative of the populace, and in the event that it is deliberated under good conditions, at that point its considered judgments after consultation ought to speak to what the bigger populace would think whether by one way or another those nationals could take part in comparably good conditions for thinking about the issue. An extraordinary arrangement relies upon the mini-public really being representative and on the record of good conditions to which it is uncovered. At whatever point the utilization of deliberative vote based system relies upon an arbitrarily elected mini-public, that application raises the issue of the level of strengthening.

3. Materials and Methods

This study adopted a documentary analysis method which allows researchers to study and basically consult, and make sense of written materials or documents which may be available either in the public or private domain (Mogalakwe, 2006). The above definition recommends that researchers determine the relevance of the documents that they consult on the basis of their significance to the study. Furthermore, Dey (2005, p.105) argues that in the documentary analysis, the criteria for selecting documents, or for focusing on particular extracts, should reflect the issues on which the researcher is seeking evidence. This method made it possible for the researchers to explore why deliberation is worth it. Once conducted effectively, a deliberative procedure can prompt new answers for the most difficult issues we confront, enhance approach results and cause trust among citizens and government. These procedures draw on aggregate insight and result in choices that are better, as well as are better upheld by the extensive general public. They construct shared duty, implying that the results of these procedures will probably 'stick'. Deliberative procedures are not just representatives and more gainful than non-deliberative commitment exercises; they are likewise less ill-

disposed, removing the governmental concerns from the issue. Deliberative majority rules system of democracy has various, continuous and frequently trans-developmental advantages that include: expanding members' levels of information about issues - more comprehensively, bringing about more educated, considered perspectives being shared, developing trust among experts and networks community, building urban limit and ability, and expanding general levels of municipal commitment and political cooperation.

Citizen's Participation Role in Political Process: The question of; is there a role for deliberation about electoral rules by the youth? Though some people would give the appropriate response to be "no". For them, the idea of principled dialogue educated via cautious reflection is profoundly ambiguous with the dingy routine with regards to legislative issues. Legislative issues, so they would state, is fixated on the quest for political power. Political gatherings and lawmakers, thusly, are absolutely self-intrigued actors doing 'whatever it takes' to get the reins of intensity and utilizing that control for their fanatic advantages. The usual way of doing things is one of the strategic maneuvers and dealing, not consultation.

The Myth and the Veracity of Electoral Process: In the event that these perspectives were conceivable, they ought to be seen most unmistakably in the tenets of the electoral diversion – the direction of elections. Regards to electoral democracies in governments like Australia, there are underlying principles that set the terms of the contest for political position and leadership (power). With such a great amount in question, it would be expected that as indicated by the paradigm of self-intrigue for predominant gatherings to fix these tenets to support them. It is baffling at that point to find the commonness in Australia for example of the discourse of elections to be "free and fair", even among the political class. Considerably additionally astounding is that Australia's constituent framework does, in key regards, accommodate "free and fair decisions of elections. Take two models for which Australia is universally famous: first, the secret vote, which is globally referred to as the 'Australian poll' as it was spearheaded, which advances free elections for voters; the second, is the unbiased organization of electoral standards by the independent electoral commissions, an essential condition for credible free and fair elections.

The Ethical Stand of Electoral Process: Apparently, there is a need for a more nuanced comprehension of the job of deliberative politics. Standards and partisanship locate a place in participatory democracy and governmental issues, with the laws reflecting both. In this regards, if standards are critical to governmental issues, so is consultation, not minimum for its capacity by and large to sift through empty talk and all the more obviously outline the legitimate, rather than ill-conceived, self-enthusiasm of political actors. Instead of being an anathema to the handy substances of gathering governmental issues, deliberative politics lies at its heart. Defining the job of consultation in legislative issues isn't the equivalent, obviously, as acknowledging it in practices. Through standardized gatherings for such deliberations are imperative, particularly in connection to elections control. In a parliamentary vote based system like Australia for example, parliaments are vital to giving such discussions.

Another vital point is working together there is a need to standardize discussions for deliberating electoral regulation beyond the parliamentary setting. This is the basic that led to the foundation and the establishment of the Electoral Regulation Research Network. Its central reason for existing is to encourage trade and dialogue among constituent commissions. This goal is maybe significantly less demanding to the state than to accomplish. The institutional setting of constituent regulations is a bit complex. Diverse gatherings have shifting capacities: the essential errand of the constituent commissions is to direct electoral control; political gatherings and legislators look to propel their ideological plans through voting of elections, and scholars in this field see electoral regulation as a question of the study. The standards of autonomy and lack of bias are vital in electoral commissions, while the invigorating standards of political gatherings are those of political contestation, a blend of partisanship and ideological convictions.

To What Benefit is Citizen Deliberation in Participatory Democracy? Regards to deliberative politics in electoral and constituent control, the research on this theme, the changing capacities and standards can offer ascent to various benchmarks of pertinence, the question is, Is there enough academic enthusiasm for the inquiry? Does it make a difference as far as voter intrigue? Such assorted variety does not, in any case, spell crush. Thought neither surmises nor does it normally deliver an ensemble of unanimity. Despite what might be expected, it is continued and sustained by the outflow of assorted perspectives. Contradiction is the

beginning stage and perpetually the end purpose of consultation. The ethicalness of consultation is that it holds out the guarantee of contradiction being grounded on a more principled premise. Deliberative politics on constituent regulation will require a "meeting ground" where alternate points of view are esteemed and heard. This suggests prudent determination of themes of shared concern. Strains will definitely emerge in the process. However, on the off chance that the speculative chemistry of thought works its belongings, these will be gainful pressures prompting the widening of skylines and deferential learning.

Deliberative Engagement and Principles of Deliberative Engagement: In deliberative politics, the standards of deliberation can be connected to the scope of settings and arrangements. Deliberative procedures include: Citizen Juries, Participatory planning, Deliberative boards and discussions, Deliberative standards and methodologies can likewise be incorporated into a scope of different forms of commitment exercises. Deliberative procedures are worked around, the supposition that the procedure will have an abnormal state of impact over results or choices. Members will approach the information they need to have an in-depth discussion and adequate time to think about that data of information. Members are chosen arbitrarily, and they represent the more extensive network of community and comprehensive of everything being equal.

Citizen and Deliberative Democracy Process: Theoretically, not much has been said about the debate on deliberative politics with two imperative questions of; where deliberation is to happen or held. Deliberative majority rules system of democracy has been held to incorporate, for instance, arriving at a consensus, network community policing, deliberative surveying, community discussions, residents' juries, nationals' gatherings, lawmaking bodies, legal bodies and participatory planning. The second is what is the point of consultation? Its points have been held to incorporate, for instance, touching base at an agreement, settling on a choice, or uncovering how people's inclinations may change after they have deliberated.15 This study believes deliberative vote based system of democracy pay attention to subjects' juries and natives' congregations. Both are models of the exceptionally made in a democratic gathering and, in both, the members arrive at a choice toward the end of their considerations. These are occasions of what at present much of the time called scaled down publics; in other words, they are made out of a gathering of citizens "little enough to be truly deliberative, and representative enough to be truly just (Goodin and Dryzek, 2006, 220). Some of the features expected in a deliberative democracy in deliberative politics (particularly with citizens' juries and citizens' assemblies).

The participants are picked by (nearly) irregular choice to guarantee not just that there is no orderly avoidance of any piece of the populace yet additionally that people with specific attributes are incorporated. Deliberation is guided by facilitators and, to enable them to end up educated and to help their consideration, the members get uncommonly arranged data and hear proof from, and question, master observers. More so, at the conclusion of their consultation, the members reach a decision about the current issue and set up a report and proposals. There are likewise some vital contrasts between citizens' juries and citizens' congregations. It is imperative to note that Citizen or Subjects' juries started around the 1970s in the US yet have been utilized considerably more broadly and as often as possible since the 1990s, especially in the UK. A citizens or natives' jury generally contains about 12–24 residents. Once in a while, the members can revise their motivation. At the point when a native's jury introduces its answer to its support, the last could possibly accept their recommendation; nevertheless, few subjects'. Juries presently enter an agreement with their charging body which necessitates that the last give a clarification of how it has reacted to the jury's proposals. Nationals' gatherings are considerably more late advancement, starting in Canada, British Columbia, in 2004.

Two more have along these lines been held in Ontario (2006), each of the three was dispatched by their individual governments with a charge to audit their electoral frameworks and to suggest an option. The three gatherings have been examined in detail from their beginnings to their decision (Warren and Pearse, 2008). It is expected a small group of the general public are a charming development. This study presents the need to make deliberative politics; recognizable feedback that is regularly brought against contentions for more prominent national inclusion in governmental issues, most people are not adequately fit for doing as such or are not intrigued. There is a possibility that numerous individuals may be pulled in by support, according to Warren (1996, 243), this is called 'romantic dogma'. Despite what might be expected, the exact proof from scaled down publics demonstrates that subjects both welcome and appreciate the chance to partake and to

think, and that they consider their obligations important. Findings demonstrate that common subjects, given some information and time for exchange in gatherings of various sentiments, are very equipped for understanding complex, and some of the time specialized, issues and achieving relevant decisions about huge public issues. In addition, they need to legitimize their thinking in their reports.

The 2005 and 2009 crusades in British Columbia and the 2007 battle in Ontario unfurled without the fighting political gatherings talking about the change recommendations in any important way. None of the real gatherings embraced the get-together suggestion, not by any means the individuals who had started the change venture. Thus, inclusion of discretionary change in the daily papers generally "comprised of standard elections articles," that incorporated a comment toward the end that there was likewise going to be a submission on electoral change (Fournier et al., 2011, 138). While the issue of attention is, maybe, generally effectively open to cure, one part of natives' juries is substantially harder to settle. The juries at worst case scenario are minimal more than centre gatherings, or they end up helpful legitimating gadgets for an effectively chosen approach. In no less than one case, the procedures of citizens' jury in Dublin deliberation about a proposition for a waste transfer incinerator were subverted by the City Manager's Office, which "boycotted the occasion and declined to take an interest in any capacity". In other words, they are not coordinated into the general arrangement of delegate government or majority rule system of organizations, nor do they move toward becoming a piece of the customary political cycle in the life of a network community.

4. Discussion of Findings: Deliberative Majority Rules System of Democracy

A deliberative majority rules system of democracy still leaves unblemished the regular institutional structures and political importance of "popular democratic government." Participatory vote based system is frequently regarded as simply regularizing contention, worried about standards and ideals. In an exceptionally huge inversion of the standard example of political cooperation and participation, citizens with poor background usually shape a substantial proportion of members; ordinarily, they are underestimated. In Porto Alegre, it is the poorer residents as opposed to the happier who partake in political debates through deliberative politics. There are various instances of the classification "community assets at the local and city level." For instance, with the help of the UN, an advancement venture was set up in the year 2000 in Bangladesh, which gave a yearly block grant (about $6,000) to the most reduced level of local government (Pateman, 2012). In order to achieve this, councils were set up to sort out national planning dialogues to choose how the money ought to be designated, with the villagers isolated into small groups for discussion, with facilitators, and women's group were also created (Fölscher, 2007, 175–6). In England for instance, participatory planning and budgeting have been sorted out by local governments designating fund to their various communities for project execution for the citizens.

Citizens' gatherings are then orchestrated to discuss and choose on needs to dispense the cash. However, in a period of grimness, as is noted in the report of a national gathering on participatory planning held by the Participatory Budgeting Unit in November 2010, "specialists are presently tested to move participatory budgeting from the extra subsidies that never again exist, to center administration spending plans and assets and discourses about every one of the financial plans in a neighborhood (Pateman, 2012). Many precedents called "participatory planning" are just consultative or information sharing. Undoubtedly, similarly as great administration is superior to poor administration, so discussion or information sharing is superior to no meeting or no information. People group can profit and citizens increase some training in support in a portion of these instances of 'participatory planning and democracy,' however not very many looks to some extent like the PB that I have illustrated. However, not much had changed from over 10 years prior when one appraisal of World Bank-bolstered participatory activities expressed that "sharing of information and interview happen more as often as possible than investment in participation in basic leadership of decision-making (Smith 2009, 33).

Pateman (2012) noted that there is currently gigantic enthusiasm for, the discourse of, an examination into, and subsidizing of a vast assortment of investigations in interest to participate in deliberative politics, focusing, citizen consultation, and arrangement of information. The spread of 'participatory planning through participatory democracy' the world over will, in general, include estimates that fairly inquisitively and

notwithstanding their mark, will not include the local and city spending plan. Local communities are every now and again talking about moderately little, optional sums of cash that could possibly keep on being made accessible. The greater part of the models being called participatory planning fit effectively in existing structures, and where residents do not usually take an interest, as an issue of appropriate, in choices about their city's or town's standard spending plan for accountability. A large portion of the developments misses the mark concerning participatory majority rule system of government or democracy. It was noted recently, that the bigger open circle as a space in which 'private individuals only come together as a public' (Jürgen and Thomas, 1989). That open circle ca, therefore, fill in as a place for 'basic open discussion (Jürgen and Thomas, 1989), where general feeling can shape and to which all residents could approach, with the opportunity to talk about and assemble as wanted.

He further talks about how the general public discussion could be helped through in an assortment of today's respectful society associations, including volunteer associations, holy places of worship, and academic spaces or institutions (Jürgen, 1996). Characterizing the fundamental components and concepts of liberal vote based system of democracy as "state-ness" -the state's capacity to keep up the devotion of its people and to execute focal capacities, rules and guideline of law, political rivalry, and responsibility, it has been enlightened that state-ness are the natural dangers to these key components. For instance, despite the fact that political rivalry takes into consideration gatherings and contenders to have an unmistakable and real victor, the procedure of rivalry has made an appointive need to depict candidates through their 'identities.' It has additionally urged government officials to treat their opposition as far as them versus us, in which we are great and legit and they are conniving and abhorrent. However, Pateman (2012) noted that the wild utilization of such methodologies in political battles and governmental issues all in all has fortified populist developments and made more divisiveness in the public arena.

Offe's suggestions to remedy this include reinforcing the general population's voice through different types of interest to participation and enhancing the general population's will arrangement through consideration of deliberation. He, therefore, argued that deliberation, through reason-giving, tuning in, and regarding, could deliver constructive outcomes, for example, more educated supposition, inner viability, and the capacity to augment social consideration through deliberation. This paper presents observational proof to show that, in deliberations that are organized to give a more level playing field, as imbalances in aptitude and status don't necessarily convert into disparities of impact. In the course of recent decades, we have heard a truly exceptional volume of discuss and acclaim of majority rules system of democracy, and numerous legislative, nongovernmental, and other international organizations have been occupied with popular government advancement. It was likewise proposed utilizing "haphazardness" in the arrangement of standard participation in deliberation to guarantee diversity and comprehensive portrayal.

Regardless of whether individuals intentionally consent to take an interest and deliberate 'as though" they were the same, it is just unrealistic to force deliberative balance on a social base of imbalance (Folscher, 2007). The common societal practices of people happen in deliberative settings. It must be said that the intrinsic disparities in our general public reason thought to benefit more prevailing people and gatherings while disadvantaging minority people and groups. Nevertheless, political scholar comparatively contended that "discourse that is assertive and angry is here more valued than a discourse that is provisional, exploratory, or mollifying in most real circumstances of discourse. However, this benefits the privilege of male talking styles over female (Iris, 1996). Members who are less favored might be particularly liable to share their contentions as stories. Hence, regardless of whether participants from changing financial classes deliberated together, there would be no certification that they would really tune in and comprehend each other (Iris, 1996, 2000). The applicable qualities are clear and replicable.

5. Conclusion

Conclusively, this study mentioned earlier some ultimate objective facts and addressing an important question. The perspective of what is occurring is that, generally, we see development of cooperation and augmentation of citizenship, yet not the beginnings of democratization and the formation of a participatory society. The historical backdrop of citizenship and the majority rule system of government are ordinarily conflated. The expression 'democratic government' is very frequently used to depict circumstances where

just a segment of the population is conceded citizenship; the rest of, which might be a greater part, are simply subjects. However, from antiquated occasions, there is a long history of government, specifically or through delegates, by subjects over non-natives or community. It was said that majority rules system of democracy did not show up until 1893 when New Zealand received all-inclusive suffrage and in this manner, the entire population, as a right, had some part in government. The viewpoints on politics arrived a century before a large portion of the world had pursued and, even today, widespread suffrage-that exceptionally insignificant but significant necessity for democratic society, it is as yet not exactly worldwide. The battle for general suffrage was so long thus troublesome as frequently overlooked today; it is impossible that the democratization of majority rules system democracy through deliberative politics will be any less demanding in Africa as it has yielded results in other part of the world.

Commenting that Africa will be well encompassed by vote based system of democratic discourse. However in Western nations there is this popular confidence in old-built up foundations that are going out of practice, voters are repelled, therefore losing confidence in government and a wide gap has opened up among local communities and governments, and political elites as well. The voices of ordinary citizens are presently being heard uproariously in various nations, including Africa. Be that as it may, the result relies upon whether anybody is tuning in; when real spending plans on public projects and approaches are in question, political elites once in a while tune in to nationals in order parts of the world, unlike Africa. This study, therefore, suggests one method to take a gander at the new development of participation, in poor nations of Africa. It can help to enhance administration or governance, and in the developed nations it can help to reinforce the authenticity of the present framework. In the event that local citizens can take part in small public forums or can choose the dispensing of some open supports at that point, in another bit of omnipresent or ubiquitous jargon, they 'claim' those choices. In a more extensive setting, it has been contended, that the greater part of the development of interest to participate in deliberative politics through participatory democracy, it does not bother on existing foundations. Unexpectedly, from numerous points of view, it is seen as perfect ideal with the huge changes summed up as globalization. This includes a particular type of modernization that spins around auxiliary change-now being forced upon some developing and developed nations-with the commonplace formula of deregulation, privatization, and a focal job for fund capital. Such modernization blossoms with the language of "straightforwardness," and so forth, and incorporates the change of the general population area. The advancements in cooperation to participate in deliberative politics in Africa are likewise suited to the opposite side of this method of modernization, to a moderate, "sensible. Bearing in mind that citizens have the privilege to public planning, there is also the privilege to take an interest in basic leadership, about their aggregate life and to live in power structures that make such cooperation conceivable.

Along these lines, to close, the issue is not any more whether participatory democracy is possible in Africa. Unfortunately, a high level of inequality or imbalance among people who participate in participatory democracy is one of the significant difficulties to the bigger thought of actualizing deliberative democracy in Africa. This challenge must be pursued with great earnestness. Reacting to critics of deliberative politics consideration the role of disparity utilizing information from Deliberative Polls, both on the web and vis-à-vis finding far less bending than faultfinders anticipate. This offers amazing discoveries on who takes the most talking time, which has the best impact on the results, and who offers more "defended" contentions, providing explanations behind every position. Be that as it may, nobody has yet methodically contemplated the role of disparity under various citizens' deliberative politics. More research with controlled experiments could clear up this issue further.

References

Christopher, H., Achen Larry, M. & Bartels. (2015). Democracy for Realists: Why Elections Do Not Produce Responsive Government (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2015).

Offe, C. (2011). Crisis and Innovation of Liberal Democracy: Can Deliberation Be Institutionalized? *Czech Sociological Review*, 47(3), 447–473.

Dey, I. (2005). Qualitative data analysis. London: Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group.

Dryzek, J. (2007). Theory, Evidence and the Tasks of Deliberation. In Deliberation, Participation and Democracy: Can the People Govern? Ed. Shawn W. Rosenberg. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Fölscher, A. (2007). Participatory Budgeting in Asia. In Participatory Budgeting, ed. Anwar Shah. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

Fournier, P., Henk van der Kolk, Kenneth C., Andre, B. & Jonathan, R. (2011*)*. When Citizens Decide: Lessons from Citizen Assemblies on Electoral Reform. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Fung, A. & Wright, E. O. (2003). Thinking About Empowered Participatory Governance. In Deepening Democracy: Institutional Innovations in Empowered Participatory Governance, ed. Archon Fung and Eric Olin Wright. New York: Verso.

Goodhart, M., Fung, A., Gauri, V., Gloppen, S., Haagh, L., Heller, P., Pateman, C., Peruzzotti, E., Rudiger, A., Schmitz, P. H., Standing, G., Wampler B. & Wing S. (2011). Democratic Imperatives: Innovations in Rights, Participation, and Economic Citizenship. Report of the Task Force on Democracy, Economic Security, and Social Justice in a Volatile World. (http://bit.ly/2011taskforce). Accessed Oct 13, 2018.

Goodin, R. & Dryzek, J. (2006). Deliberative Impacts: The Macro-Political Uptake of Mini Publics. *Politics & Society,* 34(2), 219–44.

Goodin, R. (2008). Innovating Democracy: Democratic Theory and Practice after the Deliberative Turn. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Iris, M. Y. (1996). Communication and the Other: Beyond Deliberative Democracy, in Democracy and Difference, ed. Seyla Benhabib (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1996), 60–74.

Iris, M. Y. (2000). Inclusion and Democracy (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000)

James, S. F. & Mansbridge, J. (2017). The Prospects & Limits of Deliberative Democracy. Journal of the American Academy of Arts & Sciences.

Joseph, A. & Schumpeter. (1942). Capitalism, Socialism and Democracy (New York: Harper and Row, 263.

Joseph, B. (1994). The Mild Voice of Reason: Deliberative Democracy and American National Government (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

Jürgen, H. (1996). Further Reflections on the Public Sphere, in Habermas and the Public Sphere, ed. Craig Calhoun (Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 1996), 421–461.

Jürgen, H. & Thomas, B. (1989). The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society (Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 1989), 27.

Larry, D. (2015). Facing Up to Democratic Recession, Journal of Democracy 26 (1) (January 2015), 141 – 155.

Mogalakwe, M. (2006). Research Report. The Use of Documentary Research Methods in Social Research. *African Sociological Review*, 10(1), 221-230.

Mutz, D. (2008). Is Deliberative Democracy a Falsifiable Theory? *American Review of Political Science,* 11, 521–38.

Participatory Budgeting Unit. (2010). Now Is the Time to Start Trusting Citizens on Budgets. (http://www. participatorybudgeting.org.uk /news-and-events/news/ now-is-the-time-to-trust-citizens-on-budgets). Accessed November 16, 2018.

Pateman, C. (2012). Participatory Democracy Revisited. APSA Presidential Address. March 2012

Pateman, C. (1989). The Patriarchal Welfare State. In The Disorder of Women: Democracy, Feminism and Political Theory. Cambridge and Malden, MA: Polity Press.

Princeton, N. J. (2015). The legitimacy of the distortions from economic inequality, see Martin Gilens, Affluence and Influence: Economic Inequality and Political Power in America (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2014).

Rowe, G. & Frewer, L. (2005). *A Typology of Public Engagement Mechanisms, Science, Technology, & Human Values*, 30(2), 251–90.

Samuel, P. H. (1991). The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century (Oklahoma City: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991).

Schumpeter, J. A. (1942). Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy. New York: Harper. Service Agency Communities in One World. 2010. International Congress on Models of Participatory Budgeting. Dialog Global 24.

Shah, A. (2007). Participatory Budgeting. Washington, DC: The World Bank. (http://siteresources. worldbank.org/PSGLP/Resources/Participatory Budgeting.pdf). Accessed March 5, 2011.

Smith, G. (2009). Democratic Innovations: Designing Institutions for Citizen Participation. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Steven, L., Lucan, A. & Way. (2010). Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes after the Cold War (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Thompson, D. F. (2008). Deliberative Democratic Theory and Empirical Political Science. *American Review of Political Science*, 11, 497–520.

Warren, M. E. (1996). What Should We Expect from More Democracy? Radically Democratic Responses to Politics. *Political Theory,* 24(2), 241–70.

Warren, M. E. & Pearse, H. (2008). Introduction: Democratic Renewal and Deliberative Democracy. In Designing Deliberative Democracy: The British Columbia Citizens' Assembly, ed. Mark E. Warren and Hilary Pearse. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press World Bank. 1996. The

World Bank (1996). Brazil: Toward a More Inclusive and Effective Participatory Budget in Porto Alegre, Volume I. Washington DC: The World Bank.

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS)
Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2019 (ISSN 2221-1152)

Understanding Dynamic Engagement of Community in Local Governance, Enhancing Grassroots Development in South Africa

Andrew Osehi Enaifoghe[1], Cotties Toyin Adetiba[2]
[1]Department of Public Administration, University of Zululand, KwaDlangezwa, South Africa
[2]Department of Politics and International Studies, University of Zululand, KwaDlangezwa, South Africa
andyransey@gmail.com

Abstract: The discourse on "Community engagement and commitment" is a critical subject that requires the interest of individuals within communities to fully participate in activities that address community needs. A meaningful citizen engagement reaches out beyond physical inclusion to incorporate the generation of thoughts and deliberations. In addition, it includes the commitments to leadership process in decision-making and the involvement of community members in the administrative responsibility. Among the elements that propel individuals to take an interest to participate in local governance need to assume a functioning role in bettering their very own lives, satisfying social or religious commitments feeling a need for a sense of community, and other quantifiable benefits. This study conceptualizes what community engagement, models, and frameworks is about and that can be used as a guide, to inspire communities in meeting various challenges relating to their interest in participation and cooperation. The study does not claim to cover all the accessible and significant human sociology on public cooperation literature. Qualitatively, the study gave an outline of the basic ideas that shed light on community participation, cooperation and commitment to duty and responsibility. As the study adopted a qualitative approach, mostly secondary source was consulted to address the research question. The findings show that the instrumental way to deal with citizens' concerns, with attention to results and adequacy is considerably more far-reaching than the more transformative method. Furthermore, people ought to review challenges related with gathering politicization of improvement and participatory structures, the absence of responsibility towards organizing community interest, the absence of limit capacity among partners, poor access to data or information, and inability to perceive and work intimately with community-based associations. It was then recommended that the community and different partners take part in the discussions that prompted the last record, as this is required by the South African Municipal Structures Act.

Keywords: *Dynamics, transformative, governance, participation, community, leadership, states, citizens.*

1. Introduction

The process where a community directly participate in local governance with the commitment of common citizens or community members in the issues of planning, administration, basic leadership of making decisions and the general improvement programs at local or grassroots dimension, has recently turned into an essential part of democratic practice. On such account in South Africa where local citizens interest to participate in local government administration has actually turned out to be synonymous with genuine administration (John, 2006). In such manner, the South African Municipal Structures Act, Chapter 4, subsections (g) and (h) give the 'official municipal managers to write an annual report about the involvement of the community associations in the issues of the region and guarantee that due respect is given to public perspectives and provide details regarding the impact of counsel on the choices of gathering' (Local Government: Municipal Structures Act, Republic of South Africa (RSA), 1998). Nonetheless, it appears that most community support practices in post-Apartheid South Africa are to a great extent observer of legislative issues.

Where common individuals have for the most part progressed toward becoming endorsees of pre-structured arranging programs, are frequently the objects of regulatory control. A phenomenon of compromise in the global field of "consensus politics whilst state functionaries of both the pre- and post-apartheid eras ensconce themselves as bureaucratic experts summoned to ensure a better life for all" (Tshoose, 2015). Apparently, the procedure, objective and missions of a progressively even-handed society work only as "promissory notes issued" like clockwork during the campaign for elections (Glavaš, 2017). Over the past years, the specific idea of community support has been to a great extent decreased to an awkward custom or ritual a vital

informative supplement required by the different laws and strategies working at the local levels of government (John, 2006).

Refined dialogues and reliable debates on the benefits and negative characters of explicit arranging process for citizens' participation are truly non-existent, despite the fact that 'community interest' includes as a key part of arranging process at the grassroots. To put it plainly, doubtlessly the bureaucratic elites of authorities and councillors are resolved to force, their own truncated form and knowledge of 'citizen's interest' on the specific community (Tshoose, 2015). This exceptionally decayed nature of 'interest' is by all accounts working absolutely on the grounds that in the South African rendition of vote based system of democracy, the political party is everything. That is the body of the electorate (political party) is nothing aside from when and just it is required to vote in favour of an explicit political party (Madzivhzndila and Maloka, 2014). Tshoose further stated that South Africa is not practising a constituency-based system of democracy; instead, it is a party-based system of government. Where subject vote in favour of the political party and not for explicit individuals. Thus, the exercise prevails where chosen authorities can truly 'cross the floor' abandoning one party for another without the residents having much to say, if any use, to stop such floor-crossing. Such a constrained type of majority rules system of democracy offers to ascend to a managed society.

As opposed to a law based society, as the assent for administration isn't earned through strategy discussions of the points of interest, and inconveniences of explicit social developments. However, political passive consent is fabricated through the skilful control of a large group of research organizations, so-called specialists, sentiment surveys (Tshoose, 2015). At the point when most of the people in country territories are able to do any of financial versatility (improvement), it tends to be reasoned that development has achieved the majority of its nationals (Dwi et al., 2017). Alongside the difference in globalization, the advancement of a worldview that was initially more accentuation on financial improvement is currently beginning to be deserted in light of the fact that it can't tackle social issues, for example, destitution or eradication of poverty, juvenile misconduct, and monetary inconsistencies. The development on the worldview has started to move toward community approach, in which already community network was as an object of advancement turn into a subject of advancement. The new advancement paradigm is more aligned toward community network based improvement, by giving a focal place to activities of local assorted variety, and local insight (Dwi et al., 2017). A community commitment to participate in local governance can take numerous structures, and accomplices can incorporate an organized group of people, offices, establishments, or people (Tshoose, 2015). Partners might be occupied with wellbeing advancement, research, or strategy making (Wallerstein, 2002).

'Community engagement can also be seen as a continuum of community involvement in local governance. Over time, a specific collaboration is likely to move along this continuum toward greater community involvement, and any given collaboration is likely to evolve in other ways, too' (CFCA, 2016). The objectives of community commitment to participate in local governance are to "build trust, enlist new resources and allies, create better communication, and improve overall wellbeing of the general public outcomes, as successful projects evolve into lasting collaborations" (Shore, 2006; Wallerstein, 2002). The accentuation on community commitment has energized "social wellbeing" of people in a given social order, community pioneers, and strategy creators to envision new open doors as they confront new difficulties (Doll et al., 2008). Besides, people's commitment is grounded in the standards of community association: reasonableness, equity, strengthening, interest and participation, and self-assurance (Alinsky, 1962; Chávez et al., 2008; Freire, 1970; Wallerstein et al., 2002). This study reviews the literature in understanding the dynamics of community engagement in local Governance, in enhancing South African Grassroots Development through community participation in the decision-making process in local government. This article develops the ideas, models, and systems that can be utilized as a guide and move activities to address different basic challenges identifying with community participation.

2. Literature Review

Community Engagement: The commitment of the community to participate in local governance requires interest of community individuals in projects that address their issues. Important or a "meaningful community participation extends beyond physical involvement to include generation of ideas, contributions

to decision making, and sharing of responsibility" (John, 2006). Among the components that spur individuals to take an interest need to assume a functioning job in bettering their very own lives (Fung, A. 2015) and satisfying social or religious commitments feeling a requirement for a feeling of the network in the community and pursuit for economic empowerment or in-kind rewards (Tshoose, 2015). The absence of shared regard and co-learning may result in loss of time, trust, assets or resources, and, above all, adequacy and effectiveness (Henry, 2011; Minkler et al., 2009). The "social exchange" viewpoint gives knowledge into inspirations to the investment of interest, according to Levine et al. (1961), it utilizes the structure of advantages and expenses to help clarify who partakes and why. From this point of view, associations and people are engaged with an "exchange framework" and wilfully share assets to meet their objectives. Community individuals and associations will only take an interest on the off chance that they see that the advantages of cooperation to participate in local government, administration exceed the exertion required, (Butterfoss, 2006; Bradford, 2016). However, the literature investigating the participatory role of the general(spelling) public propose that participatory procedures and frameworks in South Africa need transformative characteristics and are defaced by a blend of disregard, absence of administration conveyance, defilement of corruption, infrequent feedback, restricted contribution and naiveté with respect to organizers and authorities (Lues 2014:802– 804).

The lack of access to information, for example, is said to be lacking and uneven, similar to the limits of residents (and authorities) to comprehend the specialized organizations in which information is exhibited (Houston 2001:207:278). The support that occurs will, in general, be brief, in the state of sporadic data sources that enhance specific phases of arranging and programming cycles. When they do happen, inputs are spurring of the moment (Friedman 2006:8:11). Pundits have scrutinized the gravity with which citizen and community cooperation is being grasped in the local government practice (Buccus and Hicks, 2006:2). The accentuation, they contend, is set on meeting different execution targets and administration conveyance necessities, with an open investment of interest by the community highlighting as a member to those needs (Betancourt et al., 2016). At the local circle, the local government authorities will, in general, go about as guardians and controllers as opposed to as facilitative bodies that empower citizens and community to have a more prominent voice and command over assets and asset portion. The districts are blamed for being either reluctant or unfit to share the basic leadership control with networks of community, particularly in connection to extend distinguishing proof. Systems are equipped fundamentally towards looking for networks of citizens in the community' to contribute to an effectively defined arrangement reactions.

The observation among individuals from the network community is that open participation of the community, if and when it happens, it includes the introduction of foreordained positions and projects for constrained input or for the purpose of information sharing (Nomdo et al., 2018). Actually, when a network of community inputs are requested, they usually joined by poor assistance of the participatory procedures. A key to successful investment of interest by the community can be dictated by the readiness with respect to government to be available to subjects when all is said in done and the poor specifically. The poor can't pick up a voice through organized invested interest to participate in discussions since they are normally complicated and they come up short on the ability to take an interest (Friedman 2006:8, 11). A considerable lot of the poor don't take an interest in grassroots survivalist associations in light of the fact that the legislature does not give participatory spaces in which they will be allowed to convey what needs (Friedman 2006:8, 11). In a perfect ideal world, the formation of these law based spaces is intended to empower customary masses to draw in with the legislature from an enabled position where they can have their voices heard. As far as the more extensive open discourse is concerned, Theron and Mchunu (2013:106) and van Kempen (2014:201) noted that participatory spaces will give chances to fortify the relationships among government and subjects and upgrade responsibility among government delegates, common society and nationals.

The clashing idea of participatory and representatives vote based system of democracy runs its course while the electorate condemns the apparent inclusion of the normal masses and the eliteness of the activity of open power by elected delegates. Of grave concern is the way that picking up entry into these spaces does not at all outcome in the modification of intensity chains of command that would truly enable the minimized citizens to take part substantively, consequently ensuring that their voices will be heard. The potential advantages of investment of interest to participate in local governance for the community individuals, scholastics, and

wellbeing experts incorporate open doors for systems administration, access to information and assets, individual acknowledgment, taking in, a feeling of tackling the issues of the community, enhanced connections among partners, expanded limit with regards to critical thinking, and contact with difficult to-achieve populaces (Butterfoss, 2006). The procedure of social, monetary and political change to engage and fortify the limit of the network community through a participatory learning process, so as to change conduct in all partners, which are associated with the advancement procedure. This is to understand a progressively engaged, free, and increasingly prosperous and feasible participatory. The development of the community is an idea of monetary advancement which that embodies social qualities.

This idea mirrors the new worldview paradigm of advancement, which is "individuals focused, participatory, enabling, and practical" (Chambers, 1994). This idea is more extensive than simply satisfying fundamental needs or giving instruments to avert further security net, in which this idea has as of late been created as an endeavour to discover options towards the past development. This idea created by the endeavours of numerous specialists and experts to discover elective improvement. Friedmann (2006) characterizes elective improvement as wants "comprehensive majority rules system of democracy, suitable monetary development, sexual or gender uniformity and intergenerational value". While exploring on the way to deal with understanding a network of community participation in more noteworthy profundity, a virtual viewpoint of 00few community are mapped onto geologically characterized territories, however today, people depend increasingly more on the use technologies like the computers and handset devices interceded interchanges to get to information, engage with individuals, and settle on choices that influence their lives online (Kozinets, 2002).

Instances of computers intervened types of correspondence incorporate email, moment or content informing, electronic chat rooms, and person to person communication sites, for example, Facebook, YouTube, and Twitter (Flavian et al., 2005; Kleinhans et al., (2015). Likewise, a feeling of membership of a network community can change after some time and may influence their interest in networking exercises. Today, the various community networks that may be significant for any individual-including families, work environment, social, religious, and political affiliations-propose that people are contemplating themselves in more perplexing routes than it was the standard in years past. The qualification criteria that researchers and approach authors produce for social projects and research ventures reflect one way that individuals see a gathering of proposed members, however, how much of those criteria mirror the members' real perspective is uncertain. The supporters of community commitment attest that it enhances peaceful coexistence, advance security among network of individuals (Flavian et al., 2005). However, the procedures, costs, and advantages of community participation are as yet a generally new field of study.

3. Methodology

The approach adopted in this research is a qualitative analysis as a suitable research method. Data are collected from numerous secondary bases predominantly from journal article, reports from government and non-government organizations and book source. Over 80 sources were consulted but only 70 were found relevant to the study. The researcher basically used documentary analysis which allows researchers to study and makes sense of written documents, which may be available either in public or private domain (Mogalakwe, 2006). It is recommended, that researchers determine the relevance of the documents consults on the basis of their significance to the study. Furthermore, Dey (2005:105) argues that “in a written analysis, the criteria for selecting documents, or for focusing on particular extracts, should reflect the issues on which the researcher is seeking evidence.” This method, therefore, made it possible to explore various existing literature on the field of study with understanding the concept and the dynamics of community Engagement in local governance, enhancing Grassroots Development in the municipality.

4. Theoretical Consideration of Community Model

The discourse on the community, there is certainly a multifaceted discourse on the issues of community support and the need to take part in local governance. Therefore one need to think about numerous intricacies around community interests. In the area of improved collaboration, the expression "community" is frequently utilized in a geological sense, as a gathering of individuals living respectively in a town or chiefdom

turning into the subject of field study. Nonetheless, the idea of "community" goes past this spatial measurement. As stated by Hunter 12 (1975:538), there are three unique measurements that can establish a network: "(1) space, (2) social relations, or (3) personality." In the participatory talk on community interest to participate in local governance appears to be regularly seen as something that is remotely energized. "Local gatherings are distinguished" (Minkler, Wallerstein and Wilson, 2008:287). Their objectives by outside characters, which are "giving over the stick' of power" (Chambers 1994:1255). This brings up the issue of office. Furthermore, who has the ability to share it or pass it on? This sort of discourse disregards the likelihood that communities are engaging themselves in empowering them to approach outside characters on eye-level-a thought that is caught under Arnstein's eighth classification of "native control". While Lennie (1999) points out that the topic of office is imperative to the idea of strengthening, which generally can be an outflow of "a shrouded paternalism in the help office" (chamber 1994:200 referred to in Lennie, 1999:103).

Regarding social relations, Etzioni (1996:5) contends that in a "community" these are more than "one-on-one relations". Or maybe, the huge number of interconnections between individual relations shapes an interpersonal organization that rises above the insignificant whole of the individual relations. While it is conceivable to concentrate on every one of these measurements independently, networks of community are generally comprised by an interchange of at least two of them. In this manner, the expression "community" in this study will be comprehended as a multidimensional idea as proposed by Hunter (1975). It is essential to not see a community therefore as a homogenous gathering, as people can be a part in few community networks at the same time, converting into various personalities, jobs and interests, which can be conflicting. In any case, the meanings of the term 'community' fluctuate generally crosswise over various fields of study. Culture is another component that has affected Community Engagement. An anthropologist Katz (2007), characterized culture as 'a complex coordinated arrangement of thought and conduct shared by individuals from a gathering-a framework whose entire example enables us to comprehend the implications that individuals append to explicit certainties and perceptions'.

Culture shapes personalities and cultivates ideas of community networks, and it shapes how people and gatherings identify with one another, how significance it is made, and how control is characterized. Moreover, culture shapes thoughts regarding association, trust, and negotiation. Therefore, culture shapes the procedure of community commitment to participate in local governance, and powerful commitment requires a comprehension of culture (Ginev, 1998). Specifically, scientists and specialists need to comprehend the social elements of explicit gatherings and organizations so as to construct the connections, distinguish approaches to viably work together, and create regard and trust; This is a progressing exertion for all associated with the "community engagement process" (Minkler, 2004). As earlier said above, community are not homogeneous substances; they are comprised of assorted gatherings with various accounts, social structures, values frameworks, and social understandings of the world. There is a drive in social change to enhance hierarchical straightforwardness and responsiveness, and this has the ability to impact the local community.

What is Community Engagement Exactly? There is no straightforward or single response to the inquiry on 'what is community engagement?' It resists definition since to everybody; it appears, has an alternate answer (CFCA, 2016). Things being what they are, who gets the chance to choose? In this section, it investigates the issue from the viewpoint of few unique disciplines trying to concoct a bound together, a comprehensive, definition that enables the majority of the callings to "claim" community engagement to commit all things. The inquiry presently is what are the advantages of community commitment to engage in local governance? One advantage likely to get from community commitment or engagement is the ability to connect with the "under-represented groups." The generally quiet larger part bustling individuals the online network community. A great number of people won't go to an open gathering. Those that do for the most part have a valid justification; which means they will, in general, hold a solid view somehow on a specific issue.

As a rule, a small gathering of individuals have an exceptionally solid view and normally endeavour to overwhelm every other voice with the goal that their view may win. The general population who don't have a solid view basically don't persuade an opportunity to be heard. An exact discovery demonstrates that community commitment help to settle on better choices. There are two essential motivations to attempt community commitment. There you have the optimist, who trusts that it is the proper activity. The practical

person trusts it prompts better choices. The distinction being that on the grounds that online network community commitment enables you to contact more individuals, it is increasingly viable in overseeing hazard, testing presumptions, and being a decent national. Besides, citizenry commitment can advance network possession and likewise help to uncover the main problems and worries in the community through a forum called "deliberative politics" (CFCA, 2016).

The Importance of Community Engagement: Discussing community engagement, there is a scope of reasons why it ought to be an imperative component of future administration development, at the municipal grassroots dimension, in connecting with the citizens give them feeling of obligation, as well as make a sentiment of obligation. Community engagement is a method for guaranteeing that individuals approach valued social settings and exercises, feel that they can contribute genuinely to those exercises commitments, and create useful abilities that empower them to take part completely in municipal matters. It might be that the intricacy of the issues in a portion of these network communities is with the end goal that conventional ways to deal with tending to the issues have been incapable.

We can't realize what these networks of the community require without better understanding their goals, concerns and qualities within the community by engaging with the community member directly (CFCA, 2016). The engagement of the community can assume an imperative job in this regard. The general population benefit reform motivation cannot succeed basically by the top down inconvenience or the imposition of unified targets or more market-based decision (2020 Public Services Trust, 2010; Commission on the Future Delivery of Public Services, 2011). That is, if the government neglect to move to an association way to deal with client (the community members) directions, they will turn out to be progressively ineffectual at accomplishing their objectives. Another important reason of justification to engage with the community is that, it can prompt enhanced results for the community for a "substantive legitimization" (Burton et al., 2006). The above statement supports the community to search out the goals, concerns and estimations of the community.

They are therefore able to share their desires, concerns and values with establishments; and these yearnings, concerns and estimations of the community are therefore consolidated into basic leadership forms through decision-making process. It makes the foundations better ready to address the issues of the community - basically because of being better educated. Building up a compelling association between administration frameworks and the community results in a more prominent feeling of possession more prominent take-up of administrations and better results for children and families, (Yeboah, 2005). It would thus prompt enhanced results for the community because of mediations and methodologies that are custom-made to the "unique aspirations" or desires, concerns and values of that "community" (Reddel and Woolcok, 2004). As to the meaning of community engagement or commitment in this study, the majority of the interest to participate is engaged with the procedures that would be accomplished by the standards of respectability, integration, consultation, and impact.

Community Engagement as a Human Right: In community engagement, there is rights-based contention for community commitment and cooperation. For example, the United Nations-supported Brisbane Declaration on Community Engagement (International Conference on Engaging Communities, 2005) recognizes the general intrigue and significance of engaging with the community, established in the "inherent dignity of people and the values", rights and obligations surprisingly communicated in the Universal Declaration on Human Rights (p. 1). The proof to show its adequacy, it could be contended that community commitment, that is, the procedure whereby general society adds to basic leadership forms - is a central civil right. To be sure, advocates of this view hold that "community engagement" is the way to participatory for all citizens - instead of only representative in a democratic system of government. A community engagement mirrors the privilege of ordinary citizens to be associated with administration going beyond the polling station and an important consistent exchange among governors and the represented (Khan, 2005; Shore et al., 2006). Collectively, these are some of the reasons signifying an incredible method for the utilization of community engagement methodologies in administration development.

What are the Challenges of Community Engagement? One of the difficulties in guaranteeing representativeness is the manner by which to guarantee that those community individuals whose voices are

heard are illustrative of the network. As Katz (2007) brought up the point that not all individuals can take part in projects to a similar degree, and numerous intercessions effectively include just a few individuals (despite the fact that the entire network is relied upon to profit), How do community members or individuals effectively take an interest by volunteering to join the board committees, and as such speak to different individuals from their community? For members to be illustrative of the more extensive network, it is important either that they are chosen or that they relate to it and has its interests on the most fundamental level. The following are likely challenges faced in engaging with members of the community and getting them involved in municipal administration; guaranteeing equity value -communities are mixed. Specific consideration should be taken to guarantee that the less incredible voices and gatherings are locked in and not undermined. It, therefore, implies that including leaders of various group or organisations, individuals with handicaps, youth, individuals from non-English-speaking foundations and Indigenous individuals within the communities. There is a problem of establishing community views - "One can seek to establish community views by summing the separate opinions of individual community members (e.g., via surveys) or by seeking to establish the collective views of community members (e.g., by focus groups or community forums)" (Simpson et al., 2003). Soliciting excessively from individuals from the community -in trying to include the people in basic leadership in decision-making process and associations there is a risk of soliciting excessively from them, causing pressure and weariness (Attree et al., 2011; Simpson et al., 2003).

It is additionally imperative to abstain from making community activities excessively subordinate upon a couple of leaders, as opposed to building limit capacity over a wide scope of people. Staying away from disappointment is another issues or challenge in engaging the community members. As a result, community members may wind up disappointed if the "community engagement process" does not a prompt activity that mirrors their concerns. It is basic that the proficient administrations included are to be completely dedicated to the procedure, willing and ready to react to the choice or agreement reached. A foremost obstruction to poor or sabotaged individuals getting to be associated with activities to address destitution is a vulnerability (van Kempen 2014:201). Conquering past abysmal encounters can likewise be an issue: few communities might be hesitant to be included on the off chance that they have been frustrated by previous activities which they see to have exhibited few advantages (Cortis et al., 2009). Different difficulties incorporate the accompanying: The test of setting up administration courses of action.

For people's commitment and associations to wind up standard practice and reasonable they should be inserted in continuous administration game plans. It is not sensible to have a community representation at all dimensions of government; it should be defined clearly at the grassroots. Basically, the government's job is to make the conditions that permit the administrations they store to connect adequately with those they serve. That incorporates giving administrations a level of adaptability to react to the rising needs of the community and being willing to respect and bolster the choices arrived at by the organization forms by the community. Changing proficient practice is recognized as another challenge, that is, studies of how well experts can convey family-focused practice have appeared that there is constantly a gap between the talk and reality. Making people's commitment a standard practice in human administrations requires a change in perspective in the idea of the connection among authority and the governed, governments and citizens, benefit frameworks and networks (Dunston et al., 2009).

An Empirical Findings on Community Participation: Participatory improvement motivation on the agenda is scrutinized for being excessively debated and lacking important operationalization and execution on the ground and in addition adequate observational or "empirical evidence" (Rudqvist and Woodford-Berger 1996:1). Universal establishments are blamed for paying lip-administration to the idea as a method for co-selecting communities for their own advantage and authenticity (Akerkar 2001:1, 2; Arnstein 1969:216). Mosse (2001:19) presumes that participatory procedures conceal outside plans, which will in general decide the results of those procedures. A fascinating contention made by Cornwall (2003a) is that in as much as the participatory discourse may be about strengthening and consideration of minimized gatherings into tasks influencing their lives, the functional acknowledgement stays with the contemporary "narratives of improved collaboration. It in this way keeps on loaning itself "to compatibility with neoliberal improvement motivation "agendas in which fundamental questions of structural, intersubjective and personal power remain unaddressed". Power is a focal viewpoint and support should dependably be found in light of intensity relations (Rifkin 1986:243). On intra-community level, Adam and Oshima (2014:25) feature that

underestimated gatherings like the youths have been truly rejected out rightly excluded from basic leadership power with regards to decision-making and they alert to deliberately consider the conceivable effects of investment on solidified power.

The community elites generally overwhelm participatory procedures, as a result of built up conventional jobs, as well as "they will, in general, be better instructed" and "have less open door costs on their time" (Mansuri and Rao 2003:42). Concerning outside establishments, Merzel and D'Afflitti (2003:566) declare that there are regularly clashing interests in participatory ventures, where control relations are consulted on unequal terms as power over assets and issue choice more often than not rest with the outer organization. This identifies with the issue that most communities in participatory undertakings will, in general, be basically included at the usage phase of activities. Substantially less so in the regions of necessities evaluation/issue determination or project plan (Merzel and D'Afflitti, 2003:559) an overview of a research conducted in Zambia on community engagement demonstrated that only about 22% of the respondents felt that the social assets of the 1990s, which were imagined to incorporate dimensions of network meeting and investment, tended to the key issues recognized by the community themselves (Binswanger-Mkhize et al., 2010:45). Against this foundation, different writers featured that the instrumental way to deal with interest with an attention on results and adequacy is considerably more far reaching than the more transformative methodology (Walsh et al., 2012:10; Harman, 2009:300). Be that as it may, it has been brought up that there is minimal observational and empirical proof supporting the cases of expanded productivity or viability of participatory methodologies (van Kempen, 2014:201).

Some even contend that support diminishes cost adequacy of activities and "the rhetoric fuels hopes that cannot be met in practice" (Lamb et al., 2005:185; Walsh et al., 2012:2). Besides, the instrumental methodology, where most communities are included as methods for expanding authenticity, proficiency or, truth be told, control, as "fuse, as opposed to avoidance, is frequently the best methods for control" (White 1996:7), has been censured as shallow and undermining the transformative capability of participatory methodologies (Cornwall 2003:1326; White 1996:7). In any case, one needs to recognize a situation that accompanies the transformative way to deal with interest, which esteems of local learning and the neighbourhood "method for getting things done" without forcing an untouchable's motivation (Mohan and Stokke 2000:252).

5. Conclusion and Recommendations

Conclusively this study noted that the basic reason for having a community engagement is the "underlying community participation. The process where a community directly participate in local governance with the commitment of community members in the issues of planning, administration, basic leadership of making decisions and the general improvement process at grassroots, which has recently turned into an essential part of democratic practice. On such account in South Africa where local citizens interest to participate in local government administration has actually turned out to be synonymous with genuine governance. Incontrovertibly, there are number of elements fundamental to community engagement. Considering the underlying community needs in developing their communities, there is needs to establish a strong instrumental understanding of the dynamics of participation in local government decision-making process and in more transformative approaches where the community has actual decision-making power in the community project to various degrees." The elements of community cooperation in local government using South Africa as a focal example, it originally offered a narrative of the development of thought and practice in public interest to participate in local governance and the present accentuation on citizen-led responsibility.

It recognized a portion of the key constraints in the ebb and flowed discourse on citizen-led responsibility activities, contending for an exploration plan that deals with real community issues. Considering the many-sided difficulties looked by the government in its push to enhance public support, it turns out to be evident that there is a need to enhance the systems for public cooperation and participation. The districts or municipality must set up support instruments that are accommodative of a wide range of individuals in their regions. Community engagement has been viewed as a continuum increasing level of community Involvement, impact, trust, and communication flow. Some community involvement communication streams from one to the next. Commitment by the community makes chances to enhance the assent procedure,

distinguish moral entanglements, and make forms for settling moral issues when they emerge. Engaging the members of the community can increase improved learning, a higher profile in the community, more linkages with other community individuals, and new influential capacity. Regions ought to be guided by authoritative prescripts to guarantee straightforwardness and responsibility in the administration of their undertakings.

Besides, people should review challenges related with gathering politicization of improvement and participatory structures, the absence of responsibility towards organizing community interest, the absence of limit capacity among partners, poor access to data, and inability to perceive and work intimately with network-based associations. South African municipality should check whether the community and different partners have taken part in the discussions that prompted the last record, as this is required by the Municipal Structures Act. It is suggested that the jobs of various partners amid the interest procedure must be settled on. The time allotments for public and partners reactions, information sources and remarks must be given. The municipality's correspondence procedure must be actualized in manners that empower the cooperation of chaotic gatherings. The method must have clear techniques to guarantee investment amid the diverse periods of arranging. The way to gather data on community network should likewise be plainly laid out in the correspondence technique. It is prescribed that open interest must be organized so as to guarantee that individuals in the local Municipality have an equivalent ideal to take an interest.

References

2020 Public Services Trust at the RSA. (2010). From social security to social productivity: A vision for 2020 Public Services. The final report of the Commission on 2020 Public Services.

Adam, S. G. & Oshima, K. (2014). Engaging Youth through Community Driven Development Operations - Experiences, Findings, and Opportunities, Global Stocktake Synthesis Paper, World Bank, Washington.

Akerkar, S. (2001). Gender and Participation – Overview Report, Institute of Development Studies, Brighton.

Alinsky, S. D. (1962). Citizen participation and community organization in planning and urban renewal. Chicago: Industrial Areas Foundation; 1962.

Arnstein, S. R. (1969). The Ladder of Citizen Participation. *The Journal of the Royal Town Planning Institute,* 35(4), 216-224.

Attree, P., French, B., Milton, B., Povall, S., Whitehead, M. & Popay, J. (2011). The experience of community engagement for individuals: A rapid review of evidence. *Health & Social Care in the Community*, 19(3), 250-260.

Betancourt, D. S., Vivier, L. E. & Piper, L. (2016). Preliminary assessment of public participation (PP) and community engagement (CE) in the city of Cape Town: developing a framework for strengthening participation. HSRC.

Binswanger-Mkhize, Hans P., Aiyar S. S., Anklesaria, de Regt., Jacomina, P., Serrano-Berthet, Rodrigo, H., Louis Van Domelen, J., Warren D. & Spector, S. (2010). Historical Roots and Evolution of Community Driven Development, in Binswanger-Mkhize, Hans P.; de Regt, Jacomina P. & Spector, Stephen (eds.) (2010): Local and Community Driven Development-Moving to Scale in Theory and Practice, The World Bank, Washington, D.C

Bradford, A. (2016). Community engagement and local government. University of Wollongong. Unpublished Masters by Research. School of Management Operations and Marketing.

Buccus, I. & Hicks, J. (2006). Assessing the effectiveness of community based involvement. Critical Dialogue: 2.

Burton, P., Goodlad, R. & Croft, J. (2006). How would we know what works? Context and complexity in the evaluation of community involvement. *Evaluation*, 12(3), 294-312.

Butterfoss, F. D. (2006). Process evaluation for community participation. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 27, 323-340.

Centres for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). (1997). Principles of community engagement (1st Ed.). Atlanta (GA): CDC/ATSDR Committee on Community Engagement; 1997.

CFCA. (2016). Community Engagement. A key strategy for improving outcomes for Australian families. CFCA Paper No. 39 – April 2016.

Chambers, R. (1994). Participatory rural appraisal (PRA): Analysis of experience, in *World Development,* 22(9), 1253-1268.

Chávez, V., Minkler, M., Wallerstein, N. & Spencer, M. S. (2008). Community organizing for health and social justice. In: Cohen L, Chávez V, Chehimi, S. (editors). Prevention is primary: strategies for community well-being (1st Ed, pp95-120). San Francisco: John Wiley and Sons; 2007.

Commission on the Future Delivery of Public Services. (2011). Report on the Future Delivery of Public Service. Edinburgh, Scotland: Commission on the Future Delivery of Public Services.

Cornwall, A. (2003a). Whose Voices? Whose Choices? Reflections on Gender and Participatory Development, in *World Development,* 31(8), 1325- 1342.

Cornwall, A. (2008b). Unpacking 'Participation': models, meanings and practices, in *Community Development Journal,* 43(3), 269-283.

Cortis, N., Katz, I. & Patulny, R. (2009). Engaging hard-to-reach families and children, Occasional Paper No. 25. Canberra, ACT: Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs.

Dey, I. (2005). Qualitative Data Analysis. London: Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group.

Doll, L. S., Bonzo, S. E., Mercy, J. A., Sleet, D. A. & Haas, E. N. (2008). Handbook of injury and violence prevention (2nd Ed.). Atlanta (GA): Springer; 2008.

Dunston, R., Lee, A., Boud, D., Brodie, P. & Chiarella, M. (2009). Co-production and health system reform - from re-imagining to re-making. *The Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 68(1), 39-52.

Dwi, W., Wahjoedi, M. E., Sri, U. M. W. & Mit, W. (2017). The Dynamics of Community Participation in Developing Tourism Village at Monomerto, Wonosalam, Jombang District. *IOSR Journal of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS),* 22(8), 11-17.

Etzioni, A. (1996). The Responsive Community: A Communitarian Perspective, 1995 Presidential Address, in: *American Sociological Review,* 61, 1-11.

Flavian, C. & Guinaliu, M. (2005). The influence of virtual communities on distribution strategies on the internet. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management* 2005, 33(6), 405-425.

Freire, P. (1970). Pedagogy of the oppressed. New York: Herder and Herder; 1970.

Friedman, S. (2006). Participatory governance and citizen action in post-apartheid South Africa. Paper for International Institute of Labour Studies, 8–11.

Fung, A. (2015). Putting the Public Back into Governance: The challenges of Citizen Participation and its future. *Public Administration Review*, 75, 4.

Ginev, D. (1998). Rhetoric and Double Hermeneutics in the Human Sciences, in *Human Studies*, 21, 259-271.

Glavaš, D. (2017). Political advertising and media campaign during the pre-election period: A Comparative Study. Commissioned by the Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Mission to Montenegro.

Harman, Sophie. (2009). Bottlenecks and Benevolence: How the World Bank is Helping Communities to 'Cope' with HIV/AIDS, in *Journal of Health Management*, 11(2), 297-313.

Henry, S. G. (2011). The tyranny of reality. *JAMA*, 305(4), 338-339.

Houston, G. (2001). The social dynamics in public participation in legislative processes in South Africa in Public participation in democratic governance in South Africa. Houston, G. (eds.) Pretoria: Human Sciences Research Council, 207–278.

Hunter, Albert. (1975). The Loss of Community: An Empirical test Through Replication, in *American Sociological Review,* 40(5), 537-552.

International Conference on Engaging Communities. (2005). The United Nations (Brisbane) declaration on community engagement. Brisbane, Queensland: Queensland Government.

John, J. W. (2006). Community Participation: Lessons from South Africa. *Policy Studies*, 27, 3.

Katz, I. (2007). Community interventions for vulnerable children and families: Participation and power. *Communities, Children and Families Australia*, 3(1), 19-32.

Khan, U. (2005). Participation beyond the ballot box: European case studies in state-citizen political dialogue. London: Routledge.

Kleinhans, R., Van Ham, M. & Evans-Cowley, J. (2015). Using Social Media and Mobile Technologies to Foster Engagement and Self-Organisation in Participatory Urban Planning and Neighbourhood Governance. *Journal of Planning Practice & Research*, 30, 3.

Kozinets, R. V. (2002). The field behind the screen: using ethnography for marketing research in online communities. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 39(1), 61-72.

Lamb, R. D., Varettoni, B. & Shen, C. (2005). Participatory Development and the World Bank, in *International Affairs Review*, 14(2), 171-194.

Lennie, J. (1999). Deconstructing Gendered Power Relations in Participatory Planning: Towards and Empowering Feminist Framework of Participation and Action, in *Women's Studies International Forum,* 22(1), 97-112.

Levine, S. & White, P. (1961). Exchange as a conceptual framework for the study of inter-organizational relationships. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 5(4), 583-601.

Lues, L. (2014). Citizen participation as a contributor to sustainable democracy in South Africa. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 80(4), 802–804.

Madzivhzndila, T. S. & Maloka, C. M. (2014). Community participation in local government planning processes: A paramount step towards successful service delivery. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5, 16.

Mansuri, G. & Vijayendra, R. (2003). Evaluating Community-Based and Community-Driven Development: A Critical Review of the Evidence, Development Research Group, *the World Bank*, Washington.

Merzel, C. & D'Afflitti, J. (2003). Reconsidering Community-Based Health Promotion: Promise, Performance, and Potential, in *American Journal of Public Health*, 93(4), 557-574.

Minkler, M. & Wallerstein, N. (2009). Community-based participatory research for health: from process to outcomes. *Health Promotion Practice*, 10(3), 317-318.

Minkler, M. & Pies, C. (1997). Ethical Issues in community organization and community participation In Minkler M (editor). Community organizing and community building for health (1st Ed, pp116-133) Piscataway (NJ): Rutgers University; 1997.

Minkler, M. (2004). Ethical challenges for the "outside" researcher in community-based participatory research. *Health Education and Behavior*, 31(6), 684-697.

Mogalakwe, M. (2006). Research Report. *The Use of Documentary Research Methods in Social Research African Sociological Review,* 10(1), 221-230.

Mohan, G. & Stokke, K. (2000). Participatory development and empowerment: the dangers of localism, in *Third World Quarterly*, 21(2), 247-268.

Nomdo, A., Davis, Y. D. & Betancourt, D. S. (2018). Community Engagement and the Provision of Water Services in Nyanga, Cape Town. HSRC.

Reddel, T. & Woolcok, G. (2004). From Consultation to participatory governance? *A critical review of citizen engagement strategies in Queensland*, 63, 3.

Rifkin Susan, B. (1986). Lessons from community participation in health programmes, in: *Health Policy and Planning*, 1(3), 240-249.

Rudqvist, A. & Woodford-Berger, P. (1996). Evaluation and Participation–some lessons, Sida Studies in Evaluation 96/1, Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit, Stockholm.

Shore, N. (2006). Re-conceptualizing the Belmont Report: a community-based participatory research perspective. *Journal of Community Practice*, 14(4), 5-26.

Simpson, L., Wood, L. & Daws, L. (2003). Community capacity building: Starting with people not projects. *Community Development Journal*, 38(4), 277-286.

Theron, F. & Mchunu, N. (2013). Contextualising public protests, the case of Khayelitsha. *Administration Publica*, 21(2), 106.

Tshoose, C. I. (2015). Dynamics of public participation in local government A South African perspective. *African Journal of Public Affairs*, 8, 2.

UNDP. (2004). Rapid Appraisal of the Community capacity empowerment Programme and Leadership Development for Results components of the Enhancing Integrated Response to HIV, AIDS and Poverty programme. UNDP: Pretoria.

Van Kempen, L. (2014). Mansuri, Ghazala and Rao, Vijayendra: Localizing development. Does participation work? Book Review, in *Journal of Economics,* 112(2), 201-205.

Wallerstein, N. (2002). Empowerment to reduce health disparities. Scandinavian *Journal of Public Health Supplement*, 59, 72-77.

Walsh, A., Mulambia, C., Brugha, R. & Hanefeld, J. (2012). The problem is ours; it is not CRAIDS'. Evaluating sustainability of Community Based Organisations for HIV/AIDS in a rural district in Zambia, in *Globalization and Health*, 8(40), 1-16.

White, S.C. (1996). Depoliticising development, the uses and abuses of participation, in *Development in Practice*, 6(1), 6-15.

World Health Organization (WHO). (1991). Community Involvement in Health Development: Challenging Health Services–Report of a WHO Study Group, in WHO Technical Report Series, 809, WHO, Geneva.

Yeboah, D. A. (2005). A framework for place-based health planning. *Australian Health Review*, 29(1), 30-36.

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS)
Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2019 (ISSN 2221-1152)

The Global Adolescent Girl Agenda: An Analysis of the Emergence and the Political Outcomes of Two Global Health Networks

Noha Shawki
Department of Politics and Government, Illinois State University
nohashawki@ilstu.edu

Abstract: This article applies the framework developed by the Global Health Advocacy and Policy Project (GHAPP) to analyze the emergence and effectiveness of global health networks to two networks. One of them is Girls Not Brides, a global network of stakeholders working to end child, early, and forced marriage. The other is the network that is working to improve menstrual hygiene management (MHM) in schools and that includes the MHM in Ten network. By providing a theoretically informed account of these two networks, the article contributes to the literature by providing accounts of additional networks that can help us deepen our understanding of the factors that shape transnational network emergence and political outcomes. The two networks in this study complement the case studies completed by the GHAPP because they focus on a complex and politically and culturally sensitive set of issues. Furthermore, this article bridges the gap between the scholarly literature and the literature produced by NGOs and international organizations by providing a theoretically informed account of the effort to end child marriage and improve (MHM) in schools.

Keywords: *Child marriage; menstrual hygiene management (MHM); girls; global networks; transnational activism.*

1. Introduction

Since the 1970s, there has been a growing consensus that a people-centred approach to development is critical for poverty reduction. Frameworks for such an approach have emphasized basic needs including meeting individual minimum needs for consumption (e.g. food) and for essential services (e.g. safe water, sanitation, healthcare, and education). They have also emphasized participation in the economy (Jolly et al., 2009: 92) and securing human rights for all (Jolly et al., 2009: 187, 189, and 191). This growing consensus eventually found expression in the concept of human development, which established "an important contrast between economic prosperity and human development – between economic achievements measured by GNP per capita and human achievements measured by a range of human indicators" (Jolly et al., 2009: 190), and reflected, the capabilities approach to development, an approach that focuses on "what human beings can be and do instead of on what they possess" (Jolly et al., 2009: 196). The concept of human development later informed the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Given the centrality of public health to human development and poverty reduction, public health goals were incorporated prominently into the MDGs and later into the SDGs.

As Shiffman and other scholars involved in the Global Health Advocacy and Policy Project (GHAPP) have shown, global health networks have also proliferated since the 1970s and 1980s and now exist for a significant number of global public health issues (Shiffman et al., 2016b). The GHAPP analyzed six of these global health networks. This article draws on the analytical framework developed by the GHAPP to study additional networks that have received attention recently.

Two of the global public health issues that have been growing in visibility are child, early, and forced marriage (hereafter child marriage) and menstrual hygiene in school settings, two issues that affect adolescent girls. These networks differ from many of the networks analyzed as part of the GHAPP in two ways. First, the adolescent girl agenda is complex, multidimensional, and overlaps significantly with the global agenda surrounding women's rights, gender equality, and the empowerment of women and girls. Second, unlike global health networks that have formed around public health issues like pneumonia, tuberculosis, tobacco use, or neonatal mortality (all networks analyzed by the GHAPP), the focus on adolescent girls in this article adds a case study that addresses public health needs that result from the unique life experiences of adolescent girls. Much like group-specific human rights treaties that "take into account the irreducible experience of these groups" (Mégret, 2008: 498) the adolescent girls agenda "addresses the irreducible core of the life-experience" (Mégret, 2008: 514) of adolescent girls.

Thus, the adolescent girl agenda partly addresses public health issues that are often the result of or are connected to strongly entrenched cultural beliefs and practices. The global networks surrounding adolescent girls challenge these beliefs and practices pertaining to gender norms, sexual and reproductive health and rights, and the empowerment of women and girls, and they are perhaps not as politically and culturally innocuous as global health networks surrounding other global public health issues. In many ways, they straddle global public health networks and transnational feminist networks, the latter being networks that mobilize "women from three or more countries around a specific set of grievances and goals, such as women's human rights, health, or economic justice" (Moghadam, 2015: 56), are driven by "a critique of women's subordination to men and a call for societal change toward equality" (Moghadam, 2015: 54), and develop "non-hierarchical structures that span local and global spheres" (Moghadam, 2015: 56).

This article contributes to the literature by analyzing global health networks that have addressed a more complex and politically and culturally more sensitive set of issues and examining the factors that have allowed the networks to gain much political momentum and traction in recent years and the extent to which they are the same factors that explain the success and emergence of other global health networks. It also provides overviews of different initiatives and campaigns pertaining to adolescent girls, and documents these initiatives that have received little attention in the scholarly literature. While the activities of these campaigns have been documented in the literature produced by non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and international organizations, these accounts are usually not informed by the theoretical literature in the social sciences. This article bridges the gap between the scholarly literature and the literature produced by NGOs and international organizations by providing a theoretically informed account of the effort to end child marriage and improve menstrual hygiene management (MHM) in schools. And since the GHAPP framework "should be understood as an evolving set of categories and propositions whose usefulness and validity can only be evaluated" in further research (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i7), studies of additional networks can help generate important findings about the emergence and effectiveness of global health networks. Finally, since transnational feminist networks are "part of the family of political change organizations operating above and across national borders" (Moghadam, 2005: 4), I argue that studying these political change organizations can therefore contribute to the research on transnational social movements. The two global public health networks on which I focus here share key features with transnational social movements and transnational feminist networks, which are the organizational structures of the transnational women's movement. Put succinctly, transnational social movements "are best seen as networks of actors that are organized at local, national, and international levels" (Smith, 2013: 1) and "mobilize people across national boundaries around a shared aim" (Smith, 2013: 2). Since global health networks share with social movements some of their key features, this paper generates findings relevant to the study of transnational social movements.

The article is organized in several sections. The first section following this introduction defines global health networks and introduces the GHAPP's analytical framework as well as the methodology used in the article. The following section introduces the adolescent girl agenda and the two global health networks on which I focus here. Next, I present an overview of the outcomes of the two networks, followed by an analysis of the three categories of relevant factors that can explain these outcomes. These sections are organized around the GHAPP framework. Finally, the conclusion summarizes some of the key findings and points to possibilities for future research.

2. Analytical Framework and Methodology

The GHAPP defines global health networks as "cross-national webs of individuals and organizations linked by a shared concern to address a particular health problem global in scope. They may consist of and connect multiple types of institutions, including United Nations (UN) agencies, bilateral donors, international financial institutions, private philanthropic foundations, national governments, international and national non-governmental organizations (NGOs), medical associations, research institutions and think tanks. Some members produce knowledge, others advocate, still others provide funds, develop policy ideas or implement programs" (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i4). With a focus on policy, advocacy, and the generation of knowledge, global health networks combine features of global public policy networks, transnational advocacy networks, and epistemic communities (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i4). This article uses the framework developed by the GHAPP to analyze networked advocacy surrounding a number of global health issues and applies it to two

issues that affect adolescent girls: child marriage and menstrual hygiene management (MHM) in schools. The framework can help us understand and explain both network emergence and network effectiveness (Shiffman et al., 2016a; Shiffman et al., 2016b). Effectiveness is defined in terms of output, policy consequences, and impact. Network outputs are the outcomes of a network's activity, such as research, policy recommendations, and international meetings. Policy consequences refer to influence over policy-making at the global and national levels, including influence on international resolutions, funding commitments, and policy and adoption and implementation. Impact pertains to improvements in health outcomes, the ultimate goal of global health networks (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i6).

The analytical framework that is used to understand network emergence and effectiveness comprises three categories of relevant factors that each encompasses a number of variables: network and actor features, policy environment, and issue characteristics (Shiffman et al., 2016a; Shiffman et al., 2016b). The remainder of this review is mostly organized around each of these three categories of variables.

Network and Actor Features: Network and actor features refer to factors internal to the network and include leadership, governance, composition, and framing strategies. Skilled, experienced, knowledgeable, well-connected, and widely-respected leaders who can build coalitions and inspire others can play critical roles in network emergence and effectiveness. Different organizational and governance models are available to networks, and choosing a model that suitable to the specific network can be critical in terms of facilitating network activity and positioning and allowing it to be effective. Composition refers to the level of homogeneity/diversity within a network. Diversity of network membership can be both an asset and a liability. Diversity can strengthen a network by positioning it to engage with the politics surrounding a global health issue (as opposed to focusing only on technical aspects of a global health issue) and by enhancing the capacity of a network to understand and solve global public health problems. However, diversity can undermine a network's cohesiveness and its ability to build consensus among its members and develop a shared, effective, focused, and persuasive narrative of the global health issue, which brings me to the last important network and actor feature: framing. An effective framing of a global health issue includes a shared understanding of the nature of the issue in question, a widely-agreed upon policy response to address the issue, as well as a persuasive rationale to take action to tackle the issue, and it will resonate with target actors, especially political elites and decision-makers. Networks with diverse memberships may find it challenging to develop a cohesive framing of an issue (Shiffman et al., 2016a; Shiffman et al., 2016b).

Policy Environment: The policy environment pertains to factors external to the network that may impact network effectiveness, including allies and opponents, funding, and norms. Allies who support a network's goals may eventually become network members, thus strengthening the network. Opponents have different influences on a network. On the one hand, they may actively work to counter network activities, but on the other hand, their opposition to the network's goals can animate network mobilization. The availability of external funding can be critical to network emergence and effectiveness, but at the same time reliance on external funding can affect (perceptions of) network legitimacy and independence and undermine the network if donor priorities shift. Finally, the normative context can influence network emergence and effectiveness. Networks whose causes resonate and dovetail with widely-accepted norms will face fewer impediments than networks whose causes are not fully compatible or consistent with pre-existing norms (Shiffman et al., 2016a; Shiffman et al., 2016b).

Issue Characteristics: Issue characteristics can also have a significant impact on network emergence and effectiveness. The issue characteristics that the GHAPP framework highlights are severity, tractability, and affected groups. Networks are more likely to emerge and be effective when the issues on which they focus cause high levels of morbidity and mortality, and have significant socio-economic consequences (severity). They are also more likely to mobilize and be effective when there are politically acceptable and innocuous solutions or policy interventions available that can address the global health issue in question (tractability). Finally, global health networks are more likely to emerge when the group affected by a health issue is easily identifiable, and when its members elicit sympathy and compassion and can be involved in mobilization and advocacy (affected groups) (Shiffman et al., 2016a; Shiffman et al., 2016b).

Methodology: Following Gerring, I think of a case study as "as *an intensive study of a single unit for the*

purpose of understanding a larger class of (similar) units" (Gerring, 2004: 342; emphasis in the original). Case studies are appropriate for research that seeks to address "why" and "how" questions and consider the relevant contextual factors (Baxter & Jack, 2008: 545). This makes a case study suitable for this article as I follow the approach of the GHAPP and aspire "to understand the factors that have facilitated or inhibited network emergence and effectiveness, and policy and public health change" (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i12). The case study is also suitable in the context of the GHAPP's analytical framework given the GHAPP's call for more research that continues to develop this evolving framework (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i7; see also the introduction of this article). I present a case study of two different units here (Baxter & Jack, 2008: 550), Girls Not Brides and MHM in Ten, for the most part using the same approach that the GHAPP has employed. Much like the GHAPP, I combine some key informant interviews with a variety of sources, some of which are published by the networks on which the article focuses, in an effort to shed light on the emergence and effectiveness of the two networks under study here (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i12-i13). The use of different types of sources and their integration into a theoretically -informed account is a key feature and strength of case studies (Baxter & Jack, 2008: 554-555). The scope of the account I provide here is defined by the propositions developed by the GHAPP, and my presentation and discussion of the data are organized around these propositions (Baxter & Jack, 2008). In sum, I use a case study because it "enables the researcher to answer "how" and "why" type questions, while taking into consideration how a phenomenon is influenced by the context within which it is situated" (Baxter & Jack, 2008: 556).

Final Thoughts: It is important to note that these different factors can interact across the three categories. For example, issue characteristics are partly inherent in an issue, but perceptions of an issue can also be shaped by network framing activities (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i9). Similarly, pre-existing features of the policy environment, such as norms, may create opportunities for effective framing that will resonate with policymakers (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i9). I also note that the research on the transnational women's movement and social movement coalitions has also highlighted the significance of some of these variables, including leadership (Moghadam, 2005: 98; Van Dyke & Amos, 2017), organizational structure, and governance (Moghadam, 2005: 99-102; Van Dyke & Amos, 2017). Moreover, much like the GHAPP, previous research on social movement coalitions has also demonstrated that factors internal to a coalition as well as features of a coalition's external environment explain coalition formation, longevity, and outcomes (Van Dyke & Amos, 2017). However, a recent review of research on coalitions concludes that "we know that coalition form and content influences success, but research on this topic is limited" (Van Dyke & Amos, 2017: N.PAG) and that "we still need more research on how coalition form and other factors influence success" (Van Dyke & Amos, 2017: N.PAG), allowing research utilizing the GHAPP framework to make contributions to the literature on social movements (see also the introduction and conclusion).

The adolescent girl agenda is a global public health agenda, given the profound health impact that the issues described below have on girls' health and their ability to have healthy lives in adulthood. In GHAPP's categorization of global health concerns "adolescent females" is one of the population/demographic groups included in the category "Groups". The other categories are "Diseases", "Risk Factors", "Interventions", and "Systems", and other populations and demographic groups within "Groups" include newborns, pregnant women, and the elderly (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i11).

3. The (Adolescent) Girl Agenda

The global agenda surrounding (adolescent) girls has its origins in the "girl child" agenda that the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) developed in the 1990s and its main objectives were incorporated in the Beijing Platform for Action, the action plan adopted by the Fourth UN Conference for Women held in 1995 (Croll, 2006: 1285-1286). Some regions and countries began to consider the situation of girls prior to and/or concurrently with the emerging global focus on girls in development discourse and practice. With the exception of girls' education, this emerging discourse surrounding girls initially did not translate into tangible practices, programs, and initiatives (Croll, 2006: 1287-1288). Education did receive a lot of attention from a variety of international organizations and governments, and girls' education was seen "as the prerequisite to sustainable development on the grounds that an educated girl is more likely to become a competent mother, a knowledgeable family planner, a more productive and better-paid worker, an informed citizen, a skilful decision maker and a self-confident individual" (Croll, 2006: 1288).

More recently, there has been an effort to expand the girl agenda into a holistic approach that encompasses not only education but a range of other services, opportunities, and protections for girls, although education remains a critical component of the agenda. Much like the earlier focus on girls' education, this effort is grounded in the premise that investing in girls is crucial for social and economic development. As the United Nations Interagency Task Force on Adolescent Girls stated in its publication Girl Power and Potential, hundreds of millions of girls live in developing countries, and many "of them lack access to basic services, or are subject to harmful practices, violence, abuse and denial of their human rights and dignity. Still, adolescent girls represent a huge untapped potential. Strategic investments in the social protection, health, education, and livelihoods skills of marginalized girls not only promote social justice but also are essential for achieving internationally-agreed development goals, human rights norms and other global commitments" (United Nations Interagency Task Force on Adolescent Girls, 2009: 2). These global development goals include reducing poverty and hunger, promoting maternal and child survival, combating infectious diseases, and promoting literacy and furthering education. The basic premise behind the agenda is that investing in girls, empowering them with education, protecting their health, shielding them from violence and harmful practices like child, early, and forced marriage and their consequences for girls' health and wellbeing, allowing them to develop skills, and offering them economic opportunities are all strategies that can have ripple effects on their communities and unlock much-unrealized development potential because educated, empowered, and healthy young women are more likely to have better employment opportunities, better off families, and healthier and better educated children (United Nations Interagency Task Force on Adolescent Girls, 2009: 2-3; UNFPA, 2014; for a discussion of how child marriage specifically is connected to human rights, education, and public health see Davis et al., 2013).

This agenda is also based on the premise that adolescent girls are doubly vulnerable, and that they have special needs that are different from the needs of children and youth in general and from the needs of adult women. As the UNFPA's Action for Adolescent Girls program document states, because of "the double disadvantage of being discriminated against because of being female and young, marginalized adolescent girls are pushed to the fringes of society as they transition into adulthood" (UNFPA, 2014: 2).

This agenda and the discourse associated with it are not uncontroversial, and compelling critiques of them have been articulated (see, for example, Koffman & Gill, 2013; Caron & Margolin, 2015). The focus of this article, however, is not on assessing this agenda or its promise as a development tool. Rather, the focus is on elucidating the emergence and effectiveness of the global health networks dedicated to (adolescent) girls. Within the contemporary (adolescent) girl agenda, there are several actors and campaigns. I focus on two of them here and introduce them below.

Girls Not Brides: Girls Not Brides is a global network of hundreds of civil society organizations in over 85 countries. Launched in 2011 by The Elders, "an independent group of global leaders working together for peace and human rights"[1], it works to end child marriage, a harmful practice that mainly affects girls. While the focus of Girls Not Brides is on one issue, child marriage has a number of far reaching and profound impacts on the health and wellbeing of adolescent girls and their future opportunities as adults. In addition to being a serious human rights violation, child, early, and forced marriage often interrupts a girl's schooling, thus affecting her economic opportunities and perpetuating the deep poverty that gives rise to child marriage. Moreover, early pregnancy and childbirth can have very significant negative health impacts on girls. Furthermore, adolescent girls are more vulnerable to domestic violence and have less control over their sexual and reproductive health. The rationale for ending child marriage reflects the discussion above: ending child marriage can help protect girls' health, human rights, and safety, and enhance their educational and economic opportunities. This in turn can contribute to the broader poverty reduction and development agenda and to the implementation of the SDGs.[2]

[1] See http://www.theelders.org/about. One of the founders of The Elders is Nelson Mandela, and The Elders include leading global public figures such as Kofi Annan, Mary Robinson, and Desmond Tutu. Or a full list see http://www.theelders.org/about (accessed 15 January 2017).

[2] See Ending child marriage will help us achieve the Global Goals for Development. Here's how, available from http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/ending-child-marriage-will-help-us-achieve-the-global-goals-heres-how/ (accessed 15 January 2017). For an overview of the consequences of child marriage for health, education,

WASH and MHM in Schools: The water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) agenda has become an important part of international sustainable development policy and practice. As part of global efforts to make WASH services available to all, providing WASH services in schools has emerged as one area of focus. Promoting WASH in schools is part of a larger agenda surrounding public health promotion in schools to address critical global public health problems and teach children basic health skills (Benzian et al., 2012).

One of the important issues that have emerged surrounding WASH in schools is MHM. This issue has only recently received attention at the global level (compared to child marriage, which has had attention for some time, even though policy momentum occurred fairly recently) (interview # 10). This is an important issue for the adolescent girl agenda because poor "water and sanitation facilities pose a major impediment to school-going girls during menstruation, compromising their ability to maintain proper hygiene and privacy" (Sommer & Sahin, 2013: 1556). This has important implications for girls' education as the lack of adequate WASH facilities may disrupt their schooling (Sommer & Sahin, 2013: 1556; Sommer et al., 2015; Sommer et al., 2016; Human Rights Watch & WASH United, 2017: 10-11; UNESCO, 2014: 15-17). This issue is compounded by the general lack of guidance and resources available to adolescent girls about menstrual health in many low and middle-income countries (Sommer & Sahin, 2013: 1558; Sommer et al., 2015; UNESCO, 2014). Awareness that MHM should be considered a public health issue began to increase in the 2000s as a result of a growing body of research documenting girls' experience with MHM and the lack of MHM information, resources, guidance, and support for many girls in middle and low-income countries (Sommer et al., 2015: 1305-1306). For this reason, promoting MHM in schools is not limited to keeping girls in school by ensuring they have access to adequate WASH facilities. It also entails developing curricula that educate girls about MHM and provide them with the knowledge and information that they need for MHM, which not only helps them with their schooling but also contributes to their right to health (Human Rights Watch & WASH United, 2017: 7-8 and 9).

Although there is much activity surrounding MHM in which various actors are engaged, one important network that brings together the full range of stakeholders to address MHM in schools is MHM in Ten, which began meeting in 2014 and whose members are working to ensure that "In 2024, girls around the world are knowledgeable about and comfortable with their menstruation, and are able to manage their menses in school in a comfortable, safe and dignified way."[3] MHM in Ten built on earlier conferences that addressed MHM in schools.[4] MHM in Ten Network members identified five priorities that can help promote MHM in schools over a ten-year time frame (2014-2024) (for an overview of the five priorities see Columbia University and UNICEF, 2016: 5). Ultimately, addressing the challenges of MHM women and girls face in school settings and elsewhere is about addressing the broader issue of "systematic exclusion of girls and women from society", including exclusion from education and opportunity, "over something as biologically familiar as menstruation" (Saywell & Gruer, 2017). MHM in schools, much like child marriage, is ultimately about empowerment and opportunity for all girls.

4. Outcomes

There has been some momentum surrounding the adolescent girl agenda in recent years, both in multilateral fora and in foreign policy. Both networks analyzed here have been effective, especially given that they formed fairly recently. Both networks have produced significant outputs and, in the case of the network surrounding child marriage, some significant policy consequences.

---

poverty reduction, human rights and other issue areas see https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/what-is-the-impact/ (accessed 10 March 2018).

[3] This is the text of MHM in Ten's Common Vision, and can be accessed at https://www.mhmvirtualconference.com/mhm-in-ten/ (accessed 2 February 2018).

[4] For information about these conferences see https://www.mhmvirtualconference.com/previous-conferences/ (accessed 2 February 2018).

Girls Not Brides and Child Marriage: In the case of child marriage, network outputs have included international meetings, publications, and policy recommendations. This article cites some of these publications, many of which are available on the website of Girls Not Brides.[5] Significant policy consequences also point to network effectiveness, including international resolutions and action plans. Below is an overview of these policy consequences.

First, several United Nations resolutions on the issue of child, early, and forced marriage were adopted in the last few years. The United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) adopted a resolution in December of 2013 (A/RES/68/148) that requests that the Secretary-General submitted to the UNGA reports prepared by other entities within the United Nations system on the topic. This resolution also states that the UNGA would convene a panel discussion on the issue for which the Secretary-General is to solicit input from all stakeholders (the panel discussion was held in 2014 - see Zafar, 2014) and that it would address the issue at its sixty-ninth session. Another longer and more substantive resolution on this issue was adopted in December of 2014 (A/RES/69/156). It details the causes and consequences of child, early, and forced marriage, and calls for a number of strategies and measures to be implemented by the United Nations and its member states to end child, early, and forced marriage.

A second substantive resolution on the issue was adopted in December of 2016 (A/RES/71/175). This resolution goes further in addressing child, early, and forced marriage by recognizing it as a human rights violation that results from gender inequality, gender discrimination, and gender stereotypes and that is exacerbated by a number of other factors, such as poverty, the lack of education, and conflict and humanitarian crises (Branson, 2017). It also prescribes a number of actions that governments should take to respond to and eventually end child marriage. Most recently, child marriage was addressed as a cross-cutting issue by the UNGA in September 2017 and mentioned by several leaders.[6]

In addition to these UNGA resolutions, the Human Rights Council (HRC) adopted a resolution in July of 2015 that focuses on eliminating child, early and forced marriage (A/HRC/29/L.15). This resolution builds on a procedural resolution adopted in 2013 that recognizes the causes and consequences of child marriage, calls for a panel discussion on the topic and requests that a report be prepared by the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights. The report was released in 2014 and its recommendations were incorporated into the resolution, and it is important to note that Girls Not Brides member organizations contributed to the report.[7] Building on the 2015 resolution, the HRC also adopted a resolution in June of 2017 that stresses the need to address child marriage in humanitarian crises as humanitarian emergencies make girls more vulnerable to child marriage.[8]

Additionally, the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which were adopted in 2015, include a goal (SDG 5) that seeks to "Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls." Among the targets for SDG 5 is a target that calls on the international community to 'Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilation"[9]. This is considered a significant global policy outcome by Girls Not Brides (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 14).

At the regional level, initiatives have included the African Union's Campaign to End Child Marriage, launched in 2014, as well as the Regional Action Plan to End Child Marriage in South Asia, which was adopted in 2014

[5] *Girls Not Brides*' Resource Centre can be accessed here: https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/resource-centre/ (accessed 9 March 2018).
[6] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/end-child-marriage-five-exciting-things-happened-unga-2017/ (accessed 29 October 2017).
[7] See http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/human-rights-council-adopts-resolution-to-end-child-early-and-forced-marriage/ (accessed 3 March 2017).
[8] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/human-rights-council-adopts-2017-resolution-end-child-marriage-humanitarian-settings/ (accessed 28 October 2017).
[9] See http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/gender-equality/ (accessed 26 November 2017).

by the South Asia Initiative to End Violence against Children (Branson, 2017; Upreti, 2016).[10] Other regional efforts include a resolution adopted by the Organization of American States as well as an initiative by the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS).[11] A number of countries took important steps to end child marriage in recent years. For example, in 2017 alone, countries taking steps to end child marriage, such as launching national action plans or adopting legislation to end the practice included Afghanistan,[12] Ghana,[13] and Malawi,[14] as well as a number of other countries.[15]

In foreign policy, the U.S. government launched its first United States Global Strategy to Empower Adolescent Girls in March of 2016.[16] There is some evidence that civil society influenced this policy initiative. For example, the United States Global Strategy to Empower Adolescent Girls cites publications by Plan International and the International Center for Research on Women, both leading organizations working to promote the wellbeing of girls. In addition, NGOs very active in Girls Not Brides see this Global Strategy as a response to their advocacy campaign to end child marriage.[17] The Global Strategy is to be implemented by the U.S. Department of State, the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), the U.S. Peace Corps, and the Millennium Challenge Corporation. It has a number of focal points, many of which pertain to health. These focal points are education, gender-based violence, female genital mutilation/cutting, child, early, and forced marriage, early pregnancy, HIV/AIDS, with a focus on conflict, crises, and humanitarian emergencies that can further intensify these threats to the health and wellbeing of girls.

In addition to the efforts of the U.S. government, the UK government, through the Department for International Development (DFID), provided funding to Girl Hub, a joint initiative of DFID and NIKE Foundation that began in 2009 and ended in 2015.[18] This initiative was designed to "encourage developing world decision makers and donors to do more for girls better".[19] This initiative pursued two goals, namely, "to work with donors, governments and other decision-makers to encourage and help them to consider girls' needs" and "to involve girls and their communities in programme design to learn how better to meet their needs" (Independent Commission for Aid Impact, 2012: 3).[20] Furthermore, DFID launched the Global Girl Research Initiative in 2014, a 9-year initiative described as an effort to "generate new evidence on 'what

[10] For the regional initiative for Africa, see http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/african-union-extends-campaign-to-end-child-marriage-until-2017/ (accessed 28 October 2017).
[11] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/2017-review-6-signs-made-progress-towards-ending-child-marriage/ (accessed 24 December 2017).
[12] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/afghanistan-launches-national-action-plan-end-child-marriage/ (accessed 29 October 2017).
[13] https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/ghana-launches-national-strategic-framework-ending-child-marriage/ (accessed 29 October 2017).
[14] https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/malawi-constitution-no-longer-allows-child-marriage/ (accessed 29 October 2017).
[15] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/2017-review-6-signs-made-progress-towards-ending-child-marriage/ (accessed 24 December 2017).
[16] More information about the *United States Global Strategy to Empower Adolescent Girls* is available from https://www.state.gov/s/gwi/priorities/adolescentgirls/index.htm (accessed 11 March 2017).
[17] See http://www.care.org/newsroom/press/press-releases/care-applauds-us-government-strategy-empower-adolescent-girls (accessed 11 March 2017).
[18] See the Project Completion Review, published in November 2015 and available from https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-201086/documents (accessed 12 March 2017).
[19] https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-201086 (accessed 12 March 2017).
[20] A 2012 review of this initiative showed mixed results. Since the focus in this article is not on the efficiency or effectiveness of a specific policy or program, but rather on the emergence and overall effectiveness of global health networks, I do not review the assessment of Girl Hub here, but this assessment is available in Independent Commission for Aid Impact, 2012.

works' to transform the lives of poor adolescent girls to enable them to move out of poverty".[21] This 9-year research project involves academic institutions, NGOs, and two think tanks that have played a key role in the adolescent girl agenda: the Overseas Development Institute and the International Center for Research on Women.[22]

Finally, the European Union (EU) and the UN jointly launched the EU-UN Spotlight Initiative in September of 2017, an initiative designed to eliminate all forms of violence against women and girls, a critical health issue that affects women and girls worldwide. As part of this initiative, the EU will be the main donor to a multi-stakeholder trust fund that will support interventions across the world to promote gender equality, women's empowerment, and the implementation of the Sustainable Developments Goals (SDGs), in particular, Goal 5, which focuses on genders quality.[23]

Beyond commitments and initiatives at the global and regional levels as well as new policy and legal frameworks in many countries around the world, a different, but important, outcome is the overall increase in funding from bilateral donors and foundations for programs and organizations aiming to end child marriage (even though much more funding is still needed) (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 34-37).

WASH and MHM in Schools: Outcomes of advocacy surrounding MHM are more subtle and still fairly limited to output, although there are some policy consequences as well. The coalescing of a network is in itself an important outcome in an issue-area that had been neglected by education, public health, and WASH practitioners for a long time (Sommer & Sahin, 2013; Sommer et al., 2015). But beyond the emergence of a diverse and active network, there are other important outcomes. First, there is now a definition of MHM, which is an important step (and an important policy consequence) in terms of addressing MHM as a public health issue at the global level (Sommer at al., 2015: 1308; UNESCO, 2014: 31). This definition was the result of discussions spearheaded by the WHO/UNICEF Joint Monitoring Programme for Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene (JMP) in the context of consultations on the post-2015 development agenda (Sommer & Sahin, 2013: 1557 and 1559). In addition to the definition, these consultations also resulted in a set of standards for MHM facilities (Sommer & Sahin, 2013: 1558). There is now also a set of five priorities for MHM in schools that MHM in Ten network members are focusing on in the ten-year period 2014-2024, and these priorities reflect the growing consensus that MHM in schools is a) a public health issue for which government agencies should take responsibility and b) a global issue that requires action and standard-setting at the global level (for an overview of the five priorities see Columbia University and UNICEF, 2016: 5). Defining MHM as a public health issue, as opposed to a private issue that is addressed at the family level, is a shift in the prevailing understanding of MHM that resulted from research and advocacy (Sommer et al., 2015).

One example that illustrates how MHM is increasingly understood as a public issue is a UNESCO publication (UNESCO, 2014) that focuses on puberty education and MHM in schools. Noting that the education sector has a responsibility to prepare schoolchildren for puberty, and highlighting the importance of MHM in puberty education given its impact on girls' schooling, this UNESCO report is based on the premise that puberty education, and MHM specifically, are not matters to be addressed only in the private sphere, but are health education issues that should be part of school curricula. In addition, the report also stresses the importance of adequate WASH facilities for MHM. The report acknowledges that even though "Menstruation is a vital sign of reproductive health", "the main message is often that it is a 'problem' that must be managed privately, with an

[21] See http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20160323135854/http://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/gb-1-203529/ (accessed 12 March 2017).
[22] See https://www.odi.org/events/4303-adolescence-girls-development-ggri-dfid (accessed 12 March 2017).
[23] For overviews of the Spotlight Initiative see http://www.un.org/en/spotlight-initiative/assets/pdf/Spotlight_Overview.pdf, http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=57608#.WfYNh0yZNOg, and http://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2017/9/press-release-eu-and-un-team-up-to-eliminate-violence-against-women-and-girls (all accessed 29 October 2017).

implicit suggestion that it is unpleasant and shameful, and should be hidden" (UNESCO, 2014: 14). The report calls for different stakeholders, including governments (through ministries like ministries of education), to be involved in puberty education and in promoting the factors that can positively impact MHM (for an overview of these factors see UNESCO, 2014: 31-32).

In addition to this report, a variety of international conferences have taken place over the past decade or so, and the discussions and outcomes of these conferences have been shared widely in publications and reports, some of which are cited here (e.g. the conferences co-hosted by Columbia University and UNICEF- see more below). The output of the global network surrounding MHM has been growing significantly in recent years.

5. Explaining the Momentum Surrounding the Adolescent Girl Agenda

What accounts for the momentum surrounding the adolescent girl agenda in recent years? How can we explain the significant increase in regional and global attention and commitments to adolescent girls in recent years?

Network and Actor Features: Organizations that are part of the network promoting the wellbeing and rights of adolescent girls are quite diverse in terms of their areas of focus. Membership in The Coalition for Adolescent Gils gives a sense of this diversity.[24] For example, some organizations, such as the Women's Refugee Commission, focus mainly on forced displacement, while others focus on sexual and reproductive health and rights (e.g. International Women's Health Coalition) or on reducing poverty and promoting social justice (e.g. CARE and Plan International) or serving people affected by humanitarian crises (e.g. International Rescue Committee). Some members are units within the United Nations (e.g. UN Women or UNESCO) or other intergovernmental organizations (e.g. World Bank – Adolescent Girls Initiative), while many others are nongovernmental organizations (e.g. Save the Children). Some members focus on program delivery, others focus on advocacy, and many combine both (interview # 4). This diversity very much reflects the multisectoral nature of the adolescent girl agenda and its relevance to the work of a variety of actors. There is a consensus around a multisectoral approach to the adolescent girl agenda (interview # 3; interview # 7).

As of January of 2018, Girls Not Brides had over 800 members in 95 countries working in different sectors, such as human rights and education. Varying significantly in size and focus (service delivery, research, advocacy), they are committed to the same basic principles. In addition to individual member organizations, there are also national Girls Not Brides partnerships in eight countries as well as a number of national coalitions, whose members work jointly within their domestic political context to end child marriage.[25] Some of the national partnerships are in high-prevalence countries in which the members of the partnership are focused on advocating for legislation that would end child marriage in their own country (interview # 6). The work of Girls Not Brides is coordinated and supported by an international secretariat.

In the case of Girls Not Brides, interviewees and campaign publications explain that the diversity of membership is intentional as Girls Not Brides is based on the premise that child marriage is a multisectoral issue (interview # 4, interview # 6, and interview # 7). Despite the significant diversity, the members can still speak with one voice and articulate a shared vision. They can build consensus around a shared understanding of child marriage and its root causes, a set of strategies to respond to child marriage, and a set of desired outcomes that will ultimately deliver the results that Girls Not Brides hopes to achieve. This broad-based consensus among members is the outcome of a process of consultation that generated Girls Not Brides' Theory of Change on Child Marriage.[26] The Theory of Change was developed through meetings, webinars, and

[24] A list of members of The Coalition for Adolescent Girls is available here: http://coalitionforadolescentgirls.org/community/members-2/ (accessed 22 November 2017).
[25] https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/about-girls-not-brides/national-partnerships/ (accessed 15 January 2018).
[26] An overview of *Girls Not Brides*' Theory of Change on Child Marriage is available here: https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/theory-change-child-marriage-girls-brides/ (accessed 14 January 2018). See also https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/A-Theory-of-Change-on-Child-Marriage-Background-Brief.pdf (accessed 14 January 2018).

input from a diversity of members informs the work of network members and represents a shared vision and an important advocacy tool (interview # 4 and interview # 7). The development of this consensus was perhaps possible because any organization or group that joins Girls Not Brides is required to commit to gender equality, empowerment of girls, and human rights principles that are at the core of Girls Not Brides' work and its framing of child marriage (interview #5; interview # 6; interview # 7). There is a general sense among interviewees that a child protection/welfare frame is more "limited" and would not be as powerful as a frame that focuses on gender equality and empowerment (interview # 6; see also interview # 3). Interviewees also reported that there is a consensus among network members around a rights framework (interview # 3); although different dimensions of child marriage might be emphasized in different contexts (interview # 7).

Many of these diverse actors had been working on the issue of child marriage long before Girls Not Brides was created. They were, however, isolated from one another and unaware of each other's work. Their work was not coordinated, and in the absence of coordination, there was no shared global agenda or vision for ending child marriage (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 24; see also interview # 4). There was much work at the grass-roots level, but the organizations involved in this work did not have a shared understanding of child marriage as a global issue (interview# 7). Networked collective action opened up opportunities for discussion and allowed them to develop a Theory of Change, engage in joint advocacy, build solidarity, and make the issue of child marriage more visible as a global issue (interview # 7). It also made it possible to frame child marriage in a way that links it with other global development priorities, such as promoting gender equality and sustainable development.

In addition, networked collective action has allowed smaller organizations to have a voice in global policy processes, such as the process of developing a set of SDGs. While larger international NGOs with lots of resources would have participated anyway, small organizations would not have had this opportunity had it not been for their network membership and coordinated advocacy facilitated by the network. Their voice, in turn, made the message of the larger organizations much more powerful (interview # 4). Additionally, the diversity of network membership means that the issue can be addressed comprehensively because each network member brings different strengths to the collective effort and has ties to different constituencies and stakeholders (interview # 5). Diversity also results in stronger positions, even though it takes time to reach consensus around a joint position (interview # 5; interview # 6) and develop a joint position on complex issues (interview # 7). Interviewees agree that the diversity of network membership has been a strength. While it may take some effort to develop joint policy positions in some instances, diversity allows issues to be addressed holistically and the resulting positions are stronger and reflective of a variety of perspectives (interview # 5 and interview # 6). All Girls Not Brides members must commit to the empowerment of girls and women and to the same minimum age for marriage (18 years), which does help members reach consensus around joint positions (interview # 7).

The network surrounding MHM is also quite diverse, bringing together researchers, NGOs, the private sector, UN agencies, and donors from the public health (especially the WASH), education, gender, and the sexual and reproductive health sectors (Sommer et al., 2015). This diversity of network membership has had positive impacts on raising the profile of MHM as an important public health issue and has allowed the network to draw on the strengths of different actors in different areas (Sommer et al., 2015: 1308-1309). The list of participants at the three MHM in Ten Conferences demonstrates the diversity of network membership. The conferences, co-hosted by Columbia University and UNICEF, brought together a range of different stakeholders, including university-based researchers, NGOs (e.g. WaterAid or Save the Children), public servants, donors, and the private sector (e.g. Proctor & Gamble), in addition to UNICEF staff and staff from other UN agencies and multilateral organizations (Columbia University and UNICEF, 2014: 11; Columbia University and UNICEF, 2015: 15; Columbia University and UNICEF, 2016: 20). While much of the work on MHM in schools was initially done in the WASH sector (Sommer et al., 2016), other sectors are now becoming more engaged in efforts to promote MHM in schools. For example, in addition to the sectors noted above, the human rights sector has also begun to highlight the human rights dimensions of MHM and its impact on a number of other human rights, including the right to health, the right to water and sanitation, and the right to education, which is particularly relevant for adolescent girls (Human Rights Watch & WASH United, 2017).

Working across sectors is not always easy, but there is recognition that the different sectors involved in global efforts surrounding MHM cannot address MHM without collaboration (interview # 9).

And while network members do not always develop the same message, they are all committed to the five priorities that were set for MHM in Ten's work between the years 2014 and 2024 (interview # 10). While these different actors were working on the issue of MHM in schools prior to the launch of MHM in Ten, they were not well-connected to one another and were not working strategically together. Bringing different actors and sectors together generated a lot of ideas (interview # 10).

As for the leadership and governance of Girls Not Brides, the network is non-hierarchical with no formal leadership to which members report, much like the non-hierarchical and fluid transnational feminist networks Moghadam describes (see above). The Girls Not Brides secretariat coordinates and facilitates network activities, but individual network members have quite a bit of autonomy as long as their work is consistent with the core principles that define Girls Not Brides' work. The Girls Not Brides secretariat, among other things, provides technical assistance to national partnerships and individual members upon request to strengthen them and build their capacity for political advocacy. It also facilitates opportunities for members to learn from one another and to showcase the work that they do (interview #7). The secretariat also engages with the global policy process to advocate for including child marriage in global human rights and sustainable development agendas and with the media, donors, and a variety of stakeholders to raise the visibility of child marriage as a global issue and secure the support of various stakeholders.[27] This structure has been effective in facilitating the network's activities.

As for the MHM network, the WASH sector still leads much of the work, although that is changing (interview # 8; interview # 10). The network is quite informal and has no formal governance structures (interview # 8; interview # 9). An individual leader played a central role in the MHM in Ten efforts (interview # 8; interview # 9). Marni Sommer, a professor of Sociomedical Sciences at the Mailman School of Public Health at Columbia University, has spearheaded the MHM in Ten movement.[28] As a Peace Corps volunteer in Eritrea in the 1990s, Sommer observed that many girls could not manage their menstruation in schools because of the lack of facilities and resources and therefore dropped out as they reached puberty. Upon returning to the United States, Sommer pursued graduate degrees in nursing and public health, conducting her dissertation research in Tanzania on the topic of how puberty could disrupt girls' education and their transition into adulthood. Sommer then also created the Girl's Book Project, "a unique guide for teaching 10-14-year-old girls … about their changing bodies,"[29] for girls in Tanzania. Its success led to the creation of Grow and Know, an organization whose mission is "To empower young girls and boys to reach their potential through improved education and preparation for life,"[30] and to adapt the original puberty book and make it available to girls and boys in different countries. Partnering with the NIKE Foundation, two UN agencies (the United Nations Population Fund & UNICEF), and NGOs, Grow and Know has disseminated over a million copies of the puberty books, and their content is being adapted for distribution in even more countries.[31] Sommer's role is an interesting example of how individual leadership and initiative can matter a great deal in terms of driving network emergence and effectiveness. Well-connected and knowledgeable, Sommer spearheaded much of the networked activity surrounding MHM in schools and did extensive research on the issue. Her role in the

[27] A brief overview of the secretariat's activities is available here: https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/about-girls-not-brides/national-partnerships/ (accessed 15 January 2018).
[28] Marni Sommer's faculty profile is available on the website of the Mailman School of Public Health at https://www.mailman.columbia.edu/people/our-faculty/ms2778 (accessed 17 May 2018).
[29] See https://www.womenstrong.org/stories/171-womenstrongwarrior-spotlight-dr-marni-sommer (accessed 20 February 2018).
[30] See http://growandknow.org/our_mission.html (accessed 20 February 2018).
[31] This overview of Sommer's work pertaining to puberty education is based on her profile featured in 2017 on the *WomenStrong International* website at https://www.womenstrong.org/stories/171-womenstrongwarrior-spotlight-dr-marni-sommer (accessed 20 February 2018).

network provides an example of the significance of skilled leadership in network emergence and effectiveness.

Individual leadership and initiative by UNICEF staff members have also been crucial, both for launching MHM in Ten and for conducting research on MHM. UNICEF and WHO staff (together with some donors) also provided critical leadership for efforts to include MHM in the SDGs, which ultimately resulted in an international definition of MHM (interview # 10). Dynamic social entrepreneurs working to make MHM products more available and accessible also played a role in drawing attention to MHM, for example through social media (interview #10).

Finally, as discussed above, the frames used by both Girls Not Brides and the MHM network emphasize empowerment. Both networks ultimately seek to empower women with more autonomy, control over their lives, and educational and other opportunities. These frames provide shared understandings of the issues at hand, identify feasible approaches, solutions and interventions, and outline plans of action. Additionally, they also provide a compelling rationale for action, highlighting the potential of the adolescent girl agenda to catalyze human development, and connecting it to key international priority areas.

The Policy Environment: Funding for the adolescent girl agenda is available from different sources. The Girls Not Brides secretariat is funded by a number of governments and foundations (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 34-37).[32] In addition to funding for the Girls Not Brides secretariat, donors have also funded UN agencies working to end child marriage, large NGOs, as well as small community-based organizations (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 34-37). Other networks working on issues that affect girls include the Coalition for Adolescent Girls. The Coalition for Adolescent Girls and other related networks have been funded by different donors, which may include the NIKE Foundation, the UN Foundation, the Summit Foundation, and the Packard Foundation (interview #1; interview # 5). There is also some evidence that some donors had an interest in bringing disparate groups (e.g. groups working on issues like education, poverty, HIV/AIDS, and other issues affecting adolescent girls) together, and by doing so, they helped overcome some of the silos that separated these groups as they helped foster collaboration among their grantees (interview #1). This is indicative of the potential of the policy environment to shape network emergence and features.

The overall policy environment in recent years has been more favorable to the inclusion of adolescent girls than ever before. For example, the process of negotiating the SDGs intentionally sought to address the gaps left by the MDGs, and includes 11 mentions of girls across the 17 goals (interview # 5). The SDG process created a window of opportunity for global civil society groups to lobby the international community to address child marriage explicitly in the SDGs (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 14-15). The process of developing a set of 17 SDGs was particularly significant compared to other global processes because it was inclusive and designed to engage stakeholders in meaningful ways (interview # 1).

Allies and champions include a number of prominent individuals as well as a number of governments. Girls Not Brides was founded by the Elders, some of whose members, including Archbishop Desmond Tutu and Graca Machel, continue to be champions of the global effort to end child marriage.[33] A number of governments have also provided significant financial and political support to the global effort to end child marriage, including donor governments like the governments of Canada, The Netherlands, and The UK as well as governments of high-prevalence countries, such as Ghana and Zambia as well as Malawi and Niger (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 13, 35, and 36; Interview # 1; interview # 7). First ladies in some countries in Africa have also been champions of ending child marriage (interview #2). For foreign policy initiatives to end child marriage, such as the United States Global Strategy to Empower Adolescent Girls, allies and champions among civil servants can play important roles (interview # 5).

While interviewees report that there is no strong organized opposition (interview # 7), there are concerns that there are conservative forces that are seeking to roll back some of the gains made. For example, there are

[32] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/about-girls-not-brides/governance/#how_are_we_funded (accessed 24 December 2017).
[33] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/about-girls-not-brides/our-champions.

concerns about the rise of fundamentalism (Girls Not Brides, 2016: 29; see also interview # 4). In addition, there have been some setbacks in a few countries where policy or laws have been amended in ways that could make it more difficult to effectively address child marriage (e.g. Bangladesh).[34]

Issues impacting adolescent girls were slow to gain attention as they were perceived to be politically difficult issues, especially because of their relevance to issues of empowerment and the sexuality of adolescent girls (interview # 2). In general, however, child marriage is less likely to provoke as much opposition as sexual and reproductive health and rights, which are much more contentious and controversial (interview #1; interview # 7). Addressing child marriage, therefore, provides a different avenue for addressing some of the more controversial global public health issues, such as sexuality education and reproductive health services for girls, as ending child marriage requires that these more controversial issues be also addressed (interview # 1; see also interview # 6).

As for MHM, organizations working to implement MHM programs at the national and community levels may sometimes face resistance and pushback, as many people around the world are uncomfortable with addressing MHM publicly (interview # 8; interview # 9). MHM work does not receive much funding, but funding is available from some governments (e.g. the government of The Netherlands) as well as from corporations, such as Kimberly-Clark and Proctor & Gamble (interview # 8). In addition, individual donors have made important contributions. While the issue of MHM was not visible to them, once it was brought to their attention it resonated with them (interview # 8). Allies include governments like the government of Kenya, which has expressed commitment to providing girls with pads, as well as the government of Tanzania, which amended school curricula to include MHM (interview # 8). Much like child marriage, practitioners have found that MHM has been an avenue for addressing more controversial issues, such as sexual and reproductive health and rights (interview # 9).

The policy environment for addressing MHM has been quite favorable. As the international community has made very significant progress in achieving universal enrollment in primary education, there has been more attention given to ensuring that girls will continue their education beyond the primary level. As attention began to focus on how to facilitate the transition from primary to secondary education for girls, MHM emerged as a potential barrier, which has raised the salience of the issue (interview # 9).

Issue Characteristics: Adolescent girls represent an easily identifiable population whose vulnerability is relatable and can elicit a lot of sympathy, making their circumstances amenable to and their voices effective in global advocacy. Combined with compelling evidence pertaining to the severity and tractability of issues affecting adolescent girls, this can help explain the emergence and effectiveness to date of the networks focusing on child marriage and MHM.

The severity of child marriage is well established. Not only is child marriage quite prevalent in many societies, its impacts are far-reaching and not limited to the children directly affected. The broader ramifications of high rates of child marriage and their impacts on development and poverty reduction are such, that advocates have made a strong case that many development goals cannot be realized unless and until the international community addresses child marriage. For example, one interviewee reported that while development professionals believe that there are no silver bullets in development, there is some recognition that ending child marriage is as close as we come to a silver bullet (interview # 5). Another interviewee noted that it is now understood that child marriage can be the "linchpin" for addressing issues such as education or sexual and reproductive health and rights (interview # 6). More generally, another interviewee noted that the recent momentum around the adolescent girl agenda is the result of a growing realization that reducing poverty and inequality will require addressing the needs of girls (interview # 3).

The literature produced by global civil society groups that are part of the adolescent girl network confirms this view as it emphasizes the virtuous cycles that ending child marriage and empowering and investing in girls could trigger (see the overview of the adolescent girls agenda above). The growing evidence and

[34] See https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/2017-review-6-signs-made-progress-towards-ending-child-marriage/ (accessed 24 December 2017).

expanding data about different aspects of the adolescent girl agenda were critical in establishing both the scope and magnitude of issues and problems that affect adolescent girls (i.e. severity) as well as identifying interventions can be effective in responding to these issues (i.e. tractability). The evidence-based nature of advocacy was important in growing the salience of the adolescent girl agenda and creating momentum around it as a policy issue (interview # 2; interview # 3; interview # 6; interview # 8). While it is not entirely clear what interventions will end child marriage, there is data about the drivers and effects of child marriage (interview # 6). It is now also clear that sector-specific interventions, such as interventions in the education sector, need to be combined in comprehensive responses to child marriage because any single intervention will not be on its own sufficient to bring about an end to child marriage (interview 6). There is still a need for more longitudinal research on comprehensive approaches to end child marriage, as well as a need to integrate research, advocacy, and program monitoring and evaluation (interview # 6).

Similarly, while there is still much research to be done and data to be collected about MHM, the number of girls affected by poor MHM, and the kind of interventions that will address poor MHM and its impacts, the research that is already available has generated enough evidence to catalyze action (interview # 8; interview #9; interview # 10). For example, several approaches and interventions have been identified to address the issue of MHM, particularly in schools. As noted above, a UNESCO report (2014) on puberty education and MHM has identified a number of different interventions that can be implemented in education systems to improve MHM in school settings. The report's recommendations encompass a range of different areas, including curricular changes, facilities improvements, and teacher training. The recommendations included in the report are comprehensive and address the different dimensions of MHM, including the public health aspects of MHM as well as the social and cultural norms surrounding menstruation. Practitioners involved in improving MHM and access to WASH services have also identified other approaches and interventions that can help address the challenges of MHM. In addition to disseminating accurate and scientific information about menstruation through various avenues and channels to shift social norms and taboos surrounding menstruation, practitioners call for curricular and educational resources that educate girls, boys, teachers, and others about menstruation, for better access to WASH facilities that are suitable for MHM, and for collaboration with the private sector and social enterprises to ensure greater access to menstrual health products (Saywell & Gruer 2017). While there are still major gaps in the available data and research, there has been much more data generated and more peer-reviewed research published in the past five to ten years that has provided a solid foundation for advocacy and programming in the area of MHM (interview #10). Sharing any newly available data, research, and evidence widely has been critical in terms of advancing the MHM agenda (interview # 9).

The adolescent girl agenda also shows that giving girls a voice and opportunities to participate in advocacy efforts can be really important. Girls Not Brides has sought to magnify girls' voices and to engage youth, and with support from Girls Not Brides, girls have spoken at a variety of venues, including at side events of the Commission on the Status of Women and at Girls Not Brides events (interview # 4; see also interview # 5, interview # 6, and interview # 7). This involvement of girls is important because as two interviewees have explained, girls have legitimacy and credibility and can engage decision-makers emotionally (interview # 4). and partly through their testimonials help "bring things from abstract to concrete" (interview #1).

Similarly, Sommer et al. report that qualitative, participatory research that documented and told girls' stories and/or allowed girls to publish their personal narratives was important in framing MHM as a public issue that needed the attention of policymakers and public institutions like schools (Sommer et al., 2015: 1306, 1307, and 1309). Girls are not active participants in global policy spaces in which MHM is addressed, but they are very involved in program delivery at the community-level (interview # 8). While they do not attend the MHM in Ten conference, and while MHM in Ten participants are keenly aware of their absence from global spaces (interview # 9), most MHM in Ten participants work directly with girls (interview # 10). The voices of girls (and those of their teachers, mothers, and others in their communities) are also very much represented in the research (interview # 9).

6. Conclusion

The purpose of this article is to document the activities of two global health networks that have emerged around child marriage and MHM in school settings and provide a theoretically informed account of their emergence and their effectiveness. In doing so, this article also contributes to additional case studies informed by the GHAPP framework. This article presents findings that dovetail with the findings and conclusions of the GHAPP, but also contributes a few additional insights that are relevant to social movement research.

First, rather than viewing network emergence and effectiveness as the result of the same variables, the case of Girls Not Brides provides evidence that network emergence may facilitate the development of some of the factors that allow networks to be effective. For example, networked activity may facilitate the development of shared frames and give an issue the kind of visibility that can generate funding. Networked activity may be greater than the sum of its individual members' activities, catalyzing action and change that would not be possible without a network. In addition, the policy environment may have an impact on network emergence and features as donors may have some influence on network emergence and composition. This might indicate that different variables may matter at different times or in different ways or that not all variables are equally important for network emergence and effectiveness, which the framework that informs the GHAPP does acknowledge (see Shiffman et al., 2016a: i10).

Second, it may be more feasible and effective to address issues pertaining to girls' empowerment and sexual and reproductive health and rights when they are addressed by diverse networks involving actors whose work focuses on a variety of different issues. Embedding these politically more sensitive public health issues in campaigns that focus on comprehensively addressing broader sustainable development issues can make them easier to address. In other words, network diversity may be important not only for addressing issues comprehensively, but for also making progress in tackling issues that are more sensitive in nature. Similarly, network diversity also means that a network can do a variety of different tasks well, including research and grass-roots-level outreach and engagement. This finding has implications for research on transnational feminist networks and social movement coalitions and highlights the importance of the diversity of coalition membership for tackling difficult issues. The findings of this article also suggest that non-hierarchical governance structures and loose coalitions that give autonomy to members might be a helpful way to leverage diversity, which also has implications for social movement coalitions.

Third, research and data have been really critical, perhaps more so than some of the other variables the framework identifies. The two issues this article focuses on are not new, but there has been much more international activity surrounding them in recent years. When asked about the reasons for this heightened attention to these issues, respondents involved with the two networks researched here strongly emphasized new knowledge and new data as critical in moving their agendas forward. At the same time, it is clear from the discussion above that it is not necessary to have extensive evidence and propose solutions that are based on wide-ranging data about the kinds of interventions that can be effective. In both of the units studied here, especially in the case of MHM, there are still significant gaps in the available data. But despite the limited data, the two networks have been able to produce important outputs that have helped raise awareness of child marriage and MHM, and advocacy surrounding child marriage has had significant policy consequences. The findings discussed here suggest that leadership, network diversity, a compelling narrative or frame that defines the way an issue is viewed and resonates with key global priorities and norms (in the two networks discussed here priorities and norms surrounding gender and sustainable development), in conjunction with some evidence showing the extent and impacts of the problem (i.e. its severity) and suggesting potential politically feasible solutions that enjoy a broad-based consensus (i.e. its tractability) is sufficient to catalyze action, gain international attention, and secure important policy commitments, even when much more research is needed to understand the kind of policy responses that will bring about significant long-term change. These findings are consistent with GHAPP's conclusions that highlight the particular significance of leadership, severity, and tractability for network emergence (Shiffman et al., 2016a: i10). They also have implications for the literature on social movement coalitions and highlight the significance of framing. Developing coherent frames in a diverse coalition may be challenging, but it can have significant rewards.

Finally, the article helps bridge the gap between the GHAPP and social movement research in ways that contribute to both bodies of literature. Much like the networks Moghadam studies in her seminal book about transnational feminist networks, my analysis of two global health networks can also generate findings that are relevant to the literature on transnational social movements and global civil society and the literature on women's movements and organizations (Moghadam, 2005: 2-3). Similarly, since "coalitions are part of the network of individuals and organizations that comprise a social movement" (Van Dyke & Amos, 2017: N.PAG), the findings of this research are important and relevant to our understanding of social movement coalitions. Social movement coalitions, whose membership includes international NGOs, local groups, and intergovernmental actors, bring about "joint cooperative action while distinct organizational identities and structures remain intact" (McCammon & Moon, 2015: 327). This is also true for global health networks. The research on coalitions has focused on two areas: the factors that facilitate or impede coalition formation, and the outcomes of coalitions (McCammon & Moon, 2015). So has the GHAPP, as discussed above. These areas of research in social movement studies have raised a number of questions that are not yet fully understood (McCammon & Moon, 2015), including the political outcomes of coalition formation (McCammon & Moon, 2015: 333). The GHAPP framework can therefore help close some of these gaps in our knowledge.

The research presented here also points to important questions for future research. First, since the two networks analyzed here have emerged relatively recently, there will be future opportunities to examine their effectiveness in terms of impact. For example, what is (and will be) the impact of the action plans, resolutions, and funding commitments on reducing the prevalence of child marriage? Similarly, what is (and will be) the impact of the MHM in Ten initiative on WASH in schools? Second, the GHAPP framework posits that network diversity is a potential asset, but also a potential liability. Given the diversity of many global networks that focus on a variety of human rights and sustainable development issues, it would be interesting and important to study the process by which diversity is dealt with. How can consensus be built around a collective action frame in highly diverse networks? What are the processes and arrangements that can make the diversity of global networks an asset that can help networks be effective? Addressing these questions can help us generate deeper insights into how networks can be intentionally governed in ways that realize the potential of network diversity to make a network effective.

Appendix – List of Interviews

Interview # 1: Phone interview with staff member of a global research institute, April 5th, 2017

Interview # 2: Phone interview with Miriam Temin, Population Council, May 5th, 2017

Interview # 3: Phone interview with Kathy Hall, Summit Foundation, May 17th, 2017

Interview # 4: Phone interview with individual familiar with Girls Not Brides, May 19th, 2017

Interview # 5: Phone interview with Rachel Clement, International Center for Research on Women and Girls Not Brides USA, November 22nd, 2017 (Clement provided exact wording for some of the information attributed to her)

Interview # 6: Phone interview with Gayatri Patel, CARE USA and Girls Not Brides USA, December 8th, 2017

Interview # 7: Phone interview with Matilda Branson and Zoe Birchall, Girls Not Brides, December 14th, 2017

Interview # 8: Phone interview with Caitlin Gruer, Plan USA, March 2nd, 2018

Interview #9: Phone interview with NGO staff member, March 5th, 2018

Interview # 10: Phone interview with MHM in Ten participant, May 2nd, 2018

References

Baxter, P. & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative Case Study Methodology: Study Design and Implementation for Novice Researchers. *The Qualitative Report,* 13(4), 544-559.

Benzian, H., Monse, B., Belizario, V., Schratz, A., Sahin, M. & Helderman, W. (2012). Public health in action: effective school health needs renewed international attention. *Global Health Action,* 5, 1-3.

Branson, M. (2017, February 8). UN General Assembly Adopts 2nd Resolution on Child, Early and Forced Marriage. Retrieved February 25, 2017, from Girls Not Brides website: http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/un-general-assembly-adopts-2nd-resolution-child-early-forced-marriage/

Caron , C. M. & Margolin, S. A. (2015). Rescuing Girls, Investing in Girls: A Critique of Development Fantasies. *Journal of International Development,* 27(7), 881-897.

Columbia University Mailman Public Health and UNICEF. (2014, October). MHM in Ten: Advancing the MHM Agenda in WASH in Schools. Retrieved January 13, 2018, from Static1 Square Space website: https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5988738af9a61e3bd699b5e4/t/5988f0f4e6f2e1fa708fedc1/1502146981926/2014+MHM+in+Ten+Meeting+Report.pdf

Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health and UNICEF. (2016, October). MHM in Ten: Advancing the MHM Agenda in Schools. Retrieved January 13, 2018, from Static1 Square Space website: https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5988738af9a61e3bd699b5e4/t/5988f10f6a49634eccfc27e0/1502146831786/2016+MHM+in+Ten+Meeting+Report.pdf

Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health UNICEF. (2015, October). MHM in Ten: Advancing the MHM Agenda in WASH in Schools. Retrieved January 13, 2018, from Static1 Square Space website: https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5988738af9a61e3bd699b5e4/t/5988f102414fb53a1f946288/1502146819484/2015+MHM+in+Ten+Meeting+Report.pdf

Croll, E. J. (2006). From the Girl Child to Girls' Rights. *Third World Quarterly,* 27(7), 1285-1297.

Davis, A., Postles, C. & Rosa, G. (2013). A girl's right to say no to marriage: Working to end child marriage and keep girls in school. Woking: Plan International.

Gerring, J. (2004). What is a Case Study and What Is It Good For? *American Political Science Review,* 98(2), 341-354.

Girls Not Brides. (2016). It Takes a Movement: Reflecting on Five Years of Progress Towards Ending Child Marriage. Retrieved November 26, 2017, from Girls Not Brides website: https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/resource-centre/it-takes-a-movement/

Human Rights Watch and WASH United. (2017). Understanding Menstrual Hygiene Management & Human Rights. Retrieved February 2, 2018, from Menstrual Hygiene Day website: http://menstrualhygieneday.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/WU-HRW_mhm_practitioner_guide_2017.pdf

Independent Commission for Aid Impact. (2012). Girl Hub: a DFID and NIKE Foundation Initiative. Retrieved March 12, 2017, from Icai.independent.gov.uk website: https://icai.independent.gov.uk/wp-content/uploads/ICAI-Girl-Hub-Final-Report_P1-52.pdf

Jolly, R., Emmerij, L. & Weiss, T. G. (2009). UN Ideas That Changed the World. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Koffman, O. & Gill, R. (2013). The revolution will be led by a 12-year-old girl': Girl Power and Global Biopolitics. *Feminist Review,* 105, 83-102.

McCammon , H. J. & Moon, M. (2015). Social Movement Coalitions. In D. Porta, & M. Diani, The Oxford Handbook of Social Movements (pp. 326-339). Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

Mégret, F. (2008). The Disabilities Convention: Human Rights of Persons with Disabilities or Disability Rights? *Human Rights Quarterly,* 30(2), 494-516.

Moghadam, V. M. (2015). Transnational Feminist Activism and Movement Building. In W. Harcourt, & R. Baksh, The Oxford Handbook of Transnational Feminist Movements (pp. 53-81). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Moghadam, V. M. (2005). Globalizing Women. Transnational Feminist Networks. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Saywell, D. & Gruer, C. (2017). Opinion: 4 ways to address menstrual stigmas, taboos and discrimination. Retrieved February 19, 2018, from Devex website: https://www.devex.com/news/opinion-4-ways-to-address-menstrual-stigmas-taboos-and-discrimination-89470

Shiffman , J., Quissell, K., Schmitz, H. P., Pelletier, D. L., Smith, S. L., Berlan, D., Quissell, K., Gneiting, U., Slyke, D. V., Mergel, I., Rodriguez, M. & Walt, G. (2016a). A Framework on the Emergence and Effectiveness of Global Health Networks. *Health Policy and Planning,* 31(1), i3-i16.

Shiffman, J. (2016). Networks and global health governance: Introductory editorial for Health Policy and Planning supplement on the Emergence and Effectiveness of Global Health Networks. *Health Policy and Planning,* 31(1), i1-i2.

Shiffman, J., Berlan, D., Schmitz, H. P., Smith, S. L., Quissell, K., Gneiting, U. & Pelletier, D. (2016b). The Emergence and Effectiveness of Global Health Networks: Findings and Future Research. *Health Policy and Planning,* 31(1), i110-i123.

Smith, J. (2013). Transnational social movements. In D. A. Snow, D. Porta, B. Klanderman, & D. McAdam, The Wiley-Blackwell Encyclopedia of Social and Political Movements. Blackwell Publishing Ltd. Retrieved July 16, 2018, from https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/9780470674871.wbespm454

Sommer , M. & Sahin, M. (2013). Overcoming the Taboo. Advancing the Global Agenda for Menstrual Hygiene Management for Schoolgirls. *American Journal of Public Health,* 103(9), 1556-1559.

Sommer, M., Caruso, B. A., Sahin, M., Calderon, T., Cavill, S., Mahon, T. & Phillips-Howard, P. A. (2016). A Time for Global Action: Addressing Girls' Menstrual Hygiene Management Needs in Schools. *PLOS Medicine,* 13(2).

Sommer, M., Hirsch, J. S., Nathanson, C. & Parker, R. G. (2015). Comfortably, Safely, and Without Shame: Defining Menstrual Hygiene Management as a Public Health Issue. *American Journal of Public Health,* 105(7), 1302-1311.

UNESCO. (2014). Puberty Education & Menstrual Hygiene Management. Retrieved February 2, 2018, from UNESCO website: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002267/226792e.pdf

UNFPA. (2014). Action for Adolescent Girls. Building the health, social and economic assets of adolescent girls, especially those at risk of child marriage. Retrieved January 16, 2017, from UNFPA website: http://www.unfpa.org/resources/unfpa's-action-adolescent-girls

United Nations Interagency Task Force on Adolescent Girls. (2009). Girl Power and Potential: A Joint Programming Framework for Fulfilling the Rights of Marginalized Adolescent Girls. Retrieved January 10, 2017, from UNFPA website: http://www.unfpa.org/publications/girl-power-and-potential

United States State Department. (n.d.). United States Global Strategy to Empower Adolescent Girls. Retrieved March 11, 2017.

Upreti, M. (2016). Ending Child Marriage in South Asia: A Regional Action Plan. Retrieved February 26, 2017, from Girls Not Brides website: http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/child-marriage-south-asia-regional-plan/

Van Dyke, N. & Amos, B. (2017). Social Movement Coalitions: Formation, Longevity, and Success. *Sociology Compass,* 11(7).

Zafar, O. (2014). First-Ever Panel at United Nations General Assembly Puts Child Marriage in the Spotlight. Retrieved February 26, 2017, from Girls Not Brides website: http://www.girlsnotbrides.org/first-ever-panel-united-nations-general-assembly-puts-child-marriage-spotlight/

Journal of Social and Development Sciences (JSDS)
Vol. 10, No. 1, March 2019 (ISSN 2221-1152)

Drivers of Savings Account Ownership Status: A Cross-Sectional Analysis from Ghana

Augustine Kwadwo Yeboah
Department of Banking and Finance, Ghana Baptist University College, Kumasi, Ghana
yeboagus@yahoo.com

Abstract: In view of the evidence that poor savings can inhibit investment decision by borrowers of surplus funds, and that countries with well-established and efficiently utilised financial services have considerably less poverty, the study examines factors influence saving account ownership in Ghana using econometric approach. We used empirical evidence with data sourced from informal market traders in selected major market centres in Ghana. Using probit regression analysis, the results suggest that financial educations, number of income-generating ventures engaged in by the market trader are major predictors of savings account ownership status. Other predictors include demographic characteristics such as gender, age, marital status and number of dependents. It is, therefore, recommended that banks and financial institutions should intensify financial education strategies to boost savings mobilization. Government's policy intervention should be directed towards informal sector enterprise development to the crowd in revenue in order to motivate decisions to save. Also, the National Board for Small Scale and informal Businesses in Ghana should intensify education on how to sustain diverse income generation ventures to fetch income from multiple sources in order to encourage behavioural intentions to save.

Keywords: *Savings account, cross-sectional analysis, probit regression analysis, informal market traders, Ghana*

1. Introduction

Well managed financial services play an enormous role in shaping the economic fortunes of nations. It has, therefore, been argued that countries with well-established and efficiently utilised financial services have considerably less poverty (Afoakwah, Annim, & Peprah, 2015). It has long been established that poor households in developing countries may benefit immensely from saving mobilization, particularly improved access to credit, the benefit of profitable investment prospects, consumption smoothing and insurance protection against emergencies (Zeller, 1999). In poor developing countries the mainstay of economic activities is predominantly the informal sector as the sector's contribution to growth prospects cannot be discounted (Musah, Bagah, & Wulifan, 2015). This notwithstanding, only 41% of the economically active adult population in poor developing countries have a bank account (Goldberg, 2014). Economically, poor saving habits can inhibit investment decision by borrowers of funds. The situation becomes more critical when investors desire to borrow is relatively large. The argument, therefore, is that by aggregating a large number of small saving deposits, financial intermediaries will be in a position to satisfy demands for large loans (Incoom, 2009). Again, promoting saving mobilization is important to enterprise development due to the availability of adequate capital to overcome credit constraints (Abebe, Yukichi, & Biruk, 2018). In spite of these inherent benefits connected to savings, in developing countries widespread poverty has precluded many to save (Karlan & Zinman, 2018).

These inconclusive revelations suggest that the potential inhibition factors which have stifled the efforts to save need thorough empirical investigation. Modigliani (1986) raised fundamental argument concerning the necessity of savings through the 'life cycle hypothesis'; suggesting that individuals try to smooth consumption by saving during the period of earning and draw down savings during retirement. The motivation to provide for anticipated future expenses, precautionary, enterprise and bequest motives are perceived to have characterised decisions to save. For many, the practical reasons why people save are to prepare for a possible financial crisis caused by illness, divorce, job loss and accident (Olson & DeFrain, 2000). Evidence, however, suggests that the poor benefits greatly from financial inclusion through savings yet, the proportion of households with a formal savings account is very low (Ackah & Asiamah, 2014). It has been argued that the rigidity that characterizes saving decision is partly attributed to non-removal of artificially low-interest rate on savings as nations advance towards financial liberalization (Todaro & Smith, 2009). Perhaps the attribution of low savings to interest rate and saving nexus is underpinned by the argument that higher interest rate on savings should crowd in more domestic savings and facilitate domestic fund mobilization by allocating more loanable funds.

Recent developments suggest that the financial market in Ghana is highly fragmented with only 5 to 6 percent of the population accessing services from the commercial banks (Basu et al., 2004) and 16 percent have access to an account with a financial intermediary (World, 2008). The ultimate decision to save by economic agents therefore, can be likened to inter-temporal resource allocation. For instance, it is argued that the decision to save encourages households' alternative consumption smoothing ability to adopt less current consumption for future consumption. In line with this argument, Gravelle and Rees (2004) submit that savings smooth out unanticipated vagaries in income flow and other economic shocks faced by economic agents. In spite of the efforts to ensure a sound financial system which encourages savings, it is perceived that barriers to savings exist for the poor thus, discouraging many informal business owners to save. The situation, particularly in Ghana is serious; since savings habits among the informal sector have been found to be depressing leading to wanton misery among the informal sector workers (Addai et al., 2017).

The relevance of this study is undoubtedly timely in the wake of the current circumstance of poorly managed income generation ventures by the informal sector workers, particularly informal market traders in Ghana. Again, the need for financial resource mobilization to resource deficit financial units with funds to invest and expand income generation ventures calls for a thorough investigation into underlying factors governing savings account ownership in Ghana. In spite of the growing evidence that savings and investment accumulated domestically facilitates the means of resourcing and aiding the growth of economic projects to fuel the engine of economic prosperity, poor savings habit has stifled the efforts to expand informal sector economic ventures in Ghana. Though, a number of studies have investigated savings habits the critical question of what influence savings account ownership status among individuals engaged in informal sector activities is not clear. Consequently, this study sought to examine social, economic and demographic factors influencing behavioural intentions to operate savings account. The rest of the paper is organized as follows: Section two is devoted to literature review. Section three covers the methodology and model specification, Section four deals with results and discussion and the final section presents conclusion and recommendations.

2. Literature Review

Theoretical Perspectives of Saving Behaviour: Although, the theoretical and empirical literature about drivers of savings has grown, evidence of the inclination to save has remained rare among informal sector workers in Ghana, particularly informal commercial market traders. To save is to set aside a certain amount of income for future use. The economic reason to save therefore is grounded on consumption smoothing due to anticipated future expenses. Thus, the ability to save is predominantly dependent on income available to households, firms and corporate entities. Theoretically, financing real consumption is dependent on current real disposable income (Keynes, 1936). This theoretical proposition by Keynes was anchored to the strong assumption that the marginal propensity to consume increases as income increases. This presupposes that with consumption and savings being dependent on current income, an increase in income could increase the capacity to save. This suggests that any economic opportunity that can increase income gives the individual the motivation to commit to savings habit.

Life-Cycle Theory of Saving Behavior: According to Ando and Modigliani (1963), one of the most significant motives for putting money aside is underpinned by the fundamental requirement to cater for future retirement. This assertion implies that young individuals in gainful employment start with low income and possibly low savings rates. As income rises in their middle ages so will their savings rise. According to the theory, retirement is associated with a fall in income and possibly a fall in consumption. This naturally makes current savings commitments important to smooth future consumption needs. In a clearer view, the exposition advanced by Keynes (1936) connecting savings, consumption and income stands to buttress the point underpinning the life-cycle theory. The idea about the causal link between income growth and saving growth is well established in the sense that with increasing income, the young will save more than the old so that income growth causes positive savings.

The Permanent Income Hypothesis of Saving Behaviour: The permanent income hypothesis provides a flexible framework for the study of consumption and savings. Theoretically, consumption is perceived to play a primary role in human life whereas saving acts in a passive residual character (Vosen, 2012). According to

Friedman (1957), Permanent Income Hypothesis (PIH) assumes that households consume a fraction of their permanent income and flexibly adjust savings to transitory income flows. Thus, it was grounded on the assumption that consumption was a continuous function of income. The strongest conviction underpinning this hypothesis; therefore, is that temporary income has no impact on permanent consumption behaviour of economic agents. Under this assertion, it was hypothesised that human capital, wealth, age and income distribution may prove as strong predictors of savings and consumption behaviour.

Empirical Literature Review: Drivers of the decision to save have remained varied and complex in nature. Kalan and Zinman (2018) examined price and control elasticity of demand for savings using bank randomization of potential clients and found minimal demand sensitivity and thus, price elasticity of saving is not significantly different from zero. The study approach is plausible; however examining saving account sensitivity could have been concurrently investigated with important socio-economic covariates driving saving account ownership among potential clients of banks. Rehman, Faridi and Bashir (2012) examined household savings behaviour in Pakistan with field data involving 293 respondents and found that spousal participation dependency rate, income and landholding drive saving behaviour. On the other hand, education, children education expenditure, family size and marital status significantly reduce savings behaviours among households. However, counterintuitive relationship between education and saving needs further empirical proof. An empirical study by Amu and Amu (2012) on saving behaviour of rural households in Ho Municipality of Volta Region of Ghana, the study found a low level of knowledge about savings among household heads; also, personal social and organizational limitations stifle the efforts of households to save. The findings of the study sound appealing; however, limiting the study of households' saving behaviour to rural areas can affect the generalizations of an empirical study of this nature.

Associating to this is a study by Arent (2012) which empirically investigated expectation and saving behaviour and found that a higher unemployment expectation strongly decreases savings. The study, however, failed to establish a clear relationship between future income expectations; a strong, compelling factor in savings decisions and savings behaviours among households. Dupas and Robinson (2013) examined saving constraints and microenterprise development in Kenya. Using a sample of 392 individuals, the study found that greater proportion of micro-entrepreneurs in rural Kenya face major savings constraints notably awareness about the need to save, social pressure to share limited resources and inaccessibility to banking services. On the basis of these findings, the study suggests the extension of banking services to the doorsteps of potential savers to increase the number of individuals who want to save. This suggestion sounds quite appealing, however, the study failed to emphasize possible limitation created by poor income generation and environmental factors that inhibit the motivation to save out of low-incomes. In a related study in Ghana, Osei-Assibey (2013) investigated the effect of sources of start-up finance on micro and small enterprises productivity growth. Using non-farm household enterprise survey data, the study found debt finance as a major predictor of productivity growth; whereas finance from donations and charity impact negatively on firm productivity growth. The findings imply that availability and accessibility to surplus funds as a source of borrowing could have an enormous impact on business prospects of small scale and informal enterprises.

However, the emphasis on other important socio-economic governing factors and how they impact on micro and small business productivity growth did not feature prominently in the study. As part of the efforts to ascertain patronage of banking services, Yee-Kwong (1996) in a survey of college students in Hong Kong examined banking services for young intellectuals and found out that savings account constituted the most common type of bank account owned by college students. Though the study sought to emphasize awareness and understanding as factors which inform prospective savers; it did not clearly examine those factors to support the revelation of significant saving behaviour by prospective savers. Related to this is a study by Owusu-Bempah, Bennet, Amoako and Frimpong (2013), which examined the importance of the informal sector of Ghana to savings and loan companies. The study found the informal sector paramount in contributing to the development of savings and loan companies. The implication of contributing to the growth of savings and loan companies via saving mobilization made possible through savings account ownership and other related factors were not dealt with in the study. In an empirical study by Addai, Adjei and Boadi (2017), the study investigated savings habit among individuals in the informal sector. Using 120 sampled respondents the probit regression analysis revealed that the main inhibiting factor affecting motivation to save was low-income among individuals in the informal economy.

The study thus, recommends intervention via education to enhance income earning capacities of informal sector operators. However, the need to adopt a comprehensive approach to tackle low-income levels may go beyond the bounds of education. So other socio-economic factors could have been given prominence in the study. In another close study, Abdul Mumin, Razak and Domanban (2013) examined household heads decision to save in the Bole District of Ghana. Using data from 120 household heads, the logistics regression analysis revealed educational status, the value of assets shock to household head and commitment to financial institutions as major predictors of saving behaviour of households. Though the revelation from the study sounds pleasing; one is concerned about the specific measurement criteria used for some of the variables such as shock to the household head and commitment to financial institutions. Failure to address these has downside implications for the study. Karlan, Ratan and Zinman (2014) on review of savings by the poor and for the poor found development of efficient innovations and interventions that underpin awareness and understanding of saving decisions of households and individuals as surest routes to savings motivation by the poor. The study further suggests a focus on potential barriers to savings. The background information provided by the study sounds appropriate; however specific focus variables that connect and govern savings decisions are not clear in the analysis of the study.

In a related empirical study, Dziwornu and Anagba (2014) examined factors influencing saving decision among small business owners in Ghana. Using data from 304 small business owners, the results revealed that on the average, the respondents save GH¢16.00 daily and interest on savings, knowledge about savings, available saving schemes to join and motive about future purchase were the driving forces of the decision to save. The study findings are quite revealing; however, socio-economic and other demographic factors that shape perception and decision to save were not given prominence in the study. Tandoh and Tandoh (2015) investigated the dynamics of a savings culture in Ghana and found high savings culture among respondents but, respondents preferred to save more for the future rather than for current consumption. Though the study reveals savings preference of respondents the practical reason for not opting for current savings but rather saving for the future was not clear. Schaner (2016) used field experiment data to examine how temporary incentives to save affect long-term economic outcomes in rural Kenya. The study found that the absolute value of savings incentive does not matter the delivery mode but motivating individuals to own bank account impacts strongly on enterprise development and income. The study's outcome is important, particularly it has implications for poor emerging economies with low saving mobilization. However, the need to examine fundamental social and economic factors motivating saving among the poor is paramount, particularly among households engaged in informal sector activities.

3. Data Source, Sampling Procedure and Method of Analysis

To ensure reliable survey results, we sampled economically active informal market traders from six selected major market centres from the north, middle and coastal zones of Ghana. In selecting the markets, we employed a multi-stage cluster sampling technique given consideration to size, development and vibrancy of market centres across the country. Thus, the study areas were delineated into zones involving a cluster of market centres. In each zone, we identified four (4) main major clusters of market centres; then two (2) most vibrant market centres were selected from each cluster. In the northern zone, for instance, we selected markets to include Bolgatanga old market and Tamale central market. Others were Sunyani main market and Kumasi central market in the middle zone; then Takoradi market circle and Kaneshie market complex, all in the coastal zone of Ghana. The respondents were then selected by convenience from the market centres through face-to-face interview due to easy accessibility of the market participants.

The data was obtained from 612 informal market sellers who conduct daily trading activities in the selected markets centres. The survey data contains information on features such as savings account ownership status, the number of dependents, number of income-generating ventures owned by the respondent as at the time of the study, financial education and number of years of market trading experience. We also collected information on respondent's basic demographic characteristics such as gender, age and marital status. The basis of this method is grounded on the neoclassical economic theory of choice, which assumes that economic agents such as individual decision makers are rational beings who respond to certain broad predictors of human behavior; namely social and economic specific factors, which may act as opportunities or constraints.

Therefore, soliciting for socio-economic specific data from economic agents demands a systematic approach in order to ascertain the level of accuracy of the data gathering process.

Theoretically, an individual's utility (satisfaction) is hypothesized to be a function of consumption and saving (Addai et al., 2017). Thus, the life-cycle and the permanent income hypotheses have emphasized long-term consumption motives in support of savings decision. Both theories have been emphasized in this study. In view of this, the question of whether empirical support can be offered through field survey data underpins the discourse of this study.

The Model and Estimation Technique: Employing a probit regression model, we specify a binary outcome model for a respondent's ownership of savings account or otherwise. A binary probit model relates the probability of the event occurring to the probability of the event not occurring. This follows a specification of a simple binary probit model as:

$y_i^* = \boldsymbol{x_i}\beta + \varepsilon$

Where, y takes the value one ($y = 1$), if a commercial market trader owns and operates saving account with a bank and zero ($y = 0$) otherwise. Thus, the dichotomous dependent variable y is not directly observed. If the observed binary outcome variable (Y) is an expression of whether or not the person owns and operates savings account or not, then, for such a binary outcome, the underlying latent propensity or desire to save is given by y^*. Therefore, when a person's desire to save is greater than zero ($y^* > 0$) then a person has a positive decision towards saving account ownership. In this light, the definition of a binary response variable can be expressed as follows:

$$Y_i = \begin{cases} 1 \; If \; y^* > 0 \\ 0 \; If \; y^* \leq 0 \end{cases}$$

Thus, the underlying unobservable latent dichotomous outcome (y^*) defines the generalized form of the probit regression model. Thus, variable $\boldsymbol{y}^*$ is an unobserved dichotomous response variable, $\boldsymbol{x_i}$ is a vector of explanatory variables, $\boldsymbol{\beta}$ represents parameters to be estimated and $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}$ is the disturbance term.

Theoretically, when the outcome response variable Y is binary with values 0 and 1, the specification of the probit equation assumes the following form:

$p = \Pr(Y = 0) = K + (1 - K)F(x'\beta)$

Where; $\boldsymbol{x}$ a vector of explanatory variables, $\boldsymbol{\beta}$ is a vector of parameter estimates, p is a probability of a response, K is a threshold response rate and $\boldsymbol{F}$ a cumulative distribution function. Following this generalized form, the empirical probit model is specified as:

$p = \Pr\,(S_accountOwn = 1|x_i) = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \beta_4 X_4 + \beta_5 X_5 + \beta_6 X_6 + \beta_7 X_7 + \varepsilon_i$

Where:

$S_accountOwn$ = is savings account ownership status

X_1= gender of the respondent

X_2= the age of the respondent

X_3 = Marital status of the respondent

X_4= Number of dependents

X_5= Number of income generating ventures owned

X_6= Financial education

X_7=Years of market trading experience

4. Results and Discussion

This section of the study discusses the results obtained from the probit regression model. Prior to the discussion of the results, Table 1 presents the definition and measurement of the variable used in the empirical probit regression model and a priori signs. As shown in Table 1, the variable labelled $S_accountOwn$ is a binary response variable, which assumes the value one (1) if the respondent owns a savings account with a bank or any financial institution and zero (0) otherwise. The variable ***Gender*** ($\boldsymbol{X_1}$) describes whether the respondent is a female or a male. It assumes the value one (1) if the respondent is a female and zero (0) otherwise. Variable ***Age*** ($\boldsymbol{X_2}$) is a continuous variable, which measures the respondent's age in years. Also, the variable ***marital status*** ($\boldsymbol{X_3}$) describes current marital status of a respondent and it is captured as a categorical variable with categories including single, married, divorced and widowed; with

widowed used for the analysis as the reference category. ***Dependents*** ($\boldsymbol{X_4}$) measure the number of dependent members under the support the respondent. Again, the variable ***income generating ventures*** ($\boldsymbol{X_5}$) denotes number of income receiving business transactions engaged in by the respondent as at the time of the study.

Further, the variable labelled ***financial education*** ($\boldsymbol{X_6}$) is a dummy variable which measures whether a market trader has received financial education from financial service providers since the respondent's engagement in the market trading activities or otherwise. It takes the value one (1) if the respondent has financial education from financial service providers and zero (0) otherwise. Finally, as shown in Table 1, the variable captured as **years of market experience** ($\boldsymbol{X_7}$) is a measure of number of years that the market trader has engaged in the market trading activities. It is presumed that years of market experience has implication for the respondent overall financial planning and decision, particularly in planning for future uncertainties, and thus, individuals who have sustained their market businesses for some time may opt for savings to solidify business continuity. Hence, an increase in number of years in business is expected to have positive impact on savings account ownership.

Table 1: Definition, Measurement of Variables in the Probit Model and a Priori Signs

Variable	Description	Measurement	a priori signs
Gender (X_1)	Gender of the respondent	1, if female, and 0 male	$-/+$
Age (X_2)	The age of the respondent	Number of years	$-$
Marital Status (X_3) *Single* *Married* *Divorced* *Widowed*	Current marital status	a categorical variable	$-/+$
Dependents (X_4)	Family members who rely on the respondent for support	Number of dependents	$-$
Income generating ventures (X_5)	Income generating activities engaged in by a respondent	Number of income generating activities	$+$
Financial education(X_6)	Respondent's engagement in financial education	1, if the respondent has received any form of financial education since engaging in business, and 0 otherwise	$+$
Years of market experience (X_7)	Years that the respondent has been in market business	Number of years	$+$

Source: Field survey data August, 2015

The next section presents the probit regression results shown in Table 2. The section follows with discussion of results, major conclusions and implications drawn from the discussion. On the relationship between gender and savings account ownership, the results in Table 2 show that being female decreases the probability of owning savings account by 0.207 compared to being a male. This revelation is not surprising. In fact, due to male dominating nature of African societies and the role of men in the households of Africa, the desire for men to own savings account far exceeds that of their female counterparts. This presupposes that when the market women are empowered to augment their earnings from their income generating ventures, they can set aside some proportion of income for savings purposes. This confirms a related finding by Afoakwah et al. (2015) Who found that empowerment of women provides assurance of financial security of the household and this will motivate women to save. The effect of age of the market trader has a statistically significant association with savings account ownership decision.

From the estimation, there is a positive relationship between the age of a market trader and savings account ownership status. However, the square of the age as shown in Table 2 is significant but negatively associated with savings account ownership status. This confirms the hypothesised non-linear relationship pointed out in conceptual studies that as individuals grow older, they are more likely to be poor because of inability to engage in economic activities (United Nations Development Programme, (2007). This situation has a strong likelihood of decreasing savings account owned by older market traders (Acheampong & Wiafe, 2013). On the

relationship between marital status and savings account ownership, the results from the analysis shown in Table 2 reveal that being a single decrease the probability of individual market trader's ownership of savings account by 0.012 compared to being a widow who has been used as the reference category. This finding sounds plausible in that, being a single put all economic pressure solely on one person, particularly if the individual is the breadwinner of the household. This situation can decrease the desire to open a savings account.

Table 2: Results of Probit Regression of Market Traders' Saving Account Ownership Status

Variable	Coefficient	t-Statistics	Marginal Effect	P-value
Gender (X_1)	-0.023	-2.13*	-0.207	0.063
Age (X_2)	0.240	1.43**	0.064	0.041
Age Squared ($X^2{}_2$)	-0.022	-2.11*	-0.005	0.054
Marital Status (X_3): *Widowed*	-	-	-	-
Single	-0.124	-1.54**	-0.012	0.044
Married	0.110	-1.12*	0.011	0.063
Divorced	-0.231	-3.62*	-0.134	0.091
Dependents (X_4)	-0.432	-3.42***	-0.131	0.001
Income generating ventures (X_5)	0.256	2.32*	0.023	0.073
Financial education (X_6)	0.124	3.30***	0.113	0.004
Years of market experience (X_7)	0.022	0.32	0.211	0.143
Constant	-2.134	-4.90***	-	0.002
Number of Observations (N)	(612)			
R^2 (pseudo)	(0.1124)			
Hosmer-Lemeshow Gof test (P-value)	(0.2113)			
Linktest-_hat Squared (P-value)	(0.553)			

Source: Field Survey data August, 2015
NB: ***: significant at 1% ($p < 0.01$); **: significant at 5% ($p < 0.05$); *: significant at 10% ($p < 0.10$)

Again, from the results in Table 2, being a married person increases the probability of owning savings account by 0.011 compared to being a widow. This revelation is possible in the sense that married couples can pool their income resources together and from this pool income, the desire to save for future consumption purpose is possible. This confirms pool income hypothesis which asserts that men and women continue to participate in the marital arrangement so long as their utilities within the arrangement exceed the utility level that they could get outside the arrangement (Chen & Dunn, 1996). Also, the results have found that being a divorcee decreases the probability of owning savings account by a market trader by 0.134 compared to being a widow all things being equal. The basis of every marriage is to support each other not only emotionally but more importantly economically. Thus, divorced individuals have the sole obligation of carrying all family responsibilities if the marriage is no more. This circumstance invariably inhibits the efforts of many divorcees in their efforts to save. Again, the probit analysis showed a negative relationship between a number of dependents and savings account ownership. The coefficient 0.432 and the marginal effect 0.131 for dependents obtained from the analysis suggest that an increase in the number of dependents reduces the probability that a market trader will own a savings account by 0.131, all things being equal. The negative coefficient suggests that an increase in the number of dependents by one person overburdens the market trader and this makes the individual disinclined to set aside income resources for saving purpose.

This finding confirms the assertion by Dupas and Robinson (2013) that a greater proportion of micro-entrepreneurs face major savings constraints due to social pressure to share limited resources. Moreover, at five percent significant level, the study reveals a positive relationship between a number of income-generating ventures owned by a market trader and savings account ownership. Thus, the probit results revealed that the probability of owning savings account increases by 0.023 with one additional increase in a number of income generating ventures owned by a market trader, all things being equal. This finding is strongly underpinned by the fact that the motivation to engage in multiple business ventures is to augment income mobilization prospects of the market trader. Thus, any additional income generated from multiple

engagements in business makes the market trader highly inclined to set aside some financial resources for savings purposes. This finding supports that of Ijaiya et al. (2009), That income source diversification through multiple income generating ventures offers an opportunity to enhance one's financial investment desire. Finally, the study's results show a positive and statistically significant relationship between financial education and savings account ownership. The results show that at one percent significance level, financial education increases the probability of owning savings account by 0.113. This means that if an individual market trader receives financial education from financial institutions, the likelihood of taking the decision to own savings account increases; all things being equal. This finding is plausible; it is often argued that financial education improves one's financial knowledge, which serves as a conduit for a thorough understanding of financial products.

Regression Diagnostics and Post Estimation Tests: It is always imperative to ensure that regression estimates are robust, unbiased and consistent. Therefore, the following post-estimation tests were carried out after the analysis of the data. This can impact positively on financial planning and financial decision. This finding is in agreement with Amu and Amu (2012) who found that low level of knowledge about savings among household heads has stifled the efforts of many households to own savings accounts. This finding again has implication for financial service providers, particularly the quest to reach out to a significant number of individuals and households with limited financial literacy. This implies that financial institutions via financial service awareness creation can mitigate the impact of asymmetric information, which impedes financial service information flow.

Test for Goodness-of-Fit: To ensure whether the probit model used fits the distribution and nature of the available data well, the Hosmer-Lemeshow's goodness-of-fit test was carried out. With this, the extent to which the predicted frequencies and observed frequencies closely match must be ascertained. Thus, the closer the predicted event rates match the observed event rates, the better the fit. With the null hypothesis stated as "the model is fit", the probability value ($P - Value$) which matches the computed Pearson chi-square statistics must not be significant. Thus, the $P - Value = 0.2113$ shown in Table 2, we fail to reject the null hypothesis and therefore, the model fits the data hence, reliable.

Model Specification Error Test: The probit regression model is built on the assumption that all relevant variables are included on the right-hand side of the equation, and that the model does not incorporate variables that should not be in it. The link test was conducted for the probit model used in this study. The test produces the associated P-values of the linear predicted value and the linear predicted value squared. In the case of testing for omitted variable, emphasis is placed on the linear predicted value squared (_hat Squared) and it is not supposed to be significant. As far as this study is concerned, the probit model passed the omitted variable test as presented in Table 2. Given the $P - Values$ of the square of explained sum of square (_hat Square) to be 0.553, we fail to reject the null hypothesis, thus, the model is correctly specified.

5. Conclusion and Recommendations

The study empirically sought to examine factors that determine savings account ownership status specifically among market traders from selected major market centres in Ghana. Probit regression analysis was used to examine data from the market traders. From the results and discussion thus far, gender (female dummy) is a significant determinant of savings account ownership but decreases the likelihood that individual market trader will own savings account. Specifically, a female market operator is less likely to own a savings account than a male counterpart. Categories of marital status such as single, married and divorced are significant but reduce the likelihood that a single, married and divorced market trader will own savings account compared to a widow. As hypothesized, a number of dependents have a significant influential role in predicting savings account ownership status, but the number of dependents reduces the probability of savings account ownership by a market trader. Thus, a market trader having dependents under his or her care will have less inclination to save. Also, on the relationship between savings account ownership and number of income generating vestures owned.

The results indicate a positive and significant relationship between savings account ownership and number of incomes generating ventures owned by a market trader. Thus, an increase in the number of income-

generating business ventures engaged in increases the probability of owning savings accounts among market traders. On the effect of financial education on savings account ownership, the study shows that financial education impact positively on savings account ownership decisions and thus, increases the probability that a market trader will own savings account. Based on the conclusions from this study, the following recommendations are offered. Firstly, banks and financial institutions should intensify financial education strategies to boost savings mobilizations. Secondly, there should be an empowerment of females in the market business via government's policy intervention directed towards informal sector enterprise development to the crowd in revenue to improve their savings. Thirdly, National Board for Small-Scale Businesses in Ghana should intensify education on how to sustain diverse income generation ventures to fetch income from multiple sources to inspire behavioral intentions to save.

References

Abdul Mumin, Y., Razak, A. & Domanban, P. B. (2013). Analysis of household heads' decision-to-save with financial institutions in Ghana. *Asian Economic and Financial Review,* 3(11), 1466-1478.

Abebe, G., Biruk, T. & Yukichi, M. (2018). Changing saving and investment behaviour: The impact of financial literacy training and reminders on micro-businesses. Journal of African Economies, 134-142.

Acheampong, I. K. & Wiafe, E. A. (2013). The link between poverty and social exclusion in Ghana: An Econometric Approach. *Journal of Arts and Social Sciences,* 1(2), 103-120.

Ackah, C. & Asiamah, P. J. (2014). Financial regulation in Ghana: Balancing inclusive growth with financial stability.

Addai, B., Adjei G. G. & Boadi, K. O. (2017). Savings habit among individuals in the informal sector: A case study of Agbegeyishie fishing community in Ghana. *International Journal of Economics and Finance,* 9 (10), 262-272.

Afoakwah, C., Annim, S. K. & Peprah, J. A. (2015). Household savings and women bargaining power in Ghana. *Journal of Global Economics,* 3(2), 1-7.

Amu, M. K. & Amu, E. K. (2012). Saving behaviour in rural Ghana: A study of rural households in the Ho Municipality of the Volta Region. *Online Journal of Social Sciences Research,* 1(2), 54-61.

Ando, A. & Modigliani, F. (1963). The life-cycle hypothesis of saving: Aggregate implications and test. *American Economic Review,* 88(4), 55-84.

Arent, S. (2012). Expectations and savings behaviour: An empirical analysis, (Ifo Working Paper No. 128). Leibniz Institute for Economic Research. Munich, Germany.

Basu, A., Blavy, R. & Yulek, M. (2004). Microfinance in Africa: Experience and lessons from selected African countries (IMF Working Paper No. 174). Washington, D. C: International Monetary Fund.

Chen, M. A. & Dunn, E. (1996). Household economic portfolios: Assessing the impact of microenterprise services (AIMS). Retrieved from https://waleolusi.files.wordpress.com.

Dupas, P. & Robinson, J. (2013). Saving constraints and micro-enterprise development: Evidence from a field experiment in Kenya. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics,* 5(1), 163-192.

Dziwornu, R. K. & Anagba, K. K. (2014). Understanding the factors that influence saving decision among small business owners in the Greater Accra Region of Ghana. *European Journal of Business and Management,* 6(32), 113-120.

Friedman, M. (1957). A theory of the consumption function. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Goldberg, J. (2014). Products and policies to promote saving in developing countries. IZA World of Labour.

Gravelle, H. & Rees, G. (2004). Microeconomics (3rd Ed.). England: Pearson Education.

Ijaiya, M. A., Ijaiya, G. T., Bello, R. A., Muftau, A. I. & Ijaiya, M. A. (2009). Income diversification and household Wellbeing Ilorin Metropolis, Nigeria. *International Journal of Management, Economics and Information Technology,* 1(1), 12-22.

Incoom, S. E. (2009). The monetary and financial system (2nd Ed.). Accra, Ghana: Chartered Institute of Bankers (Gh).

Karlan, D. & Zinman, J. (2018). Price and control elasticities of demand for savings. *Journal of Development Economics,* 130, 145-159.

Karlan, D., Ratan, A. L. & Zinman, J. (2014). Savings by and for the Poor: A research review and agenda. *Review of Income and Wealth,* 6(1), 36-78.

Keynes, J. M. (1936). The general theory of employment, interest and money. London: Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc.

Modigliani, F. (1986). Life cycle, individual thrift, and the wealth of nation. *American Economic,* 76(3), 297-313.

Musah, S. A., Bagah, D. A. & Wulifan, J. K. (2015). The contribution of small and medium scale enterprises to economic growth: A cross-sectional study of Zibilla in the Bawku West District of Northern Ghana. *European Journal of Business and Management,* 7, 40-56.

Olson, D. H. & DeFrain, J. (2000). Marriage and the Family: Diversity and Strength (3rd Ed.). London: Mayfield Publishing.

Osei-Assibey, E. (2013). Source of finance and small enterprise's productivity growth in Ghana. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 4(3), 372-386.

Owusu-Bempah, G., Bennet, E., Amoako, D. & Frimpong, K. R. (2013). The importance of the informal sector to savings and loan companies. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 4(2), 108-116.

Rehman, H., Faridi, M. Z. & Bashir, F. (2012). Household saving behaviour in Pakistan: A case of Multan District. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences,* 30(1), 17-29.

Schaner, S. (2016). The persistent power of behaviourial change: Long-run impacts of temporary savings subsidies for the poor (NBER Working Paper Series No. 22534). National Bureau of Economic Research. Cambridge, United Kingdom.

Tandoh, I. & Tando, V. (2015). Dynamics of saving culture in Ghana. *South American Journal of Management,* 1(2), 1-13.

Todaro, M. P. & Smith, S. C. (2009). Economic Development (10th Ed.). London: Perason.

United Nation Development Proramme. (2007). Human development indicators report Ghana; towards a more inclusive society. UNDP Ghana, Combert Impression.

Vosen, M. (2012). A fixed amount saving and the permanent income hypothesis (Ruhr Economic Papers No. 363). Dortmund, Germany: Ruhr-Universitat Buchum (RUB), Department of Economics.

World, Bank. (2008). Finance for all? Policies pitfalls in expanding access. A policy research report. Washington D.C: The World Bank.

Yee-Kwong, C. (1996). Banking services for young intellectuals. *International Journal of Banking Marketing,* 11(5), 33-40.

Zeller, M. (1999). The role of micro-finance for income and consumption smoothing. Paper presented at Inter-American Development Bank's Conference on social protection and poverty, Washington D.C, February 5th, 1999.